

OWEN M. PHELAN

The Carolingian renewal and Christian formation in ninth-century Bavaria¹

Themes of religion and intellectual reform have long lay at the heart of Carolingian studies.² A group of seven ninth-century Bavarian manuscripts provide an important opportunity to observe Carolingian reform on two levels. On a broad level, these manuscripts witness to the mechanisms by which leading figures of the Carolingian world implemented a program of religious renewal. Although the manuscripts have been studied individually as evidence of Christian mission in Bavaria, when viewed as a group they provide evidence of the Bavarian reception of a program designed at the Carolingian court. This reception of ideas demonstrates a sophistication of Carolingian communication that likely extended to other regions of the Carolingian world. Each manuscript contains a baptismal commentary, which consists of the text *Primo paganus*, and a discussion of the rites of baptism and their significance. Alcuin of York, an influential member of Charlemagne's circle of advisors and chief proponent of the Carolingian Renewal, distributed *Primo paganus*.

On a local level, these seven manuscripts testify to concrete Carolingian plans for Christian formation in Bavaria. The picture developed from these manuscripts shows a period of formation – a catechumenate – during which time clerics would instruct potential Christians in various aspects of Christian faith and morals. To conduct a catechumenate program, one would need a clear approach to the baptismal liturgy, explanations of the Christian faith, instructions on Christian living, and priests trained to communicate this information to the laity. Each of the Bavarian manuscripts contains doctrinal teachings, moral instructions, and material specifically on priestly formation, all of which are centered around commentaries on baptism. The doctrinal and moral texts provide the content for the initiation program of baptism and reveal what Carolingian leaders in Bavaria understood to be the basic information that every Christian needed to know. The material on priestly formation sheds light on whom and how church leaders intended to convey this information.

Baptism supplied an ideal opportunity for the theologians and Christian intellectuals driving the Carolingian Renewal to construct a program for the formation of Carolingian identity. Carolingian interests in conversion and reform coincided in the particular context of ninth-century Bavaria. Dur-

¹ I would like to thank Walter Pohl and the rest of the scholars and staff of the Institut für Mittelalterforschung, especially Helmut Reimitz and Maximilian Diesenberger. Their tremendous generosity, both personal and intellectual, immeasurably enriched my Fulbright year in Vienna, during which time most of the research for this article was conducted.

² See the helpful discussion and bibliography in Richard Sullivan, *The Carolingian age: reflections on its place in the history of the Middle Ages*, in: *Speculum* 64 (1989) 267–306. The essays and bibliography of *The New Cambridge Medieval History 2, c. 700-c. 900*, ed. Rosamond McKitterick (Cambridge 1995), also provide an important point of departure. Part III considers Church and Society, while Part IV is dedicated to Cultural and Intellectual Developments. For recent discussions of Christianization consult the text and bibliography of Ian N. Wood, *The Missionary Life: Saints and the Evangelization of Europe, 400–1050* (London 2001). On the importance of clerical reform to the Carolingian efforts in the ninth century consult the work of Susan A. Keefe, *Water and the Word: Baptism and the Education of the Clergy in the Carolingian Empire 1* (Notre Dame 2002). Keefe's work is in two volumes, the first volume is a monograph and the second is an edition of more than sixty commentaries on the rite of baptism from the ninth century. For more general discussion of early medieval Bavaria, see especially Herwig Wolfram, *Salzburg, Bayern, Österreich. Die Conversio Bagoariorum et Carantanorum und die Quellen ihrer Zeit* (MIÖG Erg. Bd. 31, Wien/München 1995).

ing the last quarter of the eighth century, the Carolingians were engaged in power struggles with pagan people such as the Avars and Christian rulers such as the Agilolfings. Baptism and the rites of Christian initiation helped shape Christian identities from the first centuries of Christianity. In early medieval Europe, they continued to play an important role in identity formation. Baptism appears in important discussions across Carolingian Europe. Letters, tractates, episcopal capitularies, conciliar material, and imperial capitularies all treat the theory and practice of baptism, underscoring its importance to Carolingian leaders.³ Baptism provided clerics with an opportunity to explain the Christian faith to catechumens, sponsors, and other Christians. The seven ninth-century Bavarian manuscripts are important not only because of the materials they contain, but because of where and when they were made. While it is not possible to know exactly how these manuscripts were used, their design and content, as well as the fact of their existence, tell us about the plans of those at the ecclesiastical centers that produced them.

PRIMO PAGANUS: A COMMENTARY ON THE RITE OF BAPTISM

Seven Bavarian manuscripts preserve the baptismal commentary *Primo paganus* in two forms, in letter form and incorporated into longer commentaries. *Primo paganus* is a description and brief commentary on each of the rites in the ceremony of baptism. The text of the commentary is largely a redaction of a letter written by the fifth century Roman, John the Deacon to a man named Senarius.⁴ At the end of the eighth century, Alcuin disseminated the text in two letters, once to a priest Oduinus and again in a longer letter to a community of monks in Septimania.⁵ *Primo paganus* is the most copied and cited commentary on baptism under the Carolingians.⁶ This text survives in numerous manuscripts recopied all across the Carolingian world. The dense cluster of Bavarian manuscripts preserving *Primo paganus* provides clues for understanding the significance of the text for the wider Carolingian Renewal.

