

Index

A

A kya Yongs ‘dzin dByangs can dga’
ba’i blo gros, 10, 12, 13n14, 14,
15n15, 264, 267, 268, 273, 274n14,
293, 295n6, 299n11, 311, 316, 323,
328n5, 329n6-7, 330n9-10, 348n31,
365n59

his *rNam dbye brgyad dang bya
byed las sogs kyi khyad par mdo
tsam brjod pa*, 295n6, 330n10

his *rTags kyi ‘jug pa’i dka’ gnas
bdag gzhan dang bya byed las sum
gyi khyad par zhib tu phye ba*. Ed-
ited and translated in AACT. *See
Agents and Actions in Classical Ti-
betan (AACT)*.

A lag sha Ngag dbang bstan dar, 10, 12-
14, 26n26, 265, 274n14, 285, 286,
292, 298, 299, 341, 341n25, 350,
350n34, 354n42, 357n45, 358, 358-
360n48, 361, 361n51

his proposed modifications to Thon
mi’s verse twelve, 13, 350, 350n34,
354n42, 357n45, 358, 358-360n48

on *b-* used for the future, 298, 299,
341, 341n25

on Thon mi’s verse not applying to
simple nouns (*ming rkyang*), 361,
361n51

Abelard, Peter, 27

ābhāsa (appearance), 235

abhāva (not a real entity, absence, non-
existent), 161, 162n53

Abhidharma, 84n2, 90n18, 119, 136,
137, 191, 239, 303, 304

Abhidharmakośa of Vasubandhu, 90n18,
122n52, 136n75, 220, 303

Abhidharmakośabhāṣya of Vasuban-
dhu, 240n8

Abhisamayālaṃkāra of Maitreya(nātha),
90n18, 142, 143, 156, 196, 196n36,
231n9, 307

Abhisamayālaṃkāravṛtti of Haribhadra,
143n5

abhyupagama (acceptance, position), 89

absolute case (*ngo bo tsam*), 8n6,
25n26, 267, 268, 285

active and passive voices in Tibetan, 8,
11, 14, 31, 32, 261ff., 275-277, 279,
284, 300, 302, 302n2, 310, 311n21,
312, 354n42. *See also byed pa’i las*,
bya ba’i las; self (*bdag*) and oth-
er (*gzhan*) in indigenous Tibetan
grammatical literature.

adarśanamātra (merely not seeing a
counterexample), 59n36, 94, 102,
103

advayañāna (non-dual gnosis), 188n19

*Agents and Actions in Classical Tibetan
(AACT)*, 7, 8, 9n8, 9n9, 11n11,
12n13, 24, 25, 27, 264, 268n8,
270n10, 273n13, 274n14, 280, 281,
287n8, 290, 293, 300n12, 302n2,
316n33, 323n44, 326n2, 327n3,
328n5, 329n6-7, 330n9, 333n16,
334n18-19, 335n20, 341n25,

- 348n31, 353n40, 355n44, 361n51, 365n59
- agent-prominence, patient-prominence, 265, 293, 335n20, 341n25
- Alchourrón, Carlos, Peter Gärdenfors, David Makinson, 58n35
- āli-kāli* (vowels and consonants), 304
- altérité*, 3n1
- ambivalence of voice in the Tibetan past tense (*‘das pa*), 273ff., 276, 277, 300
- bKra shis dbang ‘dus on the ambivalence of the past tense, 274n14
- Si tu on the past as excluded from the categories self and other, 273n13
- antarvyāpti* (intrinsic pervasion), 47n20, 63, 63n43. *See* similar instances.
- antipassive, 267, 268
- anumāna* (inference, what infers), 39, 74, 151, 159n43, 162, 193
- anumānavirodha* (contradiction with an inference), 206, 208n5
- anumeya* (what is to be inferred), 162
- anvaya* (co-presence), 50n24
- anvayavyāpti* (positive pervasion; positive entailment), 50, 50n24, 51n24, 54, 98, 108, 150n22, 156n38
- anyayogavyavaccheda* (elimination of possession of something else), 55, 62n40
- Aphopaprakaraṇa* of Jñānaśrīmitra, 47n19, 48
- apohavāda* (the exclusion theory of semantics; the Buddhist theory of concepts), 76, 84, 101, 101n33, 248, 306
- Arcaṭa, 42, 42n10, 61
- Arnold, Dan, 245n16
- arthakriyāsāmarthyā* (ability to perform a function), 129, 187n16
- arthāntara* (a different matter), 146, 146n11
- Ary, Elijah, 232n13
- Āryadeva, 68, 69, 244n14
- asadartha* (fictions), 238
- asādhāraṇānaikāntikahetu* (reason that is uncertain because of being overly exclusive), 57
- Asaṅga, 184, 184n11, 186, 307
- asapakṣa* (dissimilar instance). *See vipakṣa*.
- āśrayāsiddha* (non-established locus), 99ff., 114, 156ff., 157n38
- āśrayāsiddhahetu* (a reason whose locus is not established), 143
- Aṣṭādhyāyī* of Pāṇini, 292n3
- atiprasaṅga* (absurdity), 121
- Atiśa, 48n20, 148n16, 193
- ātmanepada* (middle voice) and *parasmaipada* (active voice), 302, 302n2
- auxiliaries, 12, 270-271n10, 271, 273, 274, 276, 294, 296-299, 299n11, 300, 331n11, 344, 345, 345-346n28, 347
- Si tu on verbs with auxiliaries (*tshig grogs*) being excluded from the categories of self and other, 270, 271, 270-271n10, 346-347n29
- Avalokitavratā, 20, 73, 212, 212n9, 213, 213-214n13, 220-222
- ayogavyavaccheda* (elimination of non-possession), 55, 62n40

B

- Bacot, Jacques, 9n8, 9-10n9, 12n11, 13, 314, 350n34, 351n36
- bai ma fei ma ke* 白馬非馬可 (One can say that *white horse* is not a horse), 136
- Baker, Lynne Rudder, 245n15
- Batchelor, Stephen, 223n1
- bCom ldan rigs pa'i ral gri, 45
- bdag*. See Self (*ātman*), self (*bdag*) and other (*gzhan*) in indigenous Tibetan grammatical literature, self (personal identity).
- bdag don phal ba* (a secondary sense of "self"), 333n15, 355-357n44
- bdag med* (selflessness, =*anātman*), 147
- bde ba chen po* (great bliss), 180, 184
- bde stong zung 'jug* (union of bliss and emptiness), 188. See also *yuganaddha*.
- bden grub* (truly established), 3, 152n26
- bden par* (truly, really), 71, 142n4, 148n16, 150n21, 152n26. See *satyatas*.
- bden pas stong pa* (empty of reality), 183. See also *sūnyatā*.
- Bellos, David, 126n59
- bem po*. See *jaḍa*.
- bem(s) po'i stong pa nyid*.
See *jaḍasūnyatā* s.v. *sūnyatā*.
- Bhāsarvajña, 48
- Bhattacharya, Kamaleśwar, 63n43
- bhāva* (entity), 80, 203, 209
its use in Indian grammatical literature to mean "verbal action *per se*," 303, 311, 312
- Bhāviveka, 5, 17, 18, 20, 21, 43n11, 71, 96, 99, 148n16, 185, 187, 187n17, 193, 203ff., 205n2, 208, 209, 209n6, 210-213, 214n13, 215, 217, 218, 220-222, 232n13, 233n14, 254n30
- Bhavya. See Bhāviveka.
- Bhavyarāja, 130
- bheda* (difference), 78
- Bhikkhu Bodhi, 225
- Billeter, Jean François, 3n1
- bKa' brgyud (pa), 4, 4n3
- bKa' gdams pa, 43, 44
- bKra shis dbang 'dus, 273n14
- Blo bzang dpal ldan, 92n23
- blo 'khrul ba'i ngor yod pa* (exists for mistaken minds, exists in the perspective of mistaken minds), 6, 229, 238, 252. See also Candrakīrti, Jonang pa, *saṃvṛtisatyā*.
- Blo mthun bSam gtan, 24, 53n27, 110n39, 290
- blo ngor gnas pa'i mthun phyogs*. See similar instances.
- Blo rigs*, 80n71, 84n2, 235, 303
- blo rigs bdun du dbye ba* (the sevenfold classification of cognition), 84n2, 84n4
- bod gangs can pa* (snowy Tibetans), 129
- Bod kyi yi ge'i spyi rnam blo gsal 'jug ngogs* of dMu dge bsam gtan, 315n31
- Bod rgya tshig mdzod chen mo* of Zhang Yisun *et al.*, 22, 23n23, 24, 53n27, 192n24, 280n2, 290, 325n1, 331n12, 334n17, 340n24, 349n32, 350n34, 359n48, 361n51
- Bodhicaryāvatāra* of Śāntideva, 193, 233n14, 254n30

- Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā* of Prajñā-karamati, 150n21, 247n19
- Bodhimārgapradīpapañjikā* of Atiśa, 148n16
- Böhtlingk, Otto, 292n3
- borderline cases of passivization, 275
- Bra ti dge bshes Rin chen don grub, 10, 15n15, 325n1, 327n3
- Bradley, F.H., 238
- '*brél ba*. See *sambandha*.
- brdzun pa* (deceptive), 152, 152n26. See *mṛṣā*.
- bsDus grwa*. See Collected Topics.
- bsDus grwa brjed tho* of dGe bshes Ngag dbang nyi ma, 87, 120n49
- bsDus pa rigs sgrub* of 'U yug pa Rigs pa'i seng ge, 85n7
- bSe bsdus grwa* of bSe Ngag dbang bkra shis, 87, 109
- bSe Ngag dbang bkra shis, 86
- bsgrub bya*, 22, 271n10. See also *sād-hya*.
- bsgrub bya'i chos*. See *sādhya*dharma.
- bShad sgrub rgya mtsho, 271n10
- bShes gnyen chen po Śākya mchog ldan pa la gdams pa* of Se ra rje btsun Chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 179
- bskul tshig* (imperative), 271, 329, 330n9, 365, 365n59
- bTsan po bsdus grwa* of gSer khang pa Dam chos rnam rgyal, 87
- Bu ston Rin chen grub, 193n9, 358n46
- Buddha-nature, 4, 238.
See *tathāgatagarbha*.
- Buddhapālita, 18, 20, 203ff., 206-211, 211n8, 212, 214-221, 221n21, 222
- Buddhist epistemology, 38ff., 38n4, *passim*. See *Pramāṇa*, Tshad ma.
- Bussmann, Hadumod, 291n1, 300n12
- bya ba* (action, thing-done), 11n11, 280, 319, 326, 327n3, 329, 331, 352n38, 353n40. See also *kriyā*.
- bya ba sngon du song ba'i 'bras bu grub pa'i bya byed tha mi dad pa* (undifferentiated verb where the result of a previous action is established), 22, 23
- bya ba'i dngos po* (the entity that is the thing-done), 322, 328
- bya ba'i gzhi la yod pa'i las* (act pertaining to the basis of the action, i.e., to the patient/object), 273, 273n12, 321, 322, 341, 362n51
- bya ba'i las* (act-qua-thing-done), 11, 14, 264, 273, 273n12, 274n14, 293-295, 311n21, 326, 328, 329, 329n6, 329n7, 330n9, 335n20, 337, 347, 352, 364n58
- bya ba'i las byas zin 'das pa* (past accomplished act-qua-thing-done), 336
- bya ba'i las ma 'ongs pa* (future act-qua-thing-done), 293-295, 295n6, 330
- bya ba'i yul* (focus of the action, place of the action), 323, 325, 326
- bya ba'i yul la yod pa'i las* (act belonging to the focus of the action), 264, 273n12, 327, 329, 359n48
- bya byed las gsum* (the triad actions, agents, and objects, = *kriyā*, *kartr*, *karman*), 285, 292n4, 293, 325ff., 353
- Bya byed las gsum dus gsum dang bcas pa'i dper brjod che long bsdus pa* of gSer tog Blo bzang tshul khriims rgya mtsho, 292n4

