

## Israeli Scholars since 1970 and the Study of the European Presence in Palestine in the Nineteenth Century (until World War I): State of the Art

During the past fifteen years there has been an increase in the number of young scholars, mainly in Europe, who are interested in what has been called the “European Presence in Palestine 1799–1948,” and who have devoted their MA and PhD theses, as well as further studies, to various themes within this field. These scholars, many of them in the German-speaking world, usually have a background in history and/or theology. Good examples are the PhD thesis, the *Habilitation* thesis, and at least one MA thesis that have been devoted, between 1997 and 2003, to the famous 1898 voyage to the Orient of Wilhelm II.<sup>1</sup> Another field that has aroused increasing interest is Christian missionary activity, as part of the general Occidental penetration of the East, and its impact on the country, as well as its inhabitants. These studies do not tend to limit themselves solely to the Ottoman period, but include developments during the twentieth century, as well. The trend is away from the former historical-geographical positivistic fact-finding that led to the reconstruction of natural and cultural landscapes in a certain space and within a defined time. The new work instead examines the long-term sociological influences of an external element on the existing local landscape and focuses mainly on the society or societies living within it.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Jan Stefan RICHTER, *Die Orientreise Kaiser Wilhelms II. 1898. Eine Studie zur deutschen Außenpolitik an der Wende zum 20. Jahrhundert* (Studien zur Geschichtsforschung der Neuzeit 9, Hamburg 1997); Thomas Hartmut BENNER, *Die Strahlen der Krone. Die religiöse Dimension des Kaisertums unter Wilhelm II. vor dem Hintergrund der Orientreise 1898* (Marburg 2001); Ina ROSENRETER, *Wilhelm der Protettor. Religionspolitik, Großmachtinteresse und Selbstinszenierung auf des Kaisers Orientreise 1898* (MA Thesis Hamburg 2003).

<sup>2</sup> To mention some examples: the papers included in Anthony O'MAHONY (ed.), *The Christian Communities of Jerusalem and the Holy Land. Studies in History, Religion and Politics* (Cardiff 2003); Chantal VERDEIL, *Travailler à la renaissance de l'Orient Chrétien. Les missions Latines en Syrie (1830–1945)*, in: *Proche-Orient Chrétien* 51 (2001) 267–316; Roland LÖFFLER, *Die Gemeinden des Jerusalemvereins in Palästina im Kontext des kirchlichen und politischen Zeitgeschehens in der Mandatszeit*, in: Almut NOTHNAGLE, Hans-Jürgen ABROMEIT, Frank FOERSTER (eds.), *Seht, wir gehen hinauf nach Jerusalem. Festschrift zum 150jährigen Jubiläum von Talitha Kumi und des Jerusalemvereins* (Leipzig 2001) 185–212;

These scholars form a new generation, following and continuing the tradition of an earlier one, mainly historians of the 1960s up to the early 1980s, who devoted special attention to the study of the European presence and European intervention in the countries bordering the eastern shores of the Mediterranean. Some of them devoted specific studies to Palestine, usually defined by its Mandatory borders, although all of these studies dealt with the area during the last 120 years of the Ottoman regime. Such scholars included Helmut Mejcher, Alexander Schölch, Abdul Latif Tibawi, Abdel-Raouf Sinno, and Derek Hopwood. Some of them are still publishing and continue to educate the scholars of the new generation. Most of their work concerning the Europeans in late-Ottoman Palestine has been dedicated to wider, more general perspectives within this field of research.<sup>3</sup>

Israelis comprise the second group of scholars who have taken a great deal of scientific interest in the European (and American) Christian presence in Palestine during the above-mentioned period. The physical remains of this presence, spread throughout the country, form an integral part of Israel's cultural landscape. These, together with surviving names such as "the German Colony," "the American Colony," "the Greek Colony," "the Russian Compound," "the Italian Hospital," "Namsawi" (= Austrian) neighborhood in Nazareth, "the Scottish Hospital" (in Tiberias), and many more of the same, have attracted numerous visitors as well as scholars whose aim has been to study their background, origin, history, and influence on the cultural landscape as well as on the local population. The huge interest that the Israeli public devotes

---

Roland LÖFFLER, Nationale und kessionale Identitätsbildungsprozesse in den arabisch-lutherischen und arabisch-anglikanischen Gemeinden Palästinas während der Mandatszeit, in: Almut NOTHNAGLE, Andreas FELDTKELLER (eds.), *Mission im Konfliktfeld von Islam, Judentum und Christentum. Eine Bestandsaufnahme zum 150jährigen Jubiläum des Jerusalemvereins* (Frankfurt 2003) 71–103; and most recently: Roland LÖFFLER, *Protestanten in Palästina. Religionspolitik, Sozialer Protestantismus und Mission in den deutschen evangelischen und anglikanischen Institutionen des heiligen Landes 1917–1939* (Konfession und Gesellschaft 37, Stuttgart 2008); Markus KIRCHHOFF, *Text zu Land. Palästina im wissenschaftlichen Diskurs 1865–1920* (Schriften des Simon-Dubnow-Instituts 5, Göttingen 2005).