Primo paganus treats more than just the act of baptizing itself. It presents as instructional moments the activities leading up to baptism, the event of baptism itself, and post baptismal activities. Explanations given to the rite's order of events highlight three themes for the process of becoming a Christian. First, the catechumen must renounce the devil and embrace the Christian God. The text begins by describing rituals that define the catechumen, including exorcism and reception of the

³ Baptism was an important issue for Charlemagne, treated in capitularies as far back at the *Capitulatio de partibus Saxoniae* (ed. Alfred Boretius, MGH LL 2, Hannover 1883) 68–70, and was mentioned often in subsequent decrees such as *Capitula tractanda cum comitibus episcopis et abbatibus* (ed. Alfred Boretius, MGH LL 2, Hannover 1883) 161f. Baptism was among the first issues raised at the Reform councils of 813, see *Concilium Arelatense* 3 (ed. Albert Werminghoff, MGH Concilia 2, 1, Hannover 1906) 250; *Concilium Remense* 6, ed. *ibid.* 254; *Concilium Moguntinense* 4, ed. *ibid.* 261; *Concilium Turonense* 18, ed. *ibid.* 288f.; *Karoli Magni capitula e canonibus excerpta*, ed. *ibid.* 294; *Concordia episcoporum* 2, ed. *ibid.* 297. The proper understanding and administration of baptism is also a frequent topic of consideration in the many episcopal capitularies from the ninth century. For example, it is treated in the celebrated First Diocesan Capitulary of Theodulf of Orléans, see canons 17, 22, and 36 in Theodulf of Orléans, *Capitula* 1 (ed. Peter Brommer, MGH Capitula episcoporum 1, Hannover 1984) 103–142.

⁴ John the Deacon, *Epistola ad Senarium*, PL 59, 399–408. There is a debate over whether or not Alcuin composed this text. In my dissertation I argue that he likely put *Primo paganus* into its final form, if he did not compose it altogether. The text is clearly drawn from John the Deacon's work, however, *Primo paganus* does not appear before the time of Alcuin, does not appear without Alcuin's name until more than a century after Alcuin's death, and Alcuin's contemporaries all received *Primo paganus* from Alcuin. For more information consult: *Epistola de Iohannis Diaconi ad Senarium*, in: André Wilmart, *Un florilège carolingien sur la symbolisme des ceremonies du baptême, avec un Appendice sur la letter de Jean Diacre*, in: *Analecta Reginensia. Extraits des manuscrits latins de la reine Christine conservés au Vatican*, ed. André Wilmart (Studi e testi 59, Città del Vaticano 1933) 170–179.

⁵ Alcuin of York, *Epistolae* 134, 137 (ed. Ernst Dümmler, MGH EE 4, Berlin 1895) 202f., 210–216. For more information see the larger bibliography for the letter to Oduinus and the letter to the monks in Septimania in *Clavis des auteurs latins du Moyen âge. Clavis Scriptorum Latinorum Medii Aevi. Auctores Galliae 735–987*, 2: Alcuinus (ed. Marie-Hélène Jullien/Françoise Perelman, CC CM, Turnhout 1999) 45, 134 and 45, 137. Consult especially Donald A. Bullough, *Alcuin: Achievement and Reputation* (Leiden/Boston 2004) 47–48.

⁶ Susan A. Keefe, *Water and the Word* 1, 80.

creed. Several anointings and scrutinies follow before he is admitted to baptism. Second, the moral responsibilities of Christianity are impressed upon the new Christian. After a baptism by triple immersion, the priest clothes the new Christian in white robes that symbolize his new pure moral state. Third, the new Christian participates fully in a Christian community in which he has both responsibilities and privileges. Primo paganus mentions two post-baptismal anointings, one by the baptizing priest and the other by the local bishop, to strengthen the new Christian for service to others. The rite of baptism then concludes with the reception of the Eucharist at Mass, emphasizing the new Christian's incorporation into the Body of Christ.

Four of the seven Bavarian manuscripts contain this text unaltered. Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek lat. 795 is the earliest manuscript from Bavaria containing a commentary on the rite of baptism. It belonged to Archbishop Arn of Salzburg, a close friend of Charlemagne and Alcuin in the region.⁷ Wien, ÖNB lat. 795 contains the text in the form of Alcuin's letter to the monks of Septimania. In two manuscripts from the monastery of St. Emmeram at Regensburg, München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek Clm 14727 and a contemporary copy, München, BSB Clm 14760, the text exists in the form of Alcuin's letter to Oduinus.⁸ That Bishop Baturicus (817–847) specifically commissioned München, BSB Clm 14727 testifies not only generally to the working relationship that existed between monasteries and bishops in ninth century Bavaria, but also specifically to the importance of the contents of this particular manuscript in episcopal activity.⁹ München, BSB Clm 14760 was also copied during the second quarter of the ninth century.¹⁰ Primo paganus in the letter to Oduinus is also found in München, BSB Clm 14410, a manuscript from the first third of the ninth century.¹¹ Although 14410 has not been tied to a particular person or ecclesiastical center in Bavaria, it can be located to somewhere in southern Germany or northern Italy at the beginning of the ninth century and so can be considered in this context. Important figures from northern Italy, along with texts and manuscripts, crossed freely into Germany and back throughout the late eighth and ninth centuries. For example, Paulinus, the patriarch of Aquileia, convened a meeting on the banks of the Danube in 796.¹²

The other three manuscripts contain longer commentaries on the rite of baptism that incorporate Primo paganus into longer baptismal commentaries, which include citations from other sources, especially Isidore of Seville. München, BSB Clm 6325 and a contemporary copy, Clm 6324, both from Freising, contain a text, titled *Ordo de catecizandis rudibus vel quid sint singula quae ceruntur in sacramento baptismatis*.¹³ Wien, ÖNB lat. 1370, written in the first or second quarter of the ninth cen-

⁷ Bernhard Bischoff, *Die südostdeutschen Schreibschulen und Bibliotheken 2: Die vorwiegend österreichischen Diözesen* (Wiesbaden 1980) 115–119. See also the facsimile edition Franz Unterkircher, *Alkuin-Briefe und andere Traktate: Codex Vindobonensis 795 der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek, Faksimilieausgabe* (Codices selecti 20, Graz 1969). For a full discussion of Wien, ÖNB lat. 795, its contents and context, consult: Maximilian Diesenberger/Herwig Wolfram, Arn und Alcuin – zwei Freunde und ihre Schriften, in: *Erzbischof Arn von Salzburg*, ed. Meta Niederkorn-Bruck/Anton Scharer (VIÖG 40, Wien 2004) 81–106.