- bya byed las gsum gyi dus gsum* (the three times in terms of actions, agents, and objects). *See* three times.
- bya gzhi* (the basis of the action), 319
- bya rgyu 'i las* (the act that is to be done), 286n5, 327
- bya tshig rang dbang can* (autonomous/voluntary verb), 24, 25
- bya tshig gzhan dbang can* (dependent/involuntary verb), 24, 25
- byed 'brel las tshig = byed pa po gzhan dang dngos su 'brel ba'i las tshig* (verbs that are connected with a distinct agent; transitive verbs), 11, 21, 24, 280n2, 282, 290. *See also* *tha dad pa*, transitive-intransitive contrast in Tibetan.
- byed bzhin pa'i las* (the act that one is doing), 286n5, 327
- byed las dang 'brel ba'i ngag gi sbyor ba* (uses of sentences that involve actions/act-qua-doing), 334, 334-335n19
- byed med las tshig = byed pa po gzhan dang dngos su ma 'brel ba'i las tshig* (verbs that do not have a distinct agent; intransitive verbs), 11, 24, 272n11, 280n2, 282, 339, 340n24, 363n57
- byed pa* (doing), 327n3, 339, 342-345, 345n28, 353, 360, 363, 364
(instrument), 11, 315, 319, 320n40, 322, 326, 326n2
- byed pa'i las* (act-qua-doing), 11, 14, 264, 273, 293, 295n6, 311n21, 326, 328, 330n9, 335n20, 347, 357, 365n59
- byed pa'i las da lta ba* (present act-qua-doing), 293
- byed pa po* (agent), 11, 12, 269, 272n11, 273n12, 274n14, 285, 293, 315, 318, 319, 321, 322, 325, 326, 328, 334, 346n29. *See* *kartr*.
- byed pa po gtso bo* (principal agent), 325, 326
- byed pa po gzhan* (distinct agent), 11, 11n11, 28, 29, 280, 281, 284, 287, 288, 289, 290, 327n3, 331-333, 336, 349, 352n38, 354, 355n44,
- byed pa po gzhan dang dngos su 'brel ba'i las tshig* (verbs that are directly connected with a distinct agent, transitive verbs). *See* *byed 'brel las tshig*.
- byed pa po gzhan dang dngos su ma 'brel ba'i las tshig* (verbs that are not directly connected with a distinct agent, intransitive verbs). *See* *byed med las tshig*.
- byed pa po la yod pa'i las* (act belonging to the agent), 264, 321, 327, 329
- byed pa (po) phal ba* (secondary agent), 325, 326
- byed sgra* (ergative case), 8n6, 22, 28, 284. *See also* ergative languages.
- byed tshig, bya tshig* (expressions for doing, expressions for thing-done), 268-270, 270-271n10, 272n11, 296-297, 346-347n29
- bzlog pa'i don* (contrapositive, negation), 210, 217, 219n19, 221, 221n21, 222. *See* *viparītārtha*.

C

Cabezón, José, 184n11, 307

Candrakīrti, 5, 6, 7, 17, 20, 21, 70n60, 73, 97, 108, 141, 142n2, 142n3, 147, 148n16, 184, 185, 187, 193,

- 194, 203ff., 224-229, 231, 232, 244, 244n14, 245n17, 247, 247n19, 252, 253n29
- his debate with Bhāvivēka, 5, 17-21, 148n16, 203ff.
- his sevenfold reasoning, 142n2
- his use of *reductio ad absurdum* and contraposition, 97, 203ff.
- his use of the neither one nor many argument, 141, 142n3
- interpreted as a dialetheist, i.e., as accepting true contradictions, 70n60, 253, 253n29
- interpreted as a typical Indo-Tibetan Prāsaṅgika accepting that customary things only exist for mistaken minds, 6, 7, 229, 252
- on customary truth, 6, 224, 226-229, 232, 244, 247, 247n19, 252
- on that which is recognized by the world (*lokaprasiddha*), 6, 224-226, 226n5, 231, 232
- Cāndravyākaraṇa*, 302, 303
- Carnap, Rudolf, 76n66
- Catuhśataka* of Āryadeva, 68, 244n14
- catuskoṭi* (tetralemma), 19n19, 68ff., 70n60, 309n15
- certainty (*niścaya*, *niścita*), 49, 50, 59ff., 61, 151n23
- and the term “ascertained” (*niścita-grahaṇa*), 59n36, 60, 60n38, 61, 151n23
- chad pa'i stong pa nyid*.
See *ucchedaśūnyatā* s.v. *śūnyatā*.
- Chakrabarti, Arindam, 30
- Cheng, Lisa Lai-Shen 117, 117n46
- Chi, R.S.Y., 58n34
- Chinese verbs, 262, 263, 263n4, 264
- chos can* (subject) 50, 52, 52n25, 75, 90, 92, 104-108, 108n37, 119, 125, 144, 156, 159, 159n43, 187, 204.
See *dharmin*.
- chos can 'ba' zhid pa* (nominal subject), 159, 159n44, 160, 160n47, 164. See also *kevaladharmin*.
- chos can mthun snang ba* (subjects that appear similarly to both parties in the debate), 192-193n25, 204, 204-205n2
- chos can nus med* (a powerless subject), 107, 108
- chos can skyon can* (faulty subject), 92
- chos kyi bdag med*. See *dharmanairātmya*.
- Chos rnam rgyal gi bsdus grwa*. See *bTsan po bsdus grwa* of gSer khang pa Dam chos rnam rgyal.
- Chu mig pa Seng ge dpal, 84, 85n7
- Churchland, Paul M., 245n15
- citta* (minds) and *caitta* (mental factors), 84n2
- cittamātra* (mind alone), 176, 176n3-4, 180
- classifiers in Chinese (*liang ci* 量詞), 116 117, 117n46
- Cocchiarella, Nino, 102
- Collected Topics* literature (*bsdus grwa*), 2, 41, 44, 77, 83ff
- and *ex falso sequitur quodlibet*, 111, 112
- and modal logic, 112ff.
- and semantic problems, 114ff.
- its connection with the *Epistemological Summaries*, 84, 85

- its place in the Sa skya pa tradition, 86, 87
- its use of nonexistent subject terms, 99-102
- its use of pervasion (*khyab pa* = *vyāpti*), 102, 103, 105-112
- its use of the fallacy “knowable thing and crushed garlic” (*shes bya sgog rdzog*), 92-94, 92n23
- possible Chinese influence, 135-137
- the earliest, 86
- the rules of the game, 88-92
- the two sorts of consequences used in *Collected Topics*, 94-98
- its use of variables, 51, 103ff.
- Comrie, Bernard, 8n6, 28n27, 300n12
- consequences (*prasaṅga*), 6, 17, 19n19, 20, 21, 84, 89, 96-98, 108n37, 157n39, 208, 209, 210-221
- and contraposition of the consequences (*prasaṅgaviparyaya*), 6, 17-21, 18n18, 19n19, 95, 97, 208-213, 215, 216, 218-221
- and indigenous Tibetan logic, 83ff.
- and *reductio ad absurdum*, 6, 17-20, 94, 97, 97n26, 98, 205
- in Candrakīrti-Bhāviveka debate, 17-21, 208-220
- quantification and variables, 103ff.
- that do not imply a proof, 96-98
- that imply a proof and can be contraposed, 94-96
- that only have a reason and an implied property, 108n37
- that only refute, 96, 97. *See sun 'byin pa 'i thal 'gyur.*
- the three ways to reply, 90, 91, 90n19
- their definition and form in *Collected Topics*, 89, 90
- their goodness, 90, 91
- their two sorts 94ff.
- used like a logic of propositions, 106ff.
- versus triply characterized reasons, 90, 99ff.
- with unacknowledged subjects, 157
- contraposition (*viparyaya*) and *modus tollens*, 18
- Copi, Irving, 18
- count nouns and mass nouns, 114-120, 126, 127
- Crane, Tim, 250n23
- D**
- da drag* (supplementary *-d* suffix), 293n5, 337, 337n23, 338, 365n61
- Dag yig gsar bsgrigs* of Blo mthun bSam gtan *et al.*, 24, 53n27, 272n11, 280n2, 290, 330n9, 335n21, 349n32, 366n61
- Dānaśīla, 44n14
- dang sgra* (the word *dang*, “and”), 336, 349, 351n36, 354, 354n44. *See* five uses of *dang* in the *Sum cu pa*. *See also* *sdud pa 'i don*.
- Dantinne, Jean, 230n9
- dam bca'*. *See* *pratijñā*.
- Davidson, Donald, 118, 127-128, 131-132, 252n28
- on inscrutability of reference, 118, 127-128

- dBu ma'i byung tshul* of Śākya mchog ldan, 175ff
 French translation, 183-196
 Tibetan text, 197-202
- dbu ma'i lam*. See *madhyamā pratipad*.
- dBu ma dgongs pa rab gsal* of Tsong kha pa, 145n8, 146n10, 147, 150n21, 152n26, 218, 218n15
- dBu ma rgyan gyi brjed byang* of rGyal tshab rje, 142
- dBu ma rgyan gyi zin bris* of Tsong kha pa, 143, 144, 150n21
 translation of excerpt, 156-164
 Tibetan text of excerpt, 170-173
- dBu ma'i spyi don* of Se ra rje btsun Chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 204, 207n4, 213n11, 214, 219n18, 221n21
- dBu ma la 'jug pa'i bstan bcos kyi dgongs pa rab tu gsal ba'i me long* of dGe 'dun grub pa, 108n36, 216n14
- dBus pa blo gsal Byang chub ye shes, 10, 321
- dBus pa blo gsal grub mtha'*, 146n11, 148n16
- dByangs can Grub pa'i rdo rje, 10, 293, 315, 316n32, 320, 323, 355n44
 on *bdag don phal ba*, 333n15, 355-356n44. See *bdag don phal ba* (a secondary sense of "self").
- de kho na nyid*. See *tattva*.
- de kho na nyid du* (absolutely, really), 153
- De Morgan's laws, 69n59
- debate logics and games of debate, 89, 89n16-17
- debate rules, 88ff.
- deflationary facts, 251
- deflationism, deflationary theories, 250, 250n25, 251, 252, 254, 255, 255n31, 256, 257
- Deguchi, Yasuo, 253n29
- DeLancey, Scott, 8n6
- Devendrabuddhi, 44n13, 46, 47, 223n2
- deviant logic, 68-73
- deVries, Willem, 239n6, 242n10, 246n18
- dgag bya / dgag bya'i chos* (what is to be refuted; the property to be refuted), 3, 145, 145n8, 187, 189, 233n14, 254n30, 256
- dgag bya ngos 'dzin* (recognizing what is to be refuted), 233n14, 254n30, 256
- dgag pa gnyis kyis rnal ma go ba*. See *pratiṣedhadvayena prakṛtagamana*.
- dgag pa tsam*. See *pratiṣedhamātra*.
- dGe bshes dKa' dbyangs, 87n15
- dGe bshes Ngag dbang nyi ma, 87, 87-88n15
- dGe bshes rTa mgrin rab brtan (Geshé Rabten), 87n15
- dGe 'dun grub pa, 41, 108, 108n36, 216n14,
- dGe lugs (pa), 3-7, 45, 49, 49-50n23, 52n25, 54, 57, 59, 61, 62, 63, 65, 66n21, 67, 71-73, 71n61, 77, 78, 80, 81, 85, 86, 87, 87n15, 88, 88n15, 89n16, 90, 92n23, 97, 108, 122n22, 124, 125n58, 129, 130, 131, 133, 135, 142, 143, 150n21, 153n27, 156n38, 158n43, 159n43, 161n52, 161n53, 176, 179, 184n11, 192-193n25, 203ff., 232, 232n13, 253, 254n30
- debate with Sa skya pa on double negation elimination, the tetra-