⁸ Clm 14727 has been dated to the first third of the ninth century. Bernhard Bischoff, *Die südostdeutschen Schreibschulen und Bibliotheken in der Karolingerzeit 1: Die bayerischen Diözesen* (Wiesbaden 1974) 202–203, 253. Clm 14760 is mostly a copy of Clm 14727 from the second quarter of the ninth century. Bischoff, *Schreibschulen 1*, 210, 212f.

⁹ On fol. 130v is the inscription: “*Explicit liber Albini magistri iussit quem praesul Baturicus scribere dignum.*” Bischoff, *Schreibschulen 1*, 202f., 253. For more information on Bishop Baturicus and his role in manuscript production see Rosamond McKittrick, *The Frankish Church and the Carolingian Reforms, 789–895* (London 1977) 35–38.

¹⁰ Bischoff, *Schreibschulen 1*, 210.

¹¹ Joseph Michael Heer, *Ein karolingischer Missions-Katechismus* (Freiburg im Breisgau 1911). Bischoff, *Schreibschulen 1*, 241.

¹² *Conventus episcoporum ad ripas Danubii* (ed. Albert Werminghoff, MGH Concilia 2, 1, Hannover/Leipzig 1906) 172–176. For a more developed discussion of this phenomenon for a very specific type of text, see Uwe Ludwig, *Transalpine Beziehungen der Karolingerzeit im Spiegel der Memorialüberlieferung. Prosopographische und sozialgeschichtliche Studien unter besonderer Berücksichtigung des Liber vitae von San Salvatore in Brescia und des Evangeliars von Cividale* (MGH Studien und Texte 25, Hannover 1999).

¹³ Bischoff, *Schreibschulen 1*, 107. According to Bischoff, in Clm 6325 the first section of the commentary, the introduction, was written in a Freising hand from the period of Bishop Hitto (811/812–836), the substance of the commentary was added shortly after. There are three printed editions of this text. Susan A. Keefe, *Water and the Word: Baptism*

ture at Mondsee, preserves a text related to the Freising commentary.¹⁴ Although a bit longer than the text in the Freising manuscripts, the Mondsee text treats the same topics but chooses some different authorities in explaining the various liturgical actions. The same lexical errors occur in material common to both manuscripts, which strengthen the notion that the commentaries are connected.¹⁵ As in the Freising commentary, the text of Primo paganus is broken up and placed appropriately throughout the text. The Mondsee commentary is identified as *Ordo vel brevis explanatio de catichizandis rudibus*.¹⁶

In addition to generous citations from Primo paganus, the Freising and Mondsee commentaries share the same introduction, consisting of selections from Alcuin's letter to Charlemagne on the mission to the Avars.¹⁷ The themes and instruction of this letter are identical to those Alcuin expressed in a letter written around the same time to Arn, the owner of the earliest Bavarian manuscript containing Primo paganus.¹⁸ The introduction, using Alcuin's own words, explicitly talks about the ceremonies of baptism as an appropriate time for religious formation. Alcuin presents formation as a discrete series of stages, which the introduction emphasizes by beginning with Alcuin's citation and comments on Paul's exhortation to the Corinthians: "Let all your things be done decently and according to order" (1 Cor 4, 40). The passage then explains the significance of the "Great Commission" in Matthew (Mt 28, 19–20) that people are to be taught the faith first and then baptized afterwards. The introduction then cites another passage from this same letter of Alcuin, recommending Augustine's *De catechizandis rudibus* as a model for the catechumenate.

In the seven manuscripts from Bavaria containing commentaries on the rite of baptism, the point of departure is always Primo paganus, the text distributed by Alcuin, a leading figure of the Carolingian Renewal. The writings of Alcuin, especially this text, frame considerations of baptism at the major ecclesiastical centers in Bavaria. In several of the manuscripts the text remains in the form of a letter sent to individuals who did not live in Bavaria. In other manuscripts, the text has been carved up and digested in the context of other comments on baptism. The text was then placed in commentaries that begin with citations from another of Alcuin's letters dealing with conversion of the Avars. The manuscripts come from important ecclesiastical centers in the area: Salzburg, Regensburg, Freising and Mondsee. Primo Paganus came to the attention of some of the most important religious leaders of the time, Arn of Salzburg and Baturicus of Regensburg. Religious thinkers in key Bavarian ecclesiastical centers engaged the text and digested it, weaving it into larger commentaries on baptism. And these larger commentaries share common material and a common preface possibly indicating discussion or interaction between important ecclesiastical centers with regard to a common approach to Christian formation. In summary, directions concerning a multi-stage baptismal ceremony, which emanated from a Carolingian court luminary, were advanced and developed by local religious leaders in several manuscripts from early ninth century Bavaria.

and the Education of the Clergy in the Carolingian Empire 2 (Notre Dame 2002) 480–488. Andrew Ewbank Burn, *Neue Texte zur Geschichte des apostolischen Symbols*, in: *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte* 25 (1904) 148–154. This edition does not provide variants between the manuscripts. McKitterick, *Frankish Church* 213. This edition is only part of the text and consults Clm 6325 alone. Bischoff, *Schreibschulen* 2, 222. Clm 6324 is probably from the third or fourth quarter of the ninth century.

¹⁴ Bischoff, *Schreibschulen* 2, 24.

¹⁵ The errors range from shared misspellings (*Ysydorus* and *ex greco*) to grammatical errors (*animam* for *anima*).

¹⁶ Susan A. Keefe, *Water and the Word* 2, 467–479.

¹⁷ Alcuin, *Epistola* 110, ed. Dümmler 157–159. For more information on this letter and the others that Alcuin wrote about the Avars see especially, Wood, *The Missionary Life* 85–86. Richard Sullivan, *Carolingian missionary theories*, in: *Catholic Historical Review* 42 (1956) 273–295; Helmut Reimitz, *Grenzen und Grenzüberschreitungen im karolingischen Mitteleuropa*, in: *Grenze und Differenz im frühen Mittelalter*, ed. Walter Pohl/Helmut Reimitz (*Forschungen zur Geschichte des Mittelalters* 1, Wien 2000) 105–166, at 159.

¹⁸ Alcuin, *Epistola* 113, ed. Dümmler 163–166.

CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE

Doctrinal expositions packaged with the commentaries on the rite of baptism detail the content of theological formation called for by Primo paganus. The simple theological concepts of the various expositions provide catechetical material for the priest to teach catechumens before the baptismal ceremonies and about which to question them during the scrutinies. The range of materials reflects the range of ways in which clerics could communicate doctrinal information, as well as the different audiences that needed to receive the information. The material consists of treatises and letters, sermons, biblical commentary, and saints' lives. Neither the manuscripts nor the texts were for distribution to the laity. All of the material is organized for priests or religious who would be preparing others for the sacrament of baptism.

The manuscripts from St. Emmeram contain doctrinal material in the form of a treatise and several letters by Alcuin of York. Alcuin's Questions and responses on Genesis, the first work in the manuscripts, is an excellent catechetical tool for a priest preparing converts for baptism.¹⁹ Four letters of Alcuin follow the commentary on Genesis.²⁰ These letters, to Daphnis, Gallicellulus, Oduinus, and Fridugisus form a collection that travels together in manuscripts from other parts of the Empire as well. The wide distribution of this letter collection hints at the infrastructure of Carolingian communication beyond Bavaria and at the ubiquity of Carolingian efforts at Christian formation. Manuscripts with the same sequence of Alcuin's letter prefaced with the commentary on Genesis survive from the regions of Corbie and Essen.²¹ The collection covers several important catechetical themes, and including the letter to Oduinus – Alcuin's Primo paganus – its catechetical potential stands out.

The Questions and responses, composed in question and answer form, poses simple questions eliciting responses about the Genesis narrative, how it connects to the New Testament, and how it illumines the Christian Faith. In both copies, Alcuin's prefatory letter to the priest Singuulfus is omitted. The work begins with questions about the activity of God and his plan for man, especially as it relates to sin. Man's sinfulness and how to deal with the reality of sin are important topics for people coming to baptism and the Christian faith. These concepts form the basis for a discussion about eternal reward and punishment that Alcuin picks up on in his letters.²² The discussion of good works as a prerequisite for heaven underscores the pursuit of virtue commonly encountered in Carolingian writings.²³

¹⁹ Alcuin of York, *Interrogationes et responsiones in Genesim*, PL 100, 515–566. See also, Michael Fox, Alcuin the exegete: the evidence of the *Questiones in Genesim*, in: *The Study of the Bible in the Carolingian Era*, ed. Celia Chazelle/Burton Van Name Edwards (*Medieval Church Studies* 3, Turnhout 2003) 39–60; Michael Gorman, Alcuin before Migne, in: *Revue Bénédictine* 112 (2002) 101–130; John William Houghton, (Re)sounding brass: Alcuin's new castings in the *Questiones and Answers on Genesis*, in: *Proceedings of the Patristic, Medieval and Renaissance Studies Conference 16/17*, ed. Joseph C. Schnaubelt/Frederick van Fleteren/Joseph Reino (Villanova 1994) 149–162; Katherine O'Brien O'Keefe, The use of Bede's writings on Genesis in Alcuin's Question and Answer texts, in: *Sacris Erudiri* 23 (1978) 463–483; Ann E. Matter, Alcuin's Question and Answer texts, in: *Rivista di storia della filosofia* 4 (1990) 645–483.

²⁰ Wien, ÖNB lat. 795 contains a similar sequence of letters including the letters to Daphnis, Gallicellulus, and Fredugisus. But instead of the letter to Oduinus, containing Primo paganus, Wien, ÖNB lat. 795 includes the longer letter to Leidrad.

²¹ Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale lat. 13371, identified by David Ganz, Corbie in the Carolingian Renaissance (*Beihefte der Francia* 20, Sigmaringen 1990) 45f., 137f., and Plate 8, as a Corbie manuscript. Also see Düsseldorf, Landes- und Universitätsbibliothek Sammelhandschrift B. 3, from a monastery in the region of Corbie, described in Steven A. Stofferahn, Changing views of Carolingian women's literary culture: The evidence from Essen, in: *Early Medieval Europe* 8 (1999) 69–97. The letters are Alcuin, *Epistolae* 133, 81, 134, 135, ed. Dümmler 200f., 123f., 202f., 203f. See also, Michael Gorman, The Commentary on Genesis of Claudius of Turin and biblical studies under Louis the Pious, in: *Speculum* 72 (1997) 279–329.

²² Alcuin, *Epistolae* 110, 111, 113, ed. Dümmler 157–159, 159–162, 163–166.

²³ For further information see Henry Mayr-Harting, Charlemagne's religion, in: *Am Vorabend der Kaiserkrönung. Das Epos „Karolus Magnus et Leo papa“ und der Papstbesuch in Paderborn 799*, ed. Peter Godman/Jörg Jarnut/Peter Johaneck (Berlin 2002) 113–124; Franz Sedlmeier, *Die laienparänetischen Schriften der Karolingerzeit. Untersuchungen zu ausgewählten Texten des Paulinus von Aquileia, Alkuins, Jonas' von Orleans, Dhuodas und Hinkmars von Reims* (Neuried 2000); Hans Hubert Anton, *Fürstenspiegel und Herrscherethos in der Karolingerzeit* (Bonn 1968).