- lemma, and parameterization 71, 71n61, 72, 73, 108, 115
- debate with Sa skya pa on objects, 80, 80n71, 81, 81n72, 82
- debate with Sa skya pa on similar and dissimilar instances, 61ff. *See* similar instances.
- debate with Sa skya pa on “mere tree” (*shing tsam*) and real universals (*spyi dngos po ba*), 129-131
- interpretation of Avalokitavrata, 220ff.
- on conceptual identity/difference (*ldog pa gcig/tha dad*), 77, 78
- on debate between Candrakīrti and Bhāviveka, 203ff.
- on *entity itself* and *viprayuktasamkāra*, 121-122n22
- on *ldog pa* (exclusion; concept), 161n52
- on Mādhyamikas’ philosophical method and making of truth claims, 97, 203ff., 216-217n14, 217-220, 232n13
- on *ngo bo gcig ldog pa tha dad* (essentially one but having different exclusions/concepts), 153n27
- on the difficult point of their philosophy of language, 122ff.
- on the neither one nor many argument, 142ff.
- their decisive reliance on visions of tutelary deities, 232n13
- their ontology, 161n53
- their version of a white horse argument, 135-137
- use of Indian sources, 254n30
- use of *shes bya chos can*, 108
- dharmakāya* (Dharma-body) 223, 230-231n9
- Dharmakīrti, 2, 18, 18n18, 19, 20, 37n1, 38n3, 41, 42, 42n10, 43, 43n11, 44, 44n13, 45, 45n16, 46, 47, 48, 48n20, 49, 51, 52, 54, 55, 56, 58, 59, 59n36, 60n37, 61, 65-67, 73-76, 78-81, 83, 84n2, 88, 89n16, 94, 96, 99, 100, 100n31, 102, 103, 112, 130, 136n75, 141, 144, 151n23, 156n38, 159, 159n43, 161, 162, 192n25, 219, 223, 241, 248, 252, 261n1
- five Indian traditions of interpretation of his thought, 47
- interpreted as a Mādhyamika, 48n20
- on certainty (*niścaya*) and natural connections (*svabhāvavapratibandha*), 59ff., 59n36, 60, 61, 94, 102ff., 103, 112, 114, 151n23
- on contraposition of consequences (*prasaṅgaviparyaya*), 18n18, 19, 20, 96, 219
- on double negation elimination, 73. *See* *pratiṣedhadhvayena prakṛtagamana*.
- on good reasons (*saddhetu*) and the triple characterization (*trairūpya*), 2, 49, 51, 52, 54, 55ff., 56, 58, 59, 59n36, 60, 61, 62n40, 65, 67, 84n2, 89n16, 99, 100, 100n31, 102ff., 156n38, 192n25
- on nonexistent subjects and the problem of *āśrayāsiddhahetu*, 99, 100, 100n31, 100n32, 159, 160, 161, 162
- on referential opacity, semantics, and *pratiññārthaikaśāhetu*, 73, 74, 75, 76, 78, 79, 248

- on similar instances (*sapakṣa*), 61, 63, 67
- research on his life, dates, oeuvre, philosophy, 43n11
- translations of his works into Tibetan, 44, 44n13, 45, 46
- Dharmamitra, 158, 158n42
- dharmanairātmya* (the identitylessness of phenomena), 190
- dharmin* (subject), 52, 62, 75, 104, 144, 156, 159, 159n43, 187, 192, 204, 204-205n2
- Dharmottara, 42, 42n10, 47, 54n28, 55, 248
- diathesis. *See* active and passive voices in Tibetan.
- difficult point of the *apoha* theory (*gzhan sel dka'gnad*), 119n48, 121n51, 124, 126, 128, 129, 131-134
- Dignāga, 2, 18-21, 38n3, 40n5, 42, 43n11, 45, 46n17, 48, 49, 51, 55ff., 56, 59, 59n36, 60, 60n37, 61, 61n39, 63, 65, 66, 67, 67n52, 73, 99, 100, 111, 130, 144, 158, 159n43, 160, 161, 162, 192n25, 205n2, 206
- interpreted as using a non-monotonic logic, 65, 65n50, 66, 67n52
- on contraposition of consequences (*prasaṅgaviparyaya*), 18-21
- on good reasons (*saddhetu*) and the triple characterization (*trairūpya*), 2, 49, 51, 55ff., 56, 59, 59n36, 60, 61, 61n39, 65, 67, 67n52, 99, 100, 192n25, 205n2
- on nonexistent subjects and *āśrayā-siddha*, 99, 100, 144, 156n38, 157n38, 160
- on similar instances (*sapakṣa*), 63, 65, 66, 67
- on the definition of a thesis (*pakṣa*), 158, 159, 159n43, 160, 206
- the role of Dignāga in Tibetan Tshadma, 45, 46, 46n17, 48, 60, 61, 67
- '*dir ma khyab* (There would be no pervasion in this case!), 92, 92n21
- disputatio*, 27, 27n2
- Dixon, R.M.W., 28n27, 268, 268n8-9, 275
- dKar lebs drung yig Pad ma rdo rje, 10, 11, 318-320, 320n40, 321-323, 327n3, 328n5
- dKar lebs sum rtags dka' 'grel of dKar lebs drung yig Pad ma rdo rje, 318
- dKon mchog 'jig med dbang po, 240n8
- dMu dge bsam gtan, 315n31
- dngos* 'gal (directly contradictory), 151, 189
- dngos po* (entity), 11n11, 15, 80, 121-122n52, 161n25, 177n5, 207n4, 221, 221n21, 222, 303, 312, 313-324, 328. *See also* *bhāva*.
- dngos po bdag* (the entity self), *dngos po gzhan* (the entity other), 9n8, 274n14, 310ff., 315ff., 327, 327n3, 328n5, 336, 336n22, 338, 339, 343, 352n38, 353n39, 354-357n44, 360n50
- las kyi dngos po* (the entity that is the object), 328
- byed pa pa'i dngos po* (the [concrete] entity belonging to the agent, e.g., the woodcutter's axe), 322
- bya ba'i dngos po* (the entity that is the thing-done), 322, 328
- ming rkyang gi dngos po* (simple noun entities), 362

- dngos po med pa, dngos med* (not a real entity; absence; nonexistent), 161, 162n53, 162n55. *See abhāva.*
- dngos rten* (direct basis), 162
- dngos smra ba* (metaphysical realist philosophers), 3, 183, 195, 204
- dNgul chu Dharmabhadra, 10, 274n14, 281, 293, 315, 315n32, 316, 320, 320n40, 321, 323, 334n19, 355n44
- '*dod* (I agree!), 90
- doing. *See byed pa 'i las* (act-qua-doing).
- Dol po pa Shes rab rgyal mtshan, 4n3, 177, 177n5, 178
- examples of his twenty-one philosophical differences with Śākya mchog ldan, 177n5
- don byed nus pa.* *See arthakriyāsāmāthyā.*
- don dam bden pa* (ultimate truth; ultimate reality), 4, 184, 253. *See paramārthasatya.*
- don dam par* (ultimately), 71, 148n16, 150n21, 188, 253. *See paramārthatas.*
- don gcig* (extensional identity, same objects), 74, 80n71, 321, 322
- don gyis* (via the sense, by implication), 189, 272n11, 338, 346n28, 347n29
- don gyis rtogs par bya* (understood implicitly via the sense), 353n40
- don gyis thob pa* (gotten/obtained via the sense), 13, 346n28, 351n36, 353, 353n40, 354, 354n42
- don gzhan.* *See arthāntara.*
- don la gnas pa 'i mthun phyogs.* *See similar instances.*
- don spyi* (concept, object-universal), 79n70, 162n55
- dPa' ris sang rgyas, 12n11, 329n6
- dpe.* *See dṛṣṭānta.*
- dPe rgyun dkon pa 'ga' zhig gi tho yig* of A khu Shes rab rgya mtsho, 85n9
- dpyod pa.* *See vicāra.*
- drang don.* *See neyārtha.*
- Drang nges legs bshad snying po* of Tsong kha pa, 152n25, 187n17, 191n22, 204, 233n14
- dravya* (substance), 130, 185, 312, 313, 314n29, 317, 320, 321, 324
- dravyatas* (substantially), 254n31. *See also semantic circle.*
- Dreyfus, Georges, 81, 85n7, 87n15, 88n15, 130
- dṛṣṭānta* (example), 50n24, 112, 205-207
- Dunne, John D., 43n11
- Durr, Jacques, 12n11, 318
- Durvekamiśra, 61
- dus gsum.* *See three times.*
- dus kyi dus ma 'ongs pa, dus kyi dus da lta ba, dus kyi dus 'das pa.* *See three times.*
- Dvangs shel me long.* *See rTags 'jug dka' gnad snying po rabs gsal gyi 'grel pa mtha' dpyod dvangs shel me long.*

E

- easy ontology, 251
- Eckel, Malcolm David, 233n14
- Edgerton, Franklin, 226, 227, 227n6
- ekānekavīyogahetu* (neither one nor many reasoning), 3, 141ff.
- eliminativism, 242-245, 245n15, 246, 249

Eltschinger, Vincent, 40n5, 43n11, 46n18

Epistemological Summaries of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge et al., 43, 83-85, 85n7. *See Tshad ma'i bsdus pa.*

ergative case (*byed sgra*), ergative marking, 8n6, 22, 23, 24, 28, 267, 286n6, 287, 357n44

ergative languages, 7, 8n6, 25, 28n27, 267, 268, 283, 288

ergative/non-ergative perspective, 27, 28, 29

error theory, 7, 229, 231, 241

eva (only), 49, 53-55, 53n27, 54n28, 55n29, 62n40

ex falso sequitur quodlibet (whatever you wish follows from a falsity), 111, 112

existence brought about because of appearing to the mind (*blo la snang ba'i dbang gis bzhag pa'i yod pa*), 146-147

F

Fine, Kit, 252n27, 255n31

five uses of *dang* in the *Sum cu pa*, 351n36

Flew, Antony, 3n1

four/five logical reasons proving emptiness 147-149, 148n16

diamond splinters reason (*vajra-kaṇahetu*), 147-149, 148n16

neither one nor many reason (*ekānekaviyogahetu*), 147-149, 148n16, 150ff.

reason from dependent arising (*pratītyasamutpādahetu*), 147-149, 148n16

reason refuting production of existence or nonexistence (*yod med skye 'gog gi gtan tshigs*), 147-149, 148n16

reason that refutes production according to the four points (*ca-tuṣkoṭyutpādapratiṣedhahetu*), 147-149, 148n16

Franco, Eli, 65

Fraser, Chris, 117n46, 127

Frauwallner, Erich, 42n10, 43n11

Für Sich-An Sich dichotomy, 235

G

'gal ba. *See virodha.*

'gal brjod kyi thal 'gyur (*prasaṅga* stating a contradiction), 215

'gal khyab (opposite pervasion), 109, 135

Ganeri, Jonardon, 30, 136n75, 240, 240n8, 241

gang dren dren yin pas khyab (*x* is pervaded by whatever you might think of), 111. *See also ex falso sequitur quodlibet.*

gang zag. *See pudgala.*

gang zag gi bdag med. *See pudgala-nairātmya.*

Garfield, Jay L., 3n1, 30, 253n29

gcig du bral gyi gtan tshigs. *See ekānekaviyogahetu.*

gcig du bral gyi rnam bzhag (the lesson on the neither one nor many argument), 143. *See also Skabs dang po'i spyi don.*

ghaṭatva (vaseness), 130

Gillon, Brendan, 62n40

- Givón, T., 275n16
- glags yod pa'i tshig, glags dang bcas pa'i tshig* (statement that presents an occasion for a reply). *See sāvākāśavacana.*
- Glo bo mkhan chen bSod nams lhun grub, 50n23, 66
- gnyis med kyi ye shes* (non-dual gnosis), 175, 177n5, 188n19. *See advaya-jñāna.*
- go dka'sla* (relative ease or difficulty of understanding), 52
- God, 47, 100, 100n31, 101, 101n33, 156
- Gödel numbers, 118
- Goldberg, Margaret, 86n12, 137n77
- Gong Sun long 公孫龍, 136
- Gong sun long zi* 公孫龍子 of Gong Sun Long, 136
- good reasons (*saddhetu*), 2, 48-51, 55-59, 65, 75-76, 99, 120, 122, 131
for Īśvarasena, 60n37
with nonexistent subjects, 99ff., 100n32
- Goodman, Charles, 136n75
- Go rams pa bSod nams seng ge, 5, 10, 19n19, 44, 52n25, 61, 71n61, 129, 130, 254n30, 351n37, 353n38
- Graf, Alexander, 10n9
- grāhaka* (subject), 185, 188n19
- grāhya* (object), 185, 188n19
- Grice, Paul, 255n31
- Griffiths, Paul, 241n9
- Grub mtha' chen mo* of 'Jam dbyangs bzhad pa Ngag dbang brtson 'grus, 219n19
- Grub mtha' rin chen phreng ba* of dKon mchog 'jig med dbang po, 240n8
- Grub mtha' shel gyi me long* of Thu'u bkwan Blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, 176, 176n3, 179
- gSang phu sne'u thog monastery, gSang phu traditions and lineage, 43, 43n12, 61, 84-87, 90n19, 129, 181, 182
- gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan. *See Śākya mchog ldan.*
- gSer tog Blo bzang tshul khirms rgya mtsho, 16, 16n17, 33, 265, 273, 274n14, 291-300, 323n44, 325ff.
- gtan tshigs* (reason). *See hetu.*
- gtan tshigs bzhi/lnga.* *See* four/five logical reasons proving emptiness.
- gtan tshigs rig pa* (science of reasons). *See hetuvidyā.*
- gtan tshigs yang dag.* *See saddhetu.*
- gtan tshigs ltar snang* (pseudo-reason, bad reason). *See hetvābhāsa.*
- Guerrero, Laura P., 252
- g.Yag ston seng ge dpal, 85
- gzhan grags kyi gtan tshigs* (other-acknowledged reason). *See parasiddhahetu.*
- gzhan ldan rnam gcod* (elimination of possession of something else). *See anyayogavyavaccheda.*
- gzhan sel gyi dka' gnad / gzhan sel gyi rtogs dka' ba'i gnad kyi gtso bo* (the difficult point of the *apoha* philosophy of language; the main point that is difficult to understand in the *anyāpoha* philosophy of language), 2, 3, 124
- gZhan stong Madhyamaka philosophy, 4, 4n3, 175-177, 177n4, 177n5, 178, 180, 183, 195