The letter to Daphnis treats rudimentary number symbolism, answering questions about numbers mentioned in the canticle of Solomon. The letter begins with a discussion of numbers and how they ought to be interpreted generally, whether they are even or odd and how they can be divided. It then discusses the meaning of the numbers and what numbers can signify, especially about God or Christ. Some of the connections that the letter makes take on an added significance in the context of baptism. For example, it shows how the symbolism of the numbers six and seven connects Adam's creation from the virgin earth and Christ's from the Virgin Mary, Christ who is the "reparer of first perfection."²⁴ Then, in explaining the difference between queens and concubines (cf. Cant 6, 8) the letter acknowledges that both can deliver true sons of the church through "preaching or baptizing," but without the right desire the preachers will receive no heavenly reward.²⁵

The second letter in the collection, addressed to Gallicellulus, reads like a pocket catechism, a tool especially helpful for clerics explaining basic Christian teachings. It is organized as a doctrinal countdown from ten to one. The letter begins with the Ten Commandments and continues through the nine choirs of angels and the eight beatitudes, etc. Items important in catechetical formation resonate throughout the list. The letter works typologically, connecting biblical events to the contemporary concerns of Christian theology, especially to moral issues. As an example of the number eight, Alcuin writes that Christ's circumcision on the eighth day indicates the destruction of the eight principal vices.²⁶ Later, the letter explains how the Holy Spirit writes the two precepts of charity on the hearts of the believers.²⁷

That Alcuin's countdown culminates in a consideration of baptism strongly suggests that this letter had a practical value in terms of catechesis. At the end of the letter, when explicating the importance of the number two, the text describes the two parts of knowledge, the first is to leave behind the devil and the second is to love God. This echoes the two promises or vows made at baptism, the renunciation of Satan and the confession of faith in God. Finally, there are two examples of the number one. First, Alcuin compares Noah's ark to the church, both of which save the faithful from destruction.²⁸ The water imagery conveyed by the story of Noah is often connected to baptism. In fact, Alcuin makes this connection in his Questions and responses on Genesis, which the reader presumably would have already encountered in reading this manuscript.²⁹ Second, the final example offered by Alcuin highlights baptism. The final line of the letter compares the one crossing of the Israelites through the Red Sea to the Promised Land, with the one baptism through which the faithful cross to eternal life.³⁰

The third letter, the one addressed to Oduinus, consists wholly of the text *Primo paganus*, which was treated above. The final letter of the group briefly considers the three types of sight: corporal, spiritual, and intellectual.³¹ This kind of consideration is here used to help a reader understand Scripture more deeply, but Carolingian thinkers sometimes associate it with baptismal literature in order to suggest to catechumens how to think about their lives and goals differently than they had before, especially to consider the spiritual and eternal ramifications of their decisions. Alcuin recom-

²⁴ Alcuin, Epistola 133, ed. Dümmler 200f.: *reparator primae perfectionis*.

²⁵ Alcuin, Epistola 133, ed. Dümmler 201.

²⁶ Alcuin, Epistola 81, ed. Dümmler 123: *Octavo die circumcisus est Christus, per cuius circumcisionem octo vitia principalia destruuntur*.

²⁷ Alcuin, Epistola 81, ed. Dümmler, 124: *Duo sunt praecepta caritatis, quae digito Dei, id est Spiritu sancto, in cordibus scribuntur credendum*.

²⁸ Alcuin, Epistola 81, ed. Dümmler, 124: *Una fuit arca, in qua mundo pereunte fideles sunt salvati. Una est sancta Dei ecclesia, qua pereuntibus peccatoribus salvantur fideles*.

²⁹ Alcuin, Quaestiones, PL 100, 531B: *Columba Spiritus sancti, expulso alite teterrimo, ad Noe post diluuium, quasi ad Christum post baptismum devolat, et ramos refectionis ac luminis portans, pacem orbi annuntiat*.

³⁰ Alcuin, Epistola 81, ed. Dümmler 124: *Unus fuit transitus Israhelitici populi per mare rubrum, ut promissam accepissent terram. Unum est baptisma, per quod transeundum est ad vitam aeternam*.

³¹ Alcuin, Epistola 135, ed. Dümmler 204.

mended having knowledge of eternal reward and eternal damnation as an important early step for new Christians.³²

The letters and treatise of the St. Emmeram manuscripts gather together in Alcuin's own words all the material needed to implement an Alcuinian formation program. The manuscripts contain teachings on the Christian faith presented in a simple form, organized either in a question and answer format or by number. The collection contains an instruction and explanation for the rite of baptism itself. Finally, it contains material explaining how to understand the world in terms that establish a Christian perspective for moral decision-making. This collection of material establishes a firm foundation for catechumens or other Christians present at catechumen instruction by familiarizing them with basic Christian principles and concepts, which they ought to know before they are baptized and on which they will need to draw in order to live Christian lives after their baptism.

After the treatise and letter collections, sermon material comprises much of the catechetical material in these manuscripts. München, BSB Clm 14410 contains a cycle of six example sermons complete with annotations, which seem perfectly designed for the examination of catechumens. Instructions internal to the sermons address the priest and encourage him to engage his audience over points of Christian teaching. Each of the sermons simply and concisely presents basic principles of the Christian faith, directing the reader to pause and assess the hearers' commitment to those principles. These procedural asides also indicate that the sermons were not recorded as given, but rather are examples designed to provide instruction to priests conducting a catechumenate-type program. The first sermon is titled "*Incipit ratio de cathecizandis rudibus.*" It begins by describing how the priest ought to establish first, that the catechumens are present of their own free will and second, that they seek to become Christians not for an earthly reward, but on account of the love of God. It then instructs the priest to remind the catechumens that this path will lead them to eternal joy with a heavenly reward. The second sermon, called "Concerning the Ten Precepts of the Law," explains to the catechumens that true Christians will behave rightly. The sermon then recounts the Ten Commandments before considering the Golden Rule. The third sermon treats idolatry, making it clear that idolatry is unacceptable for Christians, emphasizing that eternal punishment awaits those failing to preserve faith in God. The fourth and fifth sermons deal with the right worship of God and its connection to the avoidance of eternal damnation and attainment of eternal reward. The final sermon is titled "Concerning God." This last section emphasizes what catechumens must know about God: that he is eternal, omnipotent, the creator, and unique.

Biblical commentaries, such as those found in the Salzburg manuscript, show another way in which doctrinal material was made available to clerics. The commentary material treats several passages suitable for meditation on conversion. There is a revealing selection from John the Deacon's commentaries on the letters of Saint Paul. Recall that material from John the Deacon provides the primary content for Primo paganus. The selection copied here records John's reflections on the Pauline notion of baptism, beginning "Baptism is received in Scripture in three ways..."³³ The manuscript also contains commentaries of contemporary thinkers such as Alcuin of York. A selection from Alcuin's commentary on the Letter to the Hebrews explains how we are buried with Christ in baptism and what it means to say that a baptized person is "renewed."³⁴

³² Thomas F.X. Noble, *The Vocabulary of Vision and Worship in the Early Carolingian Period*, in: *Seeing the Invisible in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages. Papers from "Verbal and Pictorial Imaging: Representing and Accessing Experience of the Invisible, 400–1000"* (Utrecht, 11–13 December 2003), ed. Giselle de Nie/Karl F. Morrison/Marco Mostert (Turnhout 2005) 213–237, outlines the larger interest of Carolingians in vision.

³³ Wien, ÖNB lat. 795, fol. 102r–103r. John the Deacon, *Commentarius in epistolam Pauli ad Romanos*, PL 30, 627–673. See also *Clavis patrum Latinorum, qua in Corpus christianorum edendum optimas quasque scriptorum recensiones a Tertulliano ad Bedam commode recludit Eligius Dekkers opera usus qua rem praeparavit et iuvit Aemilius Gaar* (ed. Eligius J. Dekkers/Aemilius Gaar, CC SL, Turnhout 1995) 952.

³⁴ Wien, ÖNB 795, 150r–150v. Alcuin, *Expositio in epistolam Pauli apostoli ad Hebraeos*, PL 100, 1085–1086. See also *Clavis des auteurs latins du Moyen âge*, ed. Jullien/Perelman 14. Cf. Gorman, *Alcuin before Migne* 127, suggests that this work is spurious because it is attributed to Alcuin only in Wien, ÖNB lat. 795. But it seems likely that the text should be considered genuine because it is attributed to Alcuin in this manuscript. Wien, ÖNB lat. 795 was put together under Alcuin's friend Arn, archbishop of Salzburg.

Finally, the manuscripts preserve saints' lives, which could be used to explain the sacrament of baptism to catechumens. Wien, ÖNB lat. 1370 from Mondsee recounts the story of the Seven Sleepers of Ephesus. The story recounts how seven individuals from the early church were accused of disobeying the emperor because they were Christians. To escape death they entered a cave outside the city and prayed. Sealed inside the cave by the emperor they fell asleep. They woke up many years later and exited the cave, the earlier threat having long since passed, the emperor having died, and Christianity having become the religion of the empire. This story could easily be used to convey important symbolic elements of baptism, particularly, dying, burial and rising. There is a going down and a coming up which leads from danger to safety, just as with the immersions of the baptismal rites.

All the manuscripts present simple and foundational Christian doctrinal information through a variety of genres on which clerics could draw in preparing catechumens for baptism. These manuscripts were not designed for a lay audience, but rather provide material for clerics to present to the laity during preparations for baptism. Throughout the doctrinal evidence certain themes dominate: the transcendence of God, the problem of sin, and reward or punishment for behavior. The manuscripts preserve the basic doctrinal knowledge that Bavarian ecclesiastical leaders wanted catechumens to know and present this knowledge in a range of ways through which clerics could deliver that knowledge to the laity.

MORALITY AND LITURGY

While Christian theology regarded baptism as the formal entry into Christianity, the Carolingians believed that entry into Christianity would be useless if Christians did not persevere in their faith. Accordingly, the manuscripts contain texts providing information on two important elements of living a Christian life: Christian morality and Christian liturgy. The concerns Bavarian ecclesiastical leaders expressed for right belief are mirrored by their concerns for right behavior. Like the material considering the Christian faith, the material covering morality and liturgy provided clerics with examples of what and how to communicate concerning ritual observance and morality to a lay audience. The material builds on doctrinal teachings by describing the concrete implications of Christian belief. After learning about God, sin, and eternal reward or punishment, the manuscripts provide information on how to be sure of one's eternal reward.