gzhi (bases), 142n4, 150. *See vastu.*

gzhi grub (established basis), 77, 154, 154n32, 158, 161n53

gzhi ma grub pa. *See āsrayāsiddha.*

gzhi ma grub pa'i gtan tshigs. *See āsrayāsiddhahetu.*

gzhi mihun (common basis, common element), 120, 120n49, 151, 153n28

gzhi shes (knowledge of the bases), 142n4. *See vastujñāna.*

ha chang thal. *See atiprasaṅga.*

H

Haack, Susan, 68n55

Hagège, Claude, 262, 263n4, 267, 273, 274

Hahn, Michael, 14, 15, 261-264, 266

Halbfass, Wilhelm, 30

Halliday, Michael, 29, 30

Hansen, Chad, 116n45, 117n46, 128n63, 130n67, 137

Hansson, Sven Ove, 58n35

Harbsmeier, Christoph, 46n17, 116n45, 117n46, 136n74

Haribhadra, 3, 143, 143n5, 145, 145n8, 231n9

Harrison, Paul, 230-231n9

Hattori, Masaaki, 43n11

Hayes, Richard P., 62n40

Herforth, Derek, 7, 287n8, 300n12, 303, 311, 311n21, 314, 316, 329n7

hetu (reason), 141, 156n38, 205-207

Hetubindu of Dharmakīrti, 60n37

Hetucakra of Dignāga, 111

hetuvidyā (science of reasons), 39

hetvābhāsa (pseudo-reason, bad reason), 56

Higgins, David and Martina Draszczyk, 4n3

Hill, Christopher, 250n25

Hill, Nathan, 24n24, 25n26, 334n17

History of Sanskrit Grammatical Literature in Tibet of Pieter Cornelis Verhagen, 301ff.

Hopkins, Jeffrey, 17, 205n2, 219n19, 229

Hopper, Paul J. and Sandra A. Thompson, 26, 286-287n7, 288, 288n9, 289

Horwich, Paul, 250n25, 251

Hugon, Pascale, 42, 42n8-9, 43n12, 50n23, 63n44, 67n52-53, 68n54, 84n4, 85n6, 86, 87n14, 97n26, 125n58

I

imperfective-perfective, 300, 300n12

implicative reversal, 20, 21

Inaba, Shōju, 281, 291, 300, 300n12, 355n44

incommensurability, 115, 127n61, 131, 131n68, 132

induction, inductive logic, 50n24, 59n36, 65, 65n47, 65n50, 67, 93, 94

inherent ontologies of languages, 118, 126-128, 130, 131, 132, 252n28

intensionality, intensional entities, 73ff., 76, 246-248

iron being changed into gold by alchemists versus iron spontaneously changing into gold, 331-333

Īśvara, 100, 143, 156, 163. *See God.*

- Īśvarasena, 59n36, 60, 60n37, 102
 his method to establish pervasion
 by merely not seeing a counterex-
 ample (*adarśanamātra*), 59n36, 94,
 102, 103
- J**
- Jackson, David P., 42n8, 85n7
- Jackson, Roger, 4n3
- jaḍa* (matter), 136
- ‘Jam dbyangs bzhad pa Ngag dbang
 brtson ‘grus, 50n23, 66n51, 86,
 86n12, 87, 110, 219
- Jayānanda, 5n4, 192n25, 229
- Jetāri, 48n20
- ‘jig lta lhan skyes* (innate false view on
 the personality), 191n23
- ‘jig rten grags sde spyod pa’i dbu ma
 pa* (Mādhyamikas who practice in
 accordance with what is recognized
 by the world), 5n4, 226
- jjñāsītadharmin* (the subject of enqui-
 ry), 52, 52n25, 75
- Jinendrabuddhi, 45, 158n43
- Jinpa Thubten, 49n22
- Jñānagarbha, 146, 148n16
- Jñānaśrīmitra, 47, 47n19, 48, 63n43
- Jo nang pa, 4n3, 6, 175-177, 179, 180,
 229
- Jo nang pa Kun dga’ grol mchog, 180,
 181
- Jo nang Tāranātha, 4n3, 177, 179
- Jullien, François, 3n1
- K**
- Kajiyama, Yūichi, 43n11, 47n19, 55n29,
 62n40, 63n43
- Kālacakratāntra*, 184, 185n12, 186n14,
kalpanā (conceptual cognition), 151
- Kamalaśīla, 3, 42, 47, 99, 142n3, 144,
 146, 148n16, 152n26, 157, 158,
 160n45, 230, 232
- Kapstein, Matthew, 79n69, 81n72
- Karmapa Chos grags rgya mtsho, 180,
 196n37
- karman* (object), 310ff., 325
- Karṇakagomin, 78n68
- kartr* (agent), 310ff., 325, 326
- Karunadasa, Y., 227n6
- Kāryakāraṇabhāvasiddhi* of Jñānaśrīmi-
 tra, 47n19
- Kātantra* attributed to Sarvavarman, 8,
 302-304, 308n14
- Kathāvatthu* of the *Abhidhammapiṭaka*,
 237
- Katsura, Shōryū, 30, 46n17, 50n24,
 62n40, 63n41, 66-67
- Kellner, Birgit, 38n3, 43n11
- kevaladharmin* (nominal subject), 159
- kha bub/sbub* (inverted), 110
- kha skong* (a filler), 351n36
- khas len* (acceptance). *See abhyupagama*.
- khas len pas grub pa* (established by po-
 sitions), 90
- kho na* (only). *See eva*.
- ‘*khruḥ shes* (mistaken cognition), 79,
 79n70
- khyab bya*. *See vyāpya*.
- khyab byed*. *See vyāpaka*.
- khyab mnyam* (equal pervasion; bidirec-
 tional pervasion). *See samavyāpti*.
- khyab pa* (pervasion). *See vyāpti*.

- khyab pa ma byung* (There is no pervasion!). *See ma khyab*.
- khyab pa phyin ci log bzhi* (four negated pervasions), 109
- khyab pa rnal ma bzhi* (four main pervasions), 109
- khyab pa sgo brgyad* (eight types of pervasions), 74
- khyad par* (qualifier, parameter), 3
- khyod* (you, used as variable in *bsdus grwa*), 103ff.
- Klog thabs* texts, 307, 308,
- Klong chen Rab 'byams pa, 45n16, 85
- Klong rdol bla ma, 84
- Komarovski, Yaroslav, 4n3
- Kong sprul Blo gros mtha' yas, 358n46
- Krabbe, Eric C.W., 89n17
- Krasser, Helmut, 43n11, 46n18
- kriyā* (action), 325
- kṛtāntavirodha* (contradiction with philosophical tenets), 209. *See also sid-dhāntavirodha*.
- kṛtya, kṛtyānta* (terms ending in suffixes of obligation), 266, 291, 291, 299
- Kumāriḷa, 73
- kun brtags*. *See parikalpita*.
- kun rdzob bden pa, kun rdzob*. *See samvṛtisatyā, samvṛti*.
- L**
- La Vallée Poussin, Louis de, 49n22, 191n23, 203, 205n2, 224, 226n5, 227, 244n14
- Lahu, 283n3
- lakṣaṇa* (defining characteristic, characteristic), 52, 120, 195
- lakṣya* (definiendum), 52, 120
- Lalou, Marcelle, 42n10
- Lam rim chen mo* of Tsong kha pa, 187n16, 187n18, 190n22, 191n23, 192n25, 204, 206n3, 220, 233n14
- lan* (reply). *See parihāra*.
- lan 'debs mi nus pa* (the opponent cannot consistently reply), 90-91
- LaPolla, Randy J., František Kratochvíl, and Alexander Coupe (=LaPolla *et al.*), 27-30
- Laufer, Berthold, 9n8, 15, 302n2, 317
- las* (object), 325, *passim*. *See karman*.
- las kyi dngos po* (the entity that is the object), 328
- las ni bya ba byed pa gnyis* (The act is of two sorts: thing-done and doing), 327n3
- law of double negation elimination, 19, 19n19, 68, 70-73, 71n61, 110. *See pratiṣedhadvayena prakṛtagamana*.
its acceptance by Tsong kha pa and the dGe lugs pa, 19, 19n19, 71n61, 72, 73
its rejection by Go rams pa and the Sa skya pa, 19n19, 71n61, 73
- law of excluded middle, 155n34
- law of non-contradiction, 69n58, 70
- Lazard, Gilbert, 268n9, 275
- lCang skya grub mtha'* of lCang skya Rol pa'i rdo rje, 123, 123n55, 144, 145, 153n27, 155n34, 157n41, 158n43, 205n2, 240n8
- lCang skya Rol pa'i rdo rje, 123, 123n54, 124, 145, 145n8, 148n16, 158n43, 240n8, 292, 293, 352n38
- lCe Khyi 'brug, 306

- lDan dkar ma / lHan dkar ma catalogue, 42n10
- ldan min 'du byed. *See viprayukta-saṃskāra.*
- ldog pa. *See vyāvṛtti.*
- don ldog (the exclusion that is the meaning for applying a term), 161n52
- gzhi ldog (the exclusion that is the basis for applying a term), 161n52
- rang ldog (property *per se*, own double negative, own exclusion), 123, 123n54, 125, 125n58, 161, 161n52
- ldog pa gcig/tha dad (conceptual identity/difference), 77, 78. *See also vyāvṛtti.*
- Le Goff, Jacques, 37n2
- Legs bshad gser phreng of Tsong kha pa, 142n4
- Leibniz's law, 75. *See* substitutivity of identicals.
- Li byin, 8
- Li, Peggy and Pierina Cheung, 117n47
- Lieberman, Ken, 86n12, 88n15
- Lindtner, Christian, 148n16
- liṅga (reason), 49, 90, 108n37, 141, 157, 191
- linguistic relativity, 132n68, 134
- lokaprasiddha (recognized by the world), 6, 223ff., 231. *See also* populism.
- logic of belief revision, 58, 58n35
- Lokesh Chandra, 85n9
- Lopez, Donald S., 99n29, 192n25, 205n2
- lTa ba 'i shan 'byed of Go rams pa bSod nams seng ge, 71n61
- ltoṣ grub (established in dependence), 189, 356n44
- Lucy, John, 132n68
- Lugs gnyis rnam 'byed of Śākya mchog ldan, 176, 176n4, 178n7, 181
- Luria, A.R., 249
- M**
- ma khyab (=khyab pa ma byung), ma khyab pa (There is no pervasion!; not pervaded), 12, 12n13, 90, 91, 93, 102, 105, 214, 334. *See also* vyāpti.
- ma khyab pa 'i mu zhog (Give me a counterexample!), 102, 107, 112
- ma yin dgag. *See* paryudāsa.
- ma yin pa las log pa (not-not..., = ma yin pa ma yin pa), 162n55
- MacDonald, Anne, 17, 203
- MacKenzie, Matthew, 256
- madhyamā pratipad (middle way), 69
- Madhyamakakārikās. *See* Mūlamadhyamakakārikās of Nāgārjuna.
- Madhyamakālaṃkāra of Śāntarakṣita, 142, 150, 150n21, 154n30, 155n33
- Madhyamakālaṃkārapañjikā of Kamalaśīla, 155n34, 157, 158, 158n42
- Madhyamakālaṃkāravṛtti of Śāntarakṣita, 154n30, 155n34, 157n38
- Madhyamakāloka of Kamalaśīla, 144, 147, 147n12, 148n16, 149, 149n16, 157, 157n41, 158, 160n45, 161, 164
- Madhyamakārthasaṃgraha of Bhāviveka, 148n16
- Madhyamakaśāstrastuti of Candrakīrti, 193n26
- Madhyamakāvaiṭāra of Candrakīrti, 5n4, 90n18, 108, 142n2, 147, 187, 189,

- 192n25, 210, 211n8, 216, 216n14, 217n14, 226n5, 247, 247n19, 248n20
- Madhyamakāvātārabhāṣya* of Candrakīrti, 193, 224, 226n5
- Madhyamakāvātāraṭīkā* of Jayānanda, 5n4
- Mahāmudrā, 4, 4n3, 5
- Maitreya(nātha), 90n18, 142, 176n4, 180, 183, 185, 307
- Maitrīpa, 4n3
- Makransky, John, 231n9
- Malpas, J.E., 132n69-70
- Malvania, Dalsukh, 49n22, 54n28
- Mang po len pa'i bu, 60n37
- manifest image, 236, 242, 242n10, 243n11, 246, 246n18, 249
- Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa*, 184, 184n10
- Manorathanandin, 18n18, 141n2, 142n3, 160n46, 219n17
- Mathes, Klaus-Dieter, 4n3
- Matisoff, James, 283n3
- May, Jacques, iii, 191n23, 206n3, 229
- McClintock, Sara L., 6n4, 99n30, 230n7
- McCrea, Lawrence, 47n19
- McDowell, John, 243,
- McKeown, Arthur, 45n16
- McTaggart, J.M.E., 238
- med par dgag pa*. *See prasajyapratishedha*.
- metaphysical realism and ordinary realism, 5, 7, 72, 72n63, 254, 255, 255n31, 256
- Meinong, Alexius, 80ff.
- mi ldan rnam gcod* (elimination of non-possession). *See ayogavyavaccheda*.
- mi mthun phyogs* (dissimilar instance). *See vipakṣa*.
- Mi pham 'Jam dbyangs rnam rgyal rgyal mtsho, 45, 142
- Miller, Roy A., 16n16, 303, 304, 308, 309, 309n15, 309n18, 310, 311, 312n23, 317, 352n38
- Mimaki, Katsumi, 5n4, 43n11, 47n19, 63n43, 146n11, 148n16, 158n42, 229, 240n8
- ming gzhi, ming gzhi'i yi ge* (radical, main letter), 335, 335n21, 342, 348, 361
- ming gi rnam grangs* (synonyms), 77
- ming rkyang gi dngos po* (simple noun entities), 362
- ming-tshig (nāman-pada)* contrast, 303ff.
- mKhas dbang lHag bsam (=Karma smon lam lHag bsam bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan), 320, 320n40
- mKhas grub rje (=mKhas grub dGe legs dpal bzang po), 44, 71n61, 192-193n25, 204, 213n13
- mKhas pa la 'jug pa'i sgo* of Sa skya Paṇḍita, 90-91n19
- mKhas pa'i mgul rgyan mu tig phreng mdzes* of Si tu Paṇ chen. *See* Si tu Paṇ chen.
- mkhyen pa gsum, thams cad mkhyen pa gsum* (three omnisciences). *See tis-rah sarvajñatāh*.
- mKhyen rab 'od gsal, 356n44
- mnyam bzhag* (meditative equipoise), 145
- mnyan bya (nyid)*. *See śrāvaṇatva*.
- mo gsham gyi bu*. *See vandhyāputra*.
- modal logic, 112ff.
- modus tollens*, 18, 21, 154n31

- Mokṣākaragupta, 47
 monotonic versus non-monotonic logics, 65, 65n47, 65n50, 67, 67n52
mṛṣā (deceptive), 152
mṛṣāmoṣadharmaka (false and deceptive), 238
mithun phyogs. See *sapakṣa*, similar instances.
mithun phyogs la sgra bshad du 'jug pa. See similar instances.
mtshan nyid. See *lakṣaṇa*.
mtshan nyid slob grwa (School of Dialectics of Dharamsala), 87
mtshan nyid pa (one versed in dialectics), 27
mtshon bya. See *lakṣya*.
Mūlamadhyamakakārikās of Nāgārjuna, 17, 19, 142n2, 195n33-34, 196n35, 203, 210, 217n14
Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti of Buddhapālita, 203
 Müller-Witte, Frank, 10n9, 11n10, 12n11, 15n15, 16n17, 23n23, 31, 270n10, 329n6, 335n19, 355n44
 Murti, T.R.V., 218, 219
- N**
- Nagano, Yasuhiko, 8n6
 Nagao, G.M., 187n16, 188n18
 Nāgārjuna, 17, 19, 69, 70n60, 141, 142n2-3, 149, 178n7, 190n22, 203, 205n2, 210, 216, 216n14, 231n9, 244, 244n14, 245n16, 246n18, 253n29, 255, 307
 Nalendra monastery, 86
nang gi khyab pa. See *antarvyāpti* and similar instances.
 Naudou, Jean, 46n18
 Nemoto, Hiroshi, 56n32
 Newland, Guy, 223n1, 232n11, 237n3, 253
neyārtha (indirect meaning), 184
 Ngag dbang chos grags, 178
nges don. See *nītārtha*.
nges pa (certainty; ascertained; certain). See *certainty*.
ngo bo gcig (essentially identical, same nature), 151, 151n24, 153n27, 328
ngo bo tha dad (essentially different), 151, 151n24, 152n26, 153n27
 Ngo nyid med par smra ba, 186, 186n13
 Ngog lo tsā ba Blo ldan shes rab, 43, 44n13, 45n16, 72, 178
 Nicholas, David, 130n66
nigrahassthāna (point of defeat), 70, 146n11
niḥsvabhāva (without intrinsic nature), 150n21
 Niḥsvabhāvabhāvavādin. See *Ngo bo nyid med par smra ba*.
nirodhasamāpatti (attainment of cessation), 241, 241n9
niścaya/niścita (certainty; ascertained). See *certainty*.
niṣprapañca (without conceptual/discursive proliferations), 69
nītārtha (definitive meaning), 184
 nominalism, 80, 81, 123, 130
 nominative-accusative type of language, 25
 nonexistent subjects, 144, 156ff.
 Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika, 130

Nyāyabindu of Dharmakīrti, 42n10, 47, 49, 53, 54, 58, 61

Nyāyabinduṭīkā of Dharmottara, 42n10, 54n28, 55

Nyāyamukha of Dignāga, 45, 46, 46n17, 60n37, 206

Nyāyapraveśa of Śāṅkarasvāmin, 46, 46n17, 135

nyid (only [*eva*]; abstraction suffix [*tā*, *tva*]), 53-55, 53n27, 54n28, 62n40. See *eva*.

O

Oberhammer, Gerhard, 50n24

Oetke, Claus, 65n49-50

Ono, Motoi, 223n2

Onoda, Shunzō, 42n8, 43n12, 49n23, 52n25, 80n71, 83, 84n2-3, 86n12, 87n13-15, 90-91n19, 108n37, 110, 110n40, 136n73, 142n4

P

Pa tshab Nyi ma grags, 5n4, 176, 180

pakṣa (thesis), 69, 159, 164n58, 206, 216n14, 231, See also *pakṣadharmatva*.

pakṣadharmatva (the fact that the reason qualifies the subject), 19, 50, 51, 62n40, 75, 98, 101n32, 150, 156, 156n38, 157n38, 160, 164, 164n58, 222

in which the term *pakṣa* is used to mean “the subject,” 61, 163, 164, 164n58, 192

Pañ chen bSod nams grags pa, 124, 124n57

Pañcakrama of tantric Nāgārjuna, 188n19

Pañcaviṁśati (= *Pañcaviṁśatisāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*), 191n23

Pañḍita Lha rig(s) pa'i seng ge, 8

Pāṇini, 291, 292n3

paramārthasatya, *paramārtha* (ultimate truth; ultimate), 4, 184, 193n28, 238, 253

paramārthasat (existing ultimately; ultimate existent), 238, 253

paramārthasiddha (ultimately established), 238, 253

paramārthatas (ultimately), 71, 148n16

parameterization, 3, 48, 70, 71, 71n61, 72, 73

paraprasiddhahetu (other-acknowledged reason) 207, 208

parārthānumāna (inference for others), 89n16

paratantrasvabhāva (dependent nature), 187n17, 195

parasparaviruddha (mutually contradictory), 70, 70n60.

parihāra (reply), 89

parikalpita (imagined), 185, 195

Parfit, Derek, 240n8

pariyudāsa (implicative negation), 71, 209, 216

Patil, Parimal, 47n19

Paul, Gregor, 43n11

Pecchia, Cristina, 40n5

Perdue, Daniel E., 42n8, 86n12

phan tshun shed mtshungs pa (both of the same force), 270, 270-271n10, 335, 354

bya byed kyi sgra phan tshun shed mtshung pa (expressions for doing

- and thing-done that are both of the same force), 270, 270-271n10
- phan tshun spangs 'gal. See paraspara-viruddha.*
- phan tshun stobs mtshungs pa. See phan tshun shed mtshungs pa.*
- Philby, Kim, 76
- philology, 230, 230-231n9
- philosophus, 27*
- Philosophy and the Scientific Image of Man* of Wilfrid Sellars, 236ff.
- 'phul mtshams kyi rigs pa* (reasoning which forces the limits of what the opponent accepts), 3, 4, 4n2
- phung po. See skandha.*
- Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge, 43, 44, 45n16, 61, 63, 67, 78, 79, 79n70, 80, 81, 83, 84, 84n4, 85, 85n9, 86, 90n19, 97, 97n26, 108, 130, 157, 157n40
- Phya-tradition (*phya lugs*), 44, 77, 80, 85, 85n7, 125n58, 130
- phyi rgol yang dag* (proper opponent), 56n32, 95
- phyogs. See pakṣa and pakṣadharmatva.*
- poṭi lnga* (five major Indian texts), 90, 90n18
- populism, 225, 226, 231, 232
- Potter, Karl H., 43n11
- practical reason, 242, 242n10, 243, 245
- pradhāna* (the Principal, = *prakṛti*), 160, 161, 161n49, 161n52, 162n55, 163, 163n57, 164, 164n60. *See also* Sāṃkhya, *prakṛti*.
- pragmatism, 243, 247n19
- prajñā-upāya* duality, 307, 308
- Prajñākaragupta, 46, 47, 141, 141n2, 142n3
- Prajñākaramati, 233n14
- prajñāpāramitā* (perfection of wisdom), 142n4, 143n5, 156, 190n22, 194, 231n9, 307
- Prajñāpāramitāstotra* of Nāgārjuna, 190-191n22
- Prajñāpradīpa* of Bhāviveka, 73
- Prajñāpradīpaṭīkā* of Avalokitavrata, 73
- prajñaptisat* (verbal designations), 238
- prakṛti* (Primordial Nature), 100, 143, 161n49, 215. *See also* Sāṃkhya, *pradhāna*.
- pramāṇa* (source of knowledge), 38ff. *passim*.
- three *pramāṇas* needed to show that partite things cannot be truly single, 151ff, 151n23
- Pramāṇa (theory of sources of knowledge), 38ff., *passim*
- Pramāṇasamuccaya* and *vṛtti* of Dignāga, 40n5, 45, 49, 59n36, 60, 61, 158-159n43, 161, 206
- the Tibetan commentaries on these works, 45n16
- Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* of Jinendrabuddhi, 158n43
- pramāṇasiddhi* (proof of authority), 39, 40n5, 223n2
- Pramāṇavārttika* of Dharmakīrti, 40n5, 41, 44, 44n13, 45-47, 49, 55, 55n29, 57, 60, 60n38, 75, 83, 90n18, 100n31, 124, 130, 141n2, 151n23, 159n43, 160, 160n45, 160n46, 161, 162, 162n54, 163n56, 194, 219n17, 220, 223, 223n2
- Pramāṇavārttikālamkāra* (*Pramāṇavārttikabhāṣya*) of Prajñākaragupta, 46, 47, 141n2