In Clm 14410 four sermons on virtue and vice frame the six sermons on faith and seem perfectly designed for presentation to catechumens being prepared for baptism. Of course, these sermons would also speak to already Christian members of the community by recalling their own obligations as Christians. The first sermon considers the eight principal vices, what each one means, and how they relate to each other. The second sermon begins with an explanation of the name "Christian," what the name means, and the moral responsibilities that the name entails. Both sermons treat issues important for catechumens coming to the faith, emphasizing Christian concepts of good and evil. The second sermon especially focuses on the sacrament of baptism as the point of departure for a new moral life.³⁵

The third and fourth sermons on virtue and vice follow the six sermons on the faith. A sermon attributed to Serapion, bishop of Antioch (190–211), titled Concerning the Eight Vices comes first. The final sermon is entitled Concerning Peace and Concord. The third sermon, composed mostly of extracts from Cassian's *Collationes*, warns the audience about the vices that they ought to avoid now that they have been renewed through baptism. The fourth sermon enumerates the virtues that will

³⁵ München, BSB Clm 14410, fol. 84v: *Libet fratres karissimi cum timore divino considerare nomen christianum quem tenemus... ideo maxime nobis oportet ut quod Christo promissimus omni studio ac devotione reddeamus et sicut diabolo renuntiamus non iterum concupiscentiis carnis in lecti ut canis revertamur ad vomitum.* Printed in Albert Michael Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge der Karolingerzeit: Ihr Recht und ihre Praxis* (München 1918) 68.

ensure that the listeners receive a heavenly reward. Wien, ÖNB lat. 1370 contains a similar treatment of the eight principle vices.³⁶

In addition to texts on Christian morality, some of the manuscripts include commentaries on Christian liturgical practices other than baptism. The Freising manuscripts as well as the Mondsee manuscript contain related expositions of the Mass. Primo paganus mentions that the priest should celebrate the Eucharist as one of the concluding events of the baptismal ceremonies, symbolizing the new Christians' full participation in the Christian community. New Christians ought to possess a basic understanding of the significance of the Mass as practicing members of their new faith. These treatises provide a basic understanding of how the Mass works, something essential for appreciating the significance of the liturgy. A clear explanation of the Mass and its significance also encourages Christians to continue their observances on Sundays and feast days.

In the Freising and Mondsee manuscripts the Mass is studied in simple question and answer form. The text preserved in the Freising manuscripts begins "Seven prayers are contained in the whole order of the mass. What are these?"³⁷ The seventh prayer is identified as the Our Father, the seven petitions of which are then identified. The Mondsee manuscript contains a slightly longer version of the same text.³⁸ The text itself is lifted, with some alterations, from Alcuin's *De disputatio puerorum*, which itself is an elaboration of Isidore of Seville's explanation of the Mass in his *De ecclesiasticis officiis*.³⁹ In addition to minor variations, the Alcuinian text adds significantly to Isidore's discussion of the Our Father. Whereas Isidore mentions only that Jesus taught the prayer to his disciples and speculates as to why it was taught to them, the text in the *Disputatio* identifies the seven parts of the prayer. This augmentation changes the nature of the text from expository to pedagogical, further highlighting its catechetical significance.

The moral and liturgical instruction provided in these manuscripts shows two things. First, it shows a concerted effort through the administration of baptism to provide for new Christians, and older Christians who may be present at these ceremonies, the tools they needed to participate in the Christian cult and to live as Christians. Texts building on the foundation of faith explain how to live a Christian life through moral action and through participation in Christian cult. Second, these instructions suggest some degree of coordination in terms of the message devised by Bavarian religious leaders for the territories under their care. The repetition of themes and even identical texts in manuscripts produced at several different scriptoria show a unity of purpose across the important ecclesiastical centers of Bavaria.

PRIESTLY REFORM

A successful catechumenate program requires well-trained priests. These manuscripts target priests for training as communicators of the Carolingian religious reform. While the manuscripts contain material designed for a catechumenate program, they also contain materials directed more generally to clerical reform. These texts on clerical training reveal that the manuscripts were intended first to train effective clergy and then to enable that clergy to conduct a catechetical program of Christian formation. Numerous capitularies from the early ninth century emphasize that priests needed to be prepared to fulfill their responsibilities of preaching and performing the sacraments, especially baptism. The texts on church organization, the priestly examinations, the homiletic material, and the other educational writings further testify to the reception by Bavarian ecclesiastical leaders of directives from the Carolingian court and the willingness of these ecclesiastical leaders to prepare materials to support the implementation of those directives.

³⁶ Wien, ÖNB lat. 1370, fol. 89r–90v.

³⁷ München, BSB Clm 6324, fol. 98r; Clm 6325, fol. 133v.

³⁸ Roy Hammerling, *The Pater noster in its patristic and medieval context: the baptismal-catechetical interpretation of the Lord's prayer*, in: *Proceedings of the Patristic, Medieval and Renaissance Studies Conference 18*, ed. Karl A. Gersbach/Frederick van Fleteren/Joseph C. Schnaubelt (Villanova 1996) 1–24.

³⁹ Alcuin, *De disputatio puerorum*, PL 101, 1135–1136. Isidore of Seville, *De ecclesiasticis officiis* (ed. Christopher M. Lawson, CC SL 113, Turnhout 1989) 16–18. Again, refer to Gorman, *Alcuin before Migne*, for more discussion.

The Freising manuscripts contain complete copies of Isidore's *De ecclesiasticis officiis*. Isidore's text, related to some of the expository material above, is an exhaustive treatment of church life and practice in two books. The writings of Isidore's were much admired by the Carolingians as they tried to reform and organize their own ecclesiastical habits.

Several of the manuscripts contain clerical examinations, lists of texts and duties with which each cleric should be familiar. Clm 14727, one of the manuscripts from Regensburg, contains a brief clerical examination listing the things that priests ought to be sure to know and to understand.⁴⁰ It requires priests to know and understand the creeds and the canons. Importantly, the examination mentions baptism by name as something in which a priest should be competent. Clm 14727 also contains a copy of Theodulf of Orléans' First diocesan capitulary.⁴¹ The capitulary is one of the most widespread instructions dealing with priestly life from the first half of the ninth century. Clm 6325 from Freising contains selections from a capitulary issued at Aachen. As presented in this manuscript the selections form essentially a clerical checklist, noting all the things that a priest must know, including the creeds and important prayers. The list specifically mentions the exorcism over catechumens. Wien, ÖNB lat. 1070 from Mondsee contains large selections from a capitulary issued at Aachen in 816, a council convened by Louis the Pious to consider church reform.⁴² The selections from the Council of 816 run some thirty folios and contain instructions on clerical life and behavior drawn from the writings of Gregory, Prosper and Isidore.