- Pramāṇavārttikapañjikā* of Deven-drabuddhi, 44n13, 46
- Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛtti* of Dharmakīrti, 75, 78, 78n68, 164n58
- Pramāṇavārttikaṭīkā* of Śākyabuddhi, 46
- Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti* of Manorathanandin, 141n2
- Pramāṇaviniścaya* of Dharmakīrti, 41, 43, 45, 45n16, 47, 52, 52n25, 61, 61n39, 72, 73, 83, 158n43
- prapañca* (conceptual proliferation), 177n5, 188,
- prasajyapraṭiśedha* (simple, non-implicative negation), 5, 101, 158, 183, 209, 216, 218
- prasaṅga* (consequences), 6, 17, 19n19, 20, 21, 84, 89, 96-98, 108n37, 157n39, 208, 209, 210-221. *See* consequences.
- prasaṅgaviparyaya* (contraposition of the consequence), 6, 17-21, 18n18, 19n19, 95, 97, 208-213, 215, 216, 218-221. *See* consequences.
- Prāsaṅgika, 5, 5n4, 6, 7, 97, 141n2, 145n8, 148n16, 176, 176n4, 180, 183, 184, 184n11, 187n17, 192n25, 205, 207-210, 216, 218, 219n19, 220, 226, 229, 230, 231, 232, 232n13
- Tibetan origins of the distinction between *rang rgyud pa* (Svātantrika) and *thal 'gyur ba* (Prāsaṅgika), 5n4
- typical and atypical, 7, 97, 229, 230, 231, 232n12
- Prasannapadā* of Candrakīrti, 5, 20, 70n60, 73, 148n16, 186n13, 192n25, 203, 204, 204n2, 206, 209, 211n8, 212, 213, 216, 217, 217n14, 218, 220, 224, 225, 227, 244, 244n13, 244n14
- pratijñā* (thesis, belief), 69, 91, 159, 216, 216n14, 217n14, 230
- pratijñārthaikadeśahetu* (a reason that is a part of the thesis-proposition; circular reason), 75, 78
- pratiśedhadhvayena prakṛtagamana* (understanding the main proposition by means of two negations; double negation elimination), 72, 73
- pratiśedhamātra* (mere denial), 71
- pratīyasamutpāda* (dependent arising, conditioned production), 187n16, 188n19, 189, 228
- pratīyasamutpādahetu* (reason from dependent arising), 148, 148n16
- prekṣāvat* (judicious people), 230, 230n7
- Priest, Graham, 30, 71n62, 250, 252, 252n29
- production from self, 149, 203ff.
- Pronunciation of Tibetan, ix-xi
- pr̥thagjana* (ordinary worldling), 247
- pudgala* (living personality, person), 136, 191
- pudgalanairātmya* (identitylessness of persons), 191
- Pudgalavādin, 240n8
- pūyanadī* (the river of pus), 248, 248n20
- Q**
- Quine, Willard Van Orman, 38n4, 80, 82, 116n45, 116-118, 131, 252, 255n31
- on Japanese and Chinese classifiers, 116, 116n45, 117, 118

R

- rabbit's horn, 80n71, 99, 102, 111ff.
being gored by a rabbit's horn (*ri bong rwas phug pa*) 100-101n32, 113n42
- Randle, H.N, 49n21
- rang bzhin*. See *svabhāva*.
- rang bzhin gyis* (intrinsically, by its intrinsic nature, by its inherent nature), 71, 147, 216-217n14, 254n30. See also *svabhāvena, tha snyad du*.
- rang bzhin gyis grub pa* (established by its intrinsic nature), 147, 216-217n14, 254n30. See also *tha snyad du*.
- rang gi chos can*. See *svadharmin*.
- rang gi ngo bos grub pa* (established by its own nature), 191n23
- rang gi mtshan nyid kyis grub pa* (established by its own defining characteristics), 147, 187, 187n17, 189, 193n25, 196n35. See also *tha snyad du*, semantic circle.
- rang gi thun mon ma yin pa'i sdod lugs gyi ngos nas* (in terms of its own exclusive mode of being), 254n31
- rang ldog*. See *ldog pa*.
- rang mtshan*. See *svalakṣaṇa*.
- rang ngos nas grub pa* (established from its own side), 147, 254n31. See also semantic circle.
- rang rgyud* (autonomous reasoning). See *svatantra*.
- Śākya mchog ldan's and Tsong kha pa's views on *rang rgyud* contrasted, 192, 192n25
- rang rgyud kyī gtan tshigs* (autonomous logical reason). See *svatantrahetu*.
- rang rgyud pa*. See *Svātantrika*.
- rang rkyā thub pa'i rdzas yod du grub pa'i bdag* (the self that is established as a substantially existent, autonomous entity), 239, 240, 240n8
- rang rten chos can*, 159n43. See *svadharmin*.
- Rang stong Madhyamaka philosophy, 4, 4n3, 176, 177n5, 178, 180, 195, 196n35
- Ratié, Isabelle, 40n5, 43n11
- Ratnagotravibhāga* of Maitreya. See *Uttaratantra*.
- Ratnākaraśānti, 48n20, 63, 63n43, 176n4
- Ratnakīrti, 47, 63n43
- Ratnakūṭasūtra*, 224, 225
- Ratnāvalī* of Nāgārjuna, 190-191n22
- rDo rje gdong drug, 12n11
- rDo rje rgyal po, 22, 23, 23n22-23, 123n55, 290
- rdzas gcig* (same substance), 129
- rdzas su grub pa* (established substantially, established as being a substance), 147, 147n15
- REALLY, 71, 72. See also *bden par, satyatas, rang bzhin gyis, svabhāvena*, semantic circle.
- Rectification of Names, 137
- reductio ad absurdum*, 17, 94, 97, 97n26, 98
- reductionism, 239, 240n8, 241, 242
- redundant quantification, 106ff.
- referential opacity, 73-79
- Regamey, Constantin, 261, 262
- Renou, Louis, 292n3
- rGya dmar ba Byang chub grags, 84, 85n7

- rGyal tshab rje (=rGyal tshab Dar ma rin chen), 44, 45n16, 46, 119, 124, 142, 142n4, 143n5, 150n21, 151n23, 158-159n43, 163n56, 165n64
- Ri bo mDangs mkhan rin po che, 320
- ri bong rwa*. See rabbit's horn, *śāśa-viṣāṇa*.
- Rigs gter ba (followers of the *Tshad ma rigs gter* of Sa skya Paṇḍita), 66, 66n51, 67, 67n53
- Rigs gter gyi don gsal bar byed pa* of Go rams pa bSod nams seng ge, 52n25
- Rigs pa rjes su 'brang pa'i mdo sde pa (Sautrāntikas who follow reasoning), 38n3
- Rigs pa rjes su 'brang pa'i sems tsam pa (Yogācāras who follow reasoning), 38n3
- Rim lnga rab gsal* of Tsong kha pa, 186n14, 188n19
- rjes 'gro ldog khyab* lesson in *Collected Topics*, 108ff.
- rjes 'jug* (suffixes), 302, 337n23
- rNal 'byor spyod pa'i dbu ma (*Yogācāramadhyamaka), 176-177n4
- rNam brdzun dbu ma (*Alīkākāramadhyamaka), 177n4
- rNam bshad snyin po'i rgyan* of rGyal tshab rje, 143n4, 150n21, 165n64
- rNam gling Paṇ chen dKon mchog chos grags, 10, 361n51
- rNam 'grel spyi don* of Se ra rje btsun Chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 55n30, 67n53, 100n32, 151n23
- rNam 'grel thar lam gsal byed* of rGyal tshab rje, 46, 124, 124n56, 151n23, 158-159n43, 160n47
- rnam kun mchog ldan gyi stong pa nyid*. See *sarvākāravāropetaśūnyatā* s.v. *śūnyatā*.
- rnam par rtog pa bzhi* (four positions), 148n16
- rNam rig dbu ma (*Vijñaptimadhyamaka), 176n4
- rNying ma pa, 45n16, 142
- Robins, Dan, 116, 117n46
- Robinson, Richard H., 231n9
- Routley, Richard, 105n35
- rtag gcig rang dbang can gyi bdag* (the self that is permanent, one, and independent), 239, 240, 240n8
- rtags* (reason). See *linga*.
- rTags kyi 'jug pa* of Thon mi Sambhoṭa, 8, 12, 13, 13n13, 264, 270, 270n10, 279, 297, 299, 302, 303-306, 312, 313, 324, 325, 334, 341n25, 345, 358n46, 365
- the numbering of the verses, 9-10n9
verse twelve translated, 9, 9n8
- rTags 'jug dka' gnad snying po rabs gsal gyi 'grel pa mtha' dpyod dvangs shel me long* of dKar lebs drung yig Pad ma rdo rje, 318, 320, 320n37, 320n39-40, 321, 322n42
- rTags 'jug dka' gnad gsal ba'i me long* of dByangs can Grub pa'i rdo rje, 316n32
- rTags 'jug gi snying po don gsal* of dByangs can Grub pa'i rdo rje, 355n44
- rTags kyi 'jug pa'i dgongs 'grel* of Bra ti dge bshes Rin chen don grub, 327n3
- rtags ma grub* (The reason is not established!), 90, 91
- rTags rigs*, 3 9, 48n20, 49, 50n23, 52-57, 62, 84n2

- rTags rigs* of Glo bo mkhan chen bSod nams lhun grub, 50n23
- rTags rigs* of 'Jam dbyangs bzhad pa Ngag dbang brtson 'grus, 50n23
- rTags rigs* of Yongs 'dzin Phur bu lcog Byams pa tshul khriims rgya mtsho. *See Yongs 'dzin rtags rigs.*
- rtags gsal dang bcas pa'i thal 'gyur* (consequence that [only] has a reason and an implied property), 108n37
- rtags yang dag.* *See* good reasons.
- rtan 'brel.* *See* *pratītyasamutpāda.*
- rtog pa* (conceptual cognition), 151, 152n26, 162. *See also kalpanā.*
- rtsa ba'i dam bca'* (root position), 91, 92n20
- rTsa ba'i shes rab kyi dka' gnad chen po brgyad* of Tsong kha pa, 192n25, 254n30
- rTsa she ũk chen* of Tsong kha pa, 19, 71n61, 72, 204, 210, 211n8, 212n10, 213n11, 213n13, 216
- rtsod gzhi* (locus of debate), 160, 192n24
- Russell, Bertrand, 81n72, 99
- Rwa stod bsdus grwa* of 'Jam dbyangs mChog lha 'od zer, 41, 86, 87, 120n49
- S**
- Sa skya pa, 4, 4n3, 37, 44, 50n23, 52n25, 59ff., 61, 63, 65, 65n50, 66, 67, 68n54, 71, 71n61, 72, 73, 79, 81, 81n72, 82, 85, 85n7, 86, 87, 90, 92n23, 129, 175, 178, 302. *See also* similar instances, law of double negation elimination, Go rams pa bSod nams seng ge, Sa skya Paṇḍita, Sa-tradition.
- Sa skya Paṇḍita Kun dga' rgyal mtshan (Sa paṅ), 41, 43, 44, 44n13, 50n23, 61-63, 66n51, 67, 79, 85n7, 90n19
- Sacks, Oliver, 249
- saddhetu*, 2, 48, 55, 56. *See* good reasons.
- sādhana* (proof), 18, 95
- sādhanavākya* (statement of a proof), 89n16
- sādhya* (what is to be proved, the proposition to be proved), 159n43, 160n46, 209, 220, 221, 221n21, 222, 226
- sādhya dharmā* (the property to be proved), 58, 100n31, 150n22, 205n2,
- ṣaḍlakṣaṇahetu* (a reason that has the six characteristics), 60n37. *See also* Īśvarasena.
- Sākāravādin, 154n30
- sakarmaka-akarmaka* (transitive-intransitive, having or not having an object), 29, 284
- Śākya mchog ldan, 4, 4n3, 5, 44, 92n23, 129, 175-182, 186n14, 187n17, 188n19, 191n23, 192n25, 196n35, 196n37, 321
- Śākyabuddhi, 46, 47, 130, 223n2
- Śākyaśrībhadrā, 44, 44n14
- Śālistambasūtra*, 238-239n5
- sāmānya* (universals), 141n2
- sāmānyalakṣaṇa* (universals), 129
- samavyāpti* (equal pervasion; bidirectional pervasion), 74
- sambandha, pratibandha* (necessary connection), 58
- Samdhinirmocanasūtra*, 42n10, 135
- Sāmkhya, 19, 161n49, 207, 209, 214-216, 217n14, 218