Clm 14410 begins with the Epistle-Homily of Pseudo-Bede. The homilies are organized according to feast days of the liturgical year, providing priests with material for preaching on those days. While the homilies do not focus on the topic of baptism, they do figure into the more general emphasis on religious instruction often advocated by proponents of ecclesiastical reform. Carolingian ecclesiastical reform often highlighted the importance of preaching and numerous Carolingian capitularies recommend important feast days to be observed with special sermons.

The manuscripts also contain language and writing aides for training clergy to be successful missionaries and preachers. Wien, ÖNB lat. 795 includes alphabets in Latin, Greek, and Gothic as well as a copy of Alcuin's *De orthographia*.⁴³ While not immediately pertaining to celebration of baptism, the alphabets are suggestive evidence of the preparations underway at Salzburg for the mission to the Avars coordinated by Archbishop Arn of Salzburg.⁴⁴ Students who studied writing with Alcuin's *De orthographia* could hardly have forgotten the catechetical mission for which they were training. Theological vocabulary and religious examples dominate Alcuin's treatise. For example, in teaching the letter "b," Alcuin uses as his example the word "baptismus."⁴⁵ The name of the Avars, a primary reason for missionary activity in Bavaria, also appears in the manuscript as an example of the orthographic confusion between the letters "b" and "v".⁴⁶

The material contained in the Bavarian manuscripts, not immediately connected to baptism and Christian formation, provides for the training of clergy without whom there could be no catechuminate. Texts found in the manuscripts include guides on organizing clerical life and behavior, legislation regulating that behavior, and resources for clerical education. Those who assembled manuscripts were concerned not only that Christians be provided with adequate Christian formation, but also that the clergy administering the sacraments were properly educated, instructed and prepared to fulfill their duties.

⁴⁰ Clm 14727, fol. 139r: *sciatis vel intellegitis*.

⁴¹ Theodulf of Orléans, *Capitula* 1, ed. Brommer 103–142.

⁴² For a brief summary of the council and its proceedings see Wilfried Hartmann, *Die Synoden der Karolingerzeit im Frankenreich und in Italien* (Konziliengeschichte Reihe A, Paderborn/Wien/München/Zürich 1989) 156–160.

⁴³ Alcuin, *De orthographia*, PL 101, 901–920.

⁴⁴ This material can also be interpreted as appropriate for use in a border region of the empire, where learning Gothic might help Carolingians communicate with the local populace. A border perspective for the interpretation of these manuscripts receives support from other texts in this collection. For example, homiletic material in Clm 14410 has been interpreted as pastoral care for soldiers who may have fought along this border. See, Koeniger, *Militärseelsorge*.

⁴⁵ Wien, ÖNB lat. 795, fol. 7r.

⁴⁶ Wien, ÖNB lat. 795, fol. 6v. Maximilian Diesenberger drew this fact to my attention.

CONCLUSION

Seven ninth century manuscripts from Bavaria testify to a vigorous interest in baptism and the catechumenate. At a broad level, this interest witnesses to the mechanisms by which leading figures of the Carolingian world implemented a program of religious renewal. *Primo paganus*, a commentary on baptism distributed by the court theologian Alcuin of York, provides the backbone of Bavarian baptism. All the manuscripts contain a variety of texts through which Bavarian religious leaders fleshed out and expanded on the theological, moral, and ritual preparations envisioned by Alcuin for a substantial catechumenate program. *Primo paganus* describes baptism not as a single event, but as a longer process, creating a series of opportunities to provide Christian formation across a broad horizon of topics.

At a local level, these manuscripts provide a window into the sophisticated vision of a simple Christian formation developed at the leading ecclesiastical centers of Bavaria from the end of the eighth into the ninth century.⁴⁷ These manuscripts testify not only to Carolingian court's influence in Bavaria, but also to likely coordination and discussion between the leading ecclesiastical sees of the area. A catechumenate program presupposed the availability of trained clergy. The material on clerical reform in these manuscripts reminds us that the baptismal "renewal" of individuals in Bavaria occurred within the larger context of clerical renewal, which is itself a part of the refashioning of identities accomplished during the celebrated Carolingian Renewal. A trained clergy could conduct the ceremonies of baptism publicly over several weeks.⁴⁸ It is clear that the process of Christian identity formation included not just simple knowledge about the Christian faith, but also basic moral and ritual training for life after baptism. A clergy familiar with these seven manuscripts would be well-equipped to provide solid, basic Christian formation to Bavarian congregations.

⁴⁷ While this paper has looked only at manuscripts containing Latin commentaries on the rite of baptism, there is further evidence to support the general conclusions about catechumenate programs in Bavaria at the beginning of the ninth century. Two manuscripts, Kassel, Hessische Landesbibliothek und Murhardsche Bibliothek 4^o theol. 24, 146 and Clm 6244, contain a text titled *exhortatio ad plebem christianam* in both German and Latin. The text, composed in a clear and emphatic style, treats baptism, the Creed and the Lord's Prayer. See the additional comments and bibliography in Cyril Edwards, *German vernacular literature: a survey*, in: *Carolingian Culture: Emulation and Innovation*, ed. Rosamond McKitterick (Cambridge 1994) 141–170, at 146.

⁴⁸ The numerous treatments of baptism in conciliar and capitulary material make it clear that religious authorities wanted a baptismal program centered around Easter and Pentecost wherever possible. The programs of religious instruction in these manuscripts are suited to describe what the content of a program would look like. That said, always included were concessions to pastoral need suggesting that baptism was to be administered whenever necessary. For an example relevant to Bavaria, see *Conventus episcoporum ad ripas Danubii*, ed. Werminghoff 173.