- Samuels, Jonathan, 27n2
- saṃvṛtisatya*, *saṃvṛti* (customary truth, customarily existent things), 6, 80, 176, 184, 223-229, 232
different from *saṃvṛtisat* according to Tsong kha pa, 232
its three interpretations according to Candrakīrti, 227-229
- Samyutta Nikāya*, 225, 226, 229
- Śankaranandana, 46, 46n18, 47, 130, 150, 150n21
- Sanskrit verb tenses in Tibetan translations, 265, 266, 291, 292
- Śāntarakṣita, 3, 47, 99, 142, 142n3, 145n8, 146n11, 152n26, 154n30
- sapakṣa*. *See* similar instances.
- Sapir, Edward, 127n61, 131, 131n68, 134
- Sarvadharmāṅghrasvabhāvasiddhi* of Kamalaśīla, 148n16, 230, 230n8
- śaśaviṣāṇa*, 113. *See* rabbit's horn.
- satkāryavāda* (the position that effects exist latently at the time of their causes), 19, 215, 217n14
- Sa-tradition (*sa lugs*), 44, 85n9
- satya* (truth, reality), 237. *See* two truths.
- Satyadvayavibhaṅga* of Jñānagarbha, 146, 146n11, 147, 149
- Satyadvayavibhaṅgapañjikā* of Śāntarakṣita, 146n11, 148n16
- Satyadvayavibhaṅgavṛtti* of Jñānagarbha, 146n11
- satyatas* (truly, really), 71. *See also* semantic circle.
- Sautrāntika, 38n3, 154n30, 162n53, 240n8, 241
- sāvakāśavacana* (a statement that presents an occasion for a reply), 209n6, 212, 213, 220ff.
- Scherrer-Schaub, Cristina A., 187n15
- Schubert, Johannes, 320n40, 348n31, 352n38
- scientific image, 236, 237, 239, 242, 243n11, 246n18
- sDe bdun la 'jug pa'i sgo don gnyer yid kyi mun sel* attributed to Tsong kha pa, 80n71, 85
- sdod lugs* (the way they exist, mode of being), 152, 254n31
- sdud pa'i don* (the conjunctive sense), *sdud pa* (conjunction), 336n22, 351, 351n36, 354
- Sère, Bénédicte, 37n2
- Se ra rje btsun Chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 3, 60, 61, 124, 143, 145ff., 148n16
- Self (*ātman*), 143, 156,
- self (*bdag*) and other (*gzhan*) in indigenous Tibetan grammatical literature, 11, 11n11, 12ff., 31, 264, 265, 269, 270, 270-271n10, 272n11, 273n13, 274n14, 279-281, 285, 293, 296-298, 300, 302, 303, 310ff., 319, 322-364
- self (personal identity), 141, 239ff., 240n8
- selflessness (*anātman*), 147
- Seligman, Jeremy, 30
- Sellars, Wilfrid, 7, 32, 235ff.
- semantic circle of terms for the meta-physically real, 254-255n31
- semantic problems, 114ff.
- sems*. *See citta*.
- sems byung*. *See caitta*.
- Seyfort Ruegg, David, 4n3, 5n4, 17, 20, 21, 40, 40n6, 69n58, 177n4, 177n5, 216n14, 229

- sGom sde lha ram pa, 92n23
- sGom sde Nam mkha' rgyal mtshan, 204, 212n10, 221
- sGom sde tshig mdzod chen mo of sGom sde lha ram pa, 92-93n23
- sgro 'dogs (superimposition), 155n34, 178, 178n7
- sgrub byed. See *sādhana*.
- sgrub byed mi 'phen pa'i thal 'gyur (consequences that do not imply a proof), 97. See consequences.
- sgrub byed 'phen pa'i thal 'gyur (consequences that imply a proof), 95. See consequences.
- sgrub ngag (statement of a proof). See *sādhanavākya*.
- shes bya chos can (Take knowable thing as the subject.), 107, 108
- shes bya sgog gtun ma (Knowable thing and garlic ground by pestle and mortar!), 92n23
- shes bya sgog rdzog (Knowable thing and crushed garlic!), 92-94, 92-93n23
- shes 'dod chos can skyon med / shes 'dod chos can (faultless subject of enquiry), 50, 52, 52n25, 75, 76. See *jijñāsītadharmin*.
- shing tsam (mere tree), 129
- shugs las rtogs pa (indirectly understood), 326
- Si tu Paṅ chen Chos kyi 'byung gnas, 9n8, 10, 10n9, 11n11, 12, 12n11, 12n13, 13, 14, 15n15, 16, 16n17, 269ff., 280ff., 292, 296, 298, 302n2, 303, 306, 308, 311, 312, 314, 316, 319, 320, 320n40, 321, 322, 324, 328n5, 329n7, 334n18, 335n19, 335n20, 341n25, 345n28, 346, 346n28, 346n29, 347n29, 350, 350n34, 352n38, 353n39, 355n44, 358, 358n46, 361-362n51
- Si tu 'i zhal lung of dNgul chu Dharmabhadra, 281, 315n32, 355n44
- Siderits, Mark, 30, 43n11, 239n7, 250, 252
- siddhāntavirodha (a contradiction with philosophical tenets), 17, 20, 209, 210, 220ff.
- Sierksma, F., 86n12
- Silk, Jonathan, 40n5
- similar instances (*sapakṣa*), 48n20, 49, 51, 54n28, 59, 61-68
- as interpreted by Antaryvāptivādins, 48n20, 63, 67
- as interpreted by the dGe lugs pa *rTags rigs* and *Pramāṇavārttika* commentaries, 62, 63, 66n51, 67
- as interpreted by the Sa skya pa Rigs gter ba, 62, 63, 65-68
- for Dignāga, 65-67
- taken etymologically (*mtshun phyogs la sgra bshad du 'jug pa*), 66n51
- taken subjectively (*blo ngor gnas pa'i mtshun phyogs*), 66
- the orthodox/unorthodox scenarios, 62-66
- as they are in reality (*don la gnas pa'i mtshun phyogs*), 66
- singular quantification, 105-107
- sKabs dang po'i spyi don of Se ra rje btsun Chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 143, 143n4, 144
- Tibetan text, 165-169
- translation, 145-156
- sKal bzang 'gyur med, 24, 24n25, 290, 316, 316n33, 323, 327n3, 356n44

- sKal ldan rgyal po. *See* Bhavyarāja.
- sKal ldan yid kyi pad ma 'byed pa'i snang ba'i mdzod* of A lag sha Ngag dbang bstan dar, 26n26, 285, 285n5, 299, 341n25, 350n34, 354n42, 358-359n48
- skandha* (aggregate), 141, 240n8
- Smith, E. Gene, 144
- Smra sgo* of Smṛtijñānakīrti, 302, 303
- sna tshogs gnyis med pa* (consciousness and the manifold aspects being non-dual), 154n30
- snang ba* (appearance, appear), 79n70, 152n26, 162, 192-193n25, 204, 235, 238, 281, 333. *See also* ābhāsa.
- snang gzhi* (the image's locus), 163
- sngags kyi dbu ma* (tantric Philosophy of the Middle), 184
- sngon 'jug* (prefixes), 9n8, 272n11, 274n14, 285n5, 302, 310, 315n31-32, 335, 342n26, 346n29, 352n38, 353n39, 355-356n44, 359n48
- Ślokavārttika* of Kumāriḷa, 73
- spoken Tibetan, 8n6, 262, 286n6, 288
- spros bral*. *See* niṣprapañca.
- spyi dngos po ba* (real universals), 129, 130
- spyi gtso bo*. *See* pradhāna.
- spyir dus gsum gyi 'jog tshul* (the way to classify the three times generally). *See* three times.
- spyi mtshan*. *See* sāmānyalakṣaṇa.
- śrāvaṇatva* (audibility), 57
- Staal, J.F., 58n34
- sTag tshang lo tsā ba Shes rab rin chen, 6, 6n5, 45n16
- Stcherbatsky, T., 43n11, 86, 88, 203, 208, 208n5, 229, 240n8
- Steinkellner, Ernst, 40n5, 42n10, 43n11, 52n25, 59n36, 60n37, 61n39, 135n72, 261n1
- Stoddard, Heather, 9n8, 25n26, 29, 275-277, 282ff., 316
- Stoltz, Jonathan, 43n12, 78, 79n69, 84n4, 85n6, 87n14
- sTong thun chen mo* of mKhas grub rje, 71n61, 184n11, 193n25, 204, 214n13
- stong pa*. *See* sūnya.
- stong pa nyid*. *See* sūnyatā.
- stong pa nyid stong pa nyid*. *See* sūnyatāsūnyatā s.v. sūnyatā.
- Strasser, Christian and G. Aldo Antonelli, 65n47
- Strawson, P.F., 255n31
- stuff-semantics, 128n63, 130n67, 131
- Śubhagupta, 42, 42n10
- substitutivity of identicals for identicals *salva veritate* (Leibniz's law), 73-79
- Sum cu pa* of Thon mi Sambhoṭa, 8, 10n9, 279, 292, 302, 304, 312, 313, 325, 351n36, 358n46
- Sum cu pa dang rtags kyi 'jug pa'i mchan 'grel* of gSer tog Blo bzang tshul khriṃs rgya mtsho. *See* *Sum rtags*, s.v., *gSer tog sum rtags*.
- Sum rtags* (indigenous Tibetan grammatico-linguistic tradition, Tibetan grammatico-linguistic literature), 1, 7, 8, 13n14, 16, 16n17, 31, 285, 292, 299, 300, 302-313, 309n15, 310n19, 314n29, 317, 320n40, 324, 327n3, 341n25, 358n48
- gSer tog sum rtags*, 9n8, 291ff., 292n4, 325ff., 327n3, 351n36

- lCang skya sum rtags*, 348n31, 352n38
- Ngag dbang bstan dar sum rtags*. See *A lag sha Ngag dbang bstan dar*.
- rNam gling sum rtags*, 361n51, 362n51
- Si tu sum rtags*. See *Si tu Paṅ chen*.
- Zha lu sum rtags*, 348n31, 353n40. See *Zha lu lo tsā ba Chos skyong bzang po*.
- sun* 'byin pa'i thal 'gyur ([purely] refuting consequences), 96, 97
- śūnya* (empty), 141, 195n33, 253,
- śūnyatā* (emptiness), 32, 53, 141, 145n9, 148n16, 207, 255, 255n32, 305, 307. See also *bdag med* (selflessness), four/five logical reasons proving emptiness.
- emptiness endowed with all excellences (*sarvākāravāropetaśūnyatā*), 184
- emptiness consisting in annihilation (*ucchedaśūnyatā*), 186, 186n14
- emptiness of emptiness (*śūnyatā-śūnyatā*), 189, 189-190n21
- insentient emptiness (*jaḍaśūnyatā*), 186, 186n14
- superficial emptiness (*thal byung ba'i stong pa nyid*) 186
- śūnyavāda* (philosophy of emptiness), 69n58.
- svabhāva* (intrinsic nature), 7, 59, 141, 228, 235
- svabhāvena* (intrinsically, by its intrinsic nature), 71, 254n31. See also semantic circle.
- svabhāvapratibandha* (natural connection), 58, 59n36, 61, 94, 102, 112, 114
- as causality (*tadutpatti*), 58, 114
- as same nature (*tādātmya*), 58, 114
- svadharmin* (the proponent's own subject, the actual subject), 159, 159n43, 159n44
- svalakṣaṇa* (particular, own characteristics), 79, 124, 129, 163n5, 306
- svārthānumāna* (inference-for-oneself), 205n2, 223n2
- svatantra*, *svatantrānumana*, *svatantrahetu* (autonomous reasoning; autonomous inference; autonomous reason), 96, 156, 156n38, 157, 158, 160, 161, 161n50, 162, 207
- Svātantrika*, 3, 5, 5n4, 99, 142, 145n8, 147n15, 148n16, 150n21, 152n26, 176n4, 183, 187n17, 192, 206, 230, 230n7, 231, 232, 232n13, 233n14, 254n30
- Sybesma, Rint, 117, 117n46
- T**
- Tachikawa, Musashi, 46n17
- Tanaka, Koji, 30, 253n29
- Tantra/Tantric, 4, 5, 15, 180, 184, 188, 188n19, 261n1, 303, 304-306, 306n9, 307, 308, 308n14, 309, 309n15, 309n18, 310
- tathāgatagarbha* (buddha-nature), 177n5
- tattva* (reality), 145n9
- tattvatas* (in reality), 150
- Tattvasaṃgraha* of Śāntarakṣita, 47
- Tattvasaṃgrahapañjikā* of Kamalaśīla, 47
- tertium non datur*, 155n34
- Tanji, Teruyoshi, 203
- Tauscher, Helmut, 191n21

- tha dad pa* (differentiated verbs; transitive verbs), *tha mi dad pa* (undifferentiated verbs; intransitive verbs), 11, 14, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25-26n26, 29, 32, 279ff., 332n15. *See* transitive-intransitive contrast in Tibetan. Dharmabhadra's exclusion of *tha mi dad pa* verbs from self and other, 281
Si tu's critique of his predecessors' misunderstandings, 280
use of the terms in the Tibetan-Chinese Dictionary, 22, 23, 23n23, 24, 26, 290ff.
- tha snyad du* (customarily), 150n21, 151n24, 152n25, 157-158n41, 187n17, 189, 191n23, 206n3
customarily established by its intrinsic nature (*tha snyad du rang bzhin gyis grub pa*), 147, 254n30
customarily established by its defining characteristics (*tha snyad du rang gi mtshan nyid kyis grub pa*), 192n25
- thal bzlog* (contraposition of a consequence). *See* *prasaṅgaviparyaya*.
- Thal bzlog gi dka' ba'i gnas* of sGom sde Nam mkha' rgyal mtshan, 204
- thal bzlog gi rnam bzhag* (lesson on consequences and contrapositions), 6
- thal 'gyur*. *See* consequences (*prasaṅga*).
- thal 'gyur ba*. *See* Prāsaṅgika.
- Thal 'gyur gyi 'phreng ba ngag gi dbang po'i rdo rje* of Śākya mchog ldan, 92n23
- thal 'gyur khyab pa sgo bryad* (eight doors of pervasion of a consequence), 109, 110. *See* *khyab pa rnal ma bzhi; khyab pa phyin ci log bzhi*.
- thal 'gyur la lan gsum* (three ways only to reply to a consequence), 90, 91, 90n19
- thal 'gyur yang dag* (good consequence), 90
- thal ngag su bkod pa* (what is presented as a statement that something follows from something else), 89, 90
- thal-phyir* (logic of consequences, it follows that... because...), 86
- The Cowherds, 229
- The Yakherds, 6n5
- theoretical reason, 242, 242n10
- Theravāda, 241
- thing-done. *See* *bya ba'i las* (act-qua-thing-done).
- Thomasson, Amie L., 250n25, 255n31
- Thon mi Sambhoṭa, 11, 11n11, 12, 13, 13n13, 15, 16, 270, 270n10, 272n11, 279, 280, 292, 298, 302, 334, 336n22, 339, 345n28, 346, 346n28, 347n29, 348n31, 350, 350n34, 351n36, 352n38, 353, 353n40, 354, 354-356n44, 357, 358, 358n46, 359n48, 361, 361n51, 363
- Thonden, Losang, 22n21
- three times, three tenses (*dus gsum*), 12, 14, 15, 273n12-13, 291, 292, 296, 297, 300, 321-322, 329, 333, 335, 346, 349, 350n34, 352n38, 353n39, 355-356n44, 358-359n48
- the three times in terms of actions, agents, and objects (*bya byed las gsum ky'i dus gsum*), 15, 292, 294, 295, 300, 330, 331n11
- the way to classify the three times generally (*spyir dus gsum ky'i 'jog tshul*), 15, 292, 295, 300, 330, 331n11

- the temporally future (*dus kyi dus ma 'ongs pa*) 15, 295-299, 331, 331n11, 339, 341, 341n25, 345, 346n28, 349, 365
- the temporally past (*dus kyi dus 'das pa*), 295, 296, 331, 339, 342
- the temporally present (*dus kyi dus da lta ba*), 295-298, 331, 339, 345, 345n28, 364
- thun mong ma yin pa'i ma nges pa'i gtan tshigs*. See *asādhāraṇānikāntikahetu*.
- Thu'u bkwan Blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, 176, 176n3, 178, 179
- tisrah sarvajñatāḥ* (three omnisciences), 142n4, 143n5, 156
- Tomabechi, Tōru, 4, 5, 32, 73n64, 175ff., 249n22
- Tournadre, Nicolas, ix, 8n6, 9n8, 25n26, 26n26, 29, 262ff., 282ff., 290, 316
- on the absence of active-passive diathesis in Tibetan, 262ff., 275-277
- on transitivity in Tibetan, 282ff.
- trairūpya*. See triple characterization.
- transcendental arguments, 245, 245n16
- transitive-intransitive contrast in Tibetan, 8, 8n6, 11, 12, 14, 16, 21, 22, 23n23, 24, 24n24, 25, 25n26, 26, 26n26, 27-29, 31, 32, 262, 271n10, 279ff., 332-333n15, 335n19, 340n24, 354n42, 355-357n44. See also *tha dad pa*.
- gradations of transitivity, 26, 286n6, 287n7, 288ff.
- Tibetan view of transitivity as developed by LaPolla *et al*, 27ff., 30
- Trilocana, 48
- triple characterization, triple characteristic, triply characterized reason 2, 19, 48-51, 56-59, 64, 75, 88, 96, 99
- trirūpahetu*. See triply characterized reason.
- tropes, 135, 136, 136n75
- truth-bearers, 237
- truth claims, 7, 72, 73, 97, 231, 232, 255
- truth conservation, 61, 65n50, 67
- Tshad bsdus* attributed to Klong chen Rab 'byams pa, 84, 85
- tshad ma* (source of knowledge). See *pramāṇa*.
- Tshad ma* (theory of sources of knowledge), 38-41, 38n3, *passim*. See *Pramāṇa*.
- Tshad ma rnam 'grel sogs gtan tshigs rig pa las byung ba'i ming gi rnam grangs* of Klong rdol bla ma, 84
- Tshad ma rigs rgyan* of dGe 'dun grub pa, 41
- Tshad ma rigs gter* (= *Rigs gter*) of Sa skya Paṇḍita, 41, 50n23, 61, 62, 63, 67, 67n53, 79, 79n70, 85
- Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel* of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge, 84, 84n4
- Tshad ma'i brjed byang chen mo* of Tsong kha pa, 123, 123n54
- Tshad ma'i bsdus pa*, 43, 45n16, 83-85, 85n7
- tshad ma'i skyes bu* (a person who is a standard; an authoritative person), 40n5
- tshar gcod kyi gnas*. See *nigrahasthāna*
- Tshe rdor, 335n19
- tshig gi sgrib g.yog* (verbal obfuscation), 129

- tshig grogs* (auxiliaries). *See* auxiliaries.
- tshogs don* (composite proposition), 159
- Tsong kha pa Blo bzang grags pa, 4-6, 17-19, 19n19, 20, 21, 32, 44, 71n61, 72, 80n71, 85, 97n27, 119, 122-124, 135, 142n4, 143-145, 145n8, 147, 150n21, 152n25, 152n26, 156ff., 163n56, 180, 186n14, 187ff., 191n23, 192n25, 196n35, 203ff., 252, 253, 254n30
- Tucci, Giuseppe, 46n17
- twelve sorts of persons who are agents (*byed pa 'i skyes bu*), 191, 191n23
- two truths, 32, 153n27, 227, 237, 237n3, 242, 246, 247, 256
- U**
- ultra-intensions, 76, 79, 248
- untranslatability, 119, 132-134
- Uttaratantra* of Maitreya, 177n5, 183, 183n9, 184, 184n11
- V**
- Vācaspatimiśra, 48
- vāda* (debate), 83
- Vādanyāya* of Dharmakīrti, 83, 192n24
- Vaibhāṣika, 241
- Vaiśeṣika, 160, 160n46, 130
- vajrakaṇahetu* (diamond splinters reason), 147
- van Benthem, Johan, 30, 58n35
- van der Kuijp, Leonard, 42, 42n8, 43n12, 45n16, 84n4, 85n6-7, 157n40, 175, 175n2, 177n4, 180n8, 196n37
- van Fraassen, Bas C., 235, 242, 246
- Van Norden, Brian, 3n1
- vandhyāputra* (barren woman's son), 113
- vastu* (real entities, bases), 80, 142n4, 150, 254n31
- vastubalapravrīta* (operating due to real entities), 59
- vastujñāna* (knowledge of the bases), 142n4
- Vasubandhu, 38n3, 90n18, 122n52, 141, 240, 240n8, 248
- Verhagen, Pieter, 8n7, 29n1, 301ff.
on *bdag*, *gzhan*, and *dnegos po*, 310ff.
on Tantric influences upon the *Sumcu pa* and *rTags kyi 'jug pa*, 304ff.
on the lost corpus of texts attributed to Thon mi Sambhoṭa, 358n46
- Vibhūticandra, 44n14, 233n14
- vicāra* (analysis), 254
- vidhi* (positive phenomenon, affirmation), 71
- Vigrahavyāvartanī* of Nāgārjuna, 205n2, 216, 216n14
- Vijñānavādin, 187
- Vimalakīrtinirdeśasūtra*, 307
- Vimalaprabhā* of Kalkin Śrīpuṇḍarīka, 186n14
- Viṃśatikā* of Vasubandhu, 141n2, 248
- Vinītadeva, 42, 42n10
- vipakṣa* (dissimilar instance), 49, 61, 62, 66, 67, 67n53. *See also* similar instances (*sapakṣa*).
- viparītārtha* (contrapositive), 209, 210, 212, 217, 219n19, 221, 222
- viprayuktasaṃskāra* (a non-associated conditioned thing), 121-122n52
- virodha* (contradiction), 70
- viśaya* (object), 79, 80ff., 247
- Vollmann, Ralf, 9n8, 21

- voluntary and involuntary actions in Tibetan, 22-25. *See also* *bya tshig rang dbang can*, *bya tshig gzhan dbang can*.
- the contrast with transitive and intransitive, 21-24
- Vose, Kevin, 6n4, 249n22
- vyabhicāra* (deviance, deviant reasons), 60, 60n38
- Vyākaraṇa (Sanskrit grammatical exegesis and its literature), 15, 50n24, 279, 301-304, 308n14, 313, 317, 320, 324, 328n5
- vyāpya* (the property that is pervaded, the antecedent), 111, 112, 113,
- vyāpaka* (the property that is the pervader, the consequent), 111, 112
- vyāpti* (pervasion, entailment), 50n24, 74, 90, 106, 111, 150, 150n22, 214, 216, 341n25
- vyatireka* (co-absence), 50n24
- vyatirekavyāpti* (negative pervasion; contraposition), 50n24, 51, 51n24, 98, 108, 150n22, 156n38
- vyavahāra* (custom, usage, convention, transaction), 162, 162n54, 244, 228, 244n13
- vyavahārasat* (customary existents), 238
- vyāvṛtti* (exclusion; isolate; concept), 76, 126, 137n77, 194, 194n31, 306
- W**
- Watanabe, Shigeaki, 60n37
- Watanabe, Toshikazu, 20
- white horse argument, 135-137
- Whorf, Benjamin Lee, 115, 127n61, 131, 131n68, 132, 134, 252n28
- Williams, Paul, 175n2, 233n14, 254n30
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 256
- X**
- Xuanzang, 46, 65, 135
- Y**
- Yamaguchi, Susumu, 203
- yang dag tu*. *See tattvatas*.
- yi tou niu* 一頭牛 (one cow, one head of cattle), 116. *See* Quine.
- yin pa srid pa* (admit instances), 137
- Yogācāra philosophy and philosophers, 4, 4n3, 5, 5n4, 38n3, 145n8, 176n4, 231n9, 241
- Yongs 'dzin blo rigs*, 80n71
- Yongs 'dzin bsdus grwa* of Yongs 'dzin Phur bu ldog Byams pa tshul khriims rgya mtsho, 77, 77n67, 87, 92, 108n37, 109, 120n50, 135, 137n78
- Yongs 'dzin Phur bu ldog Byams pa tshul khriims rgya mtsho, 49-52, 52n25, 58, 77, 86
- Yongs 'dzin rtags rigs*, 49, 50-54, 58
- Yoshimizu, Chizuko, 5n4, 186n14, 188n19
- Yotsuya, Kodo, 205n2
- Yuan ce 圓測, 135
- yul*. *See viśaya*.
- yuganaddha* (union), 184, 188n19
- Z**
- Zab don khyad par nyer gcig pa* of Jo nang Tāranātha, 177, 177n5, 178
- Zeisler, Bettina, 8n6, 10n9, 26n26, 327n3
- Zha lu lo tsā ba Chos skyong bzang po, 10, 13n14, 348n31, 352n38, 353n40

- his interpretation of *bya ba bsgrub* in Thon mi's verse twelve, 352n38
 use of *don gyis thob pa*, 353n40
- Zhang thang sag pa, 176, 180
- Zhang Yisun, 22, 53n27, 290
- zhen* 真, *shi* 實, *shi you* 實有 (truly, substantially), 254n31. *See* semantic circle of terms for the metaphysically real.
- zla gcig zla gnyis su snang ba'i dbang shes* (a sense perception to which one moon appears as two moons), 235
- zung 'jug*. *See* *yuganaddha*. *See also* *bde stong zung 'jug*.
- Zustandspassiv-Vorgangspassiv*, 329n6