<sup>3</sup> Abdul Latif TIBAWI, *British Interests in Palestine 1800–1901. A Study of Religious and Educational Enterprise* (London 1961); Abdul Latif TIBAWI, *American Interests in Syria 1800–1901. A Study of Educational, Literary and Religious Work* (Oxford 1966); Derek HOPWOOD, *The Russian Presence in Syria and Palestine, 1843–1914* (Oxford 1969); Helmut MEJCHER, Alexander SCHÖLCH (eds.), *Die Palästina-Frage 1917–1948* (Paderborn 1981); Abdel-Raouf SINNO, *Deutsche Interessen in Syrien und Palästina 1841–1898. Aktivitäten religiöser Institutionen, wirtschaftliche und politische Einflüsse* (Studien zum modernen islamischen Orient 3, Berlin 1982); Alexander SCHÖLCH, *Palestine in Transformation 1856–1882. Studies in Social, Economic and Political Development*, translated by William C. Young and Michael C. Gerrity (Washington, D. C. 1993).

to the theme has been demonstrated, for example, in the fact that the best-visited exhibition in the Eretz Israel Museum in Tel-Aviv for many years was the “Chronicle of a Utopia,” dedicated to “the Templers in the Holy Land, 1868–1948.”

The aim of this paper is to make two similar generations of Israeli scholars known, scholars who devoted their research, or at least part of it, to this European penetration. The main argument here concerns the lack of cooperation between European and Israeli scholars working on the same topic, and the lack of mutual acknowledgement, caused mostly, but not solely, by the obvious language barrier. In addition, the paper will try to establish the reasons for the decreasing interest that young Israeli scholars have shown for this topic during the last fifteen years. Naturally, such a paper must include an extensive bibliography.

Mordechai Eliav, professor emeritus and historian of the Jewish communities in Eretz Israel in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, devoted much of his time to intensive studies of the European consulates in nineteenth-century Jerusalem and their attitude towards the Jewish population.<sup>4</sup> He is an outstanding representative of the scholars, who, while working on other subjects, studied certain elements of European activity. Other leading Israeli historians in this context include Shimon Shamir, Israel Bartal, and Benjamin Zeev Kedar.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>4</sup> Mordechai ELIAV, The German Consulate in Jerusalem and the Jews in Jerusalem in the 19th Century, in: *Zionism 1* (1970) 57–83 [Hebrew]; Mordechai ELIAV, Die Juden Palästinas in der deutschen Politik. Dokumente aus dem Archiv des Deutschen Konsulats in Jerusalem, 1842–1914 (Jerusalem 1973); Mordechai ELIAV, An Annotated Listing of Foreign Consuls in Jerusalem at the End of the Ottoman Period, in: *Cathedra* 28 (June 1983) 161–176 [Hebrew]; Mordechai ELIAV, Britain and the Holy Land 1838–1914. Selected Documents from the British Consulate in Jerusalem (Jerusalem 1997); Mordechai ELIAV in collaboration with Barbara HAIDER (eds.), Österreich und das Heilige Land. Ausgewählte Konsulatsdokumente aus Jerusalem 1849–1917 (Fontes rerum Austriacarum: Österreichische Geschichtsquellen, 2. Abteilung: Diplomataria et Acta, vol. 91, Wien 2000).

<sup>5</sup> Shimon SHAMIR, The Impact of Western Ideas on Traditional Society in Ottoman Palestine, in: Moshe MA’OZ (ed.), *Studies on Palestine During the Ottoman Period* (Jerusalem 1975) 507–514; Shimon SHAMIR, The Beginning of Modern Times in the History of Palestine, in: *Cathedra* 40 (July 1986) 138–158 [Hebrew]; Israel BARTAL, Further Evidence on Contacts between Protestant Missionaries and *Kolel Perusim* in Jerusalem in the 1820s, in: *Cathedra* 28 (June 1983) 158–160 [Hebrew]; Benjamin Zeev KEDAR, The Changing Land Between the Jordan and the Sea: Aerial Photographs from 1917 to the Present (Jerusalem 1999); between Benjamin Zeev KEDAR, From Religious Messianism to Political Messianism. On the History of the German Templers, in: *CHRONICLE OF A UTOPIA. The Templers in the Holy Land, 1868–1948* (Tel Aviv 2006) 10–25.

However, the intention of this paper is to discuss scholars who, unlike Eliav, concentrated their studies primarily on the activity, influence, and contribution of Europeans in Eretz Israel and/or Palestine and/or the Holy Land. Each scholar used the geographical labels that best fit his perceptions and goals. Two Israeli researchers were responsible for what Jacob Barnai termed as “intensive liberty from the childhood diseases of narrow and tendentious nationalistic historiography. [...] Modern critical research is no longer afraid of dealing with the history of other people and other religions in Eretz-Israel.”<sup>6</sup> Although one of them is a historian and the second a geographer, they both arrived, independently but almost simultaneously, at the conclusions that led them to devote their studies to the European presence. In his MA thesis dealing with the history of Haifa during the Ottoman period, first published in 1969 and republished already in its fourth edition, the late Alex Carmel (1931–2002), who studied Middle Eastern history, encountered two elements that were to become leading motifs in his more than forty years of academic research. The first of these was the importance of published descriptions by pilgrims and travelers as sources for the study of Palestine/Eretz Israel, and the second was the role of the German Templers, a sect rarely studied, as a leading factor in the development of Haifa.<sup>7</sup>

Carmel’s great contribution was in the publication in 1970 of his doctoral thesis. For the first time, the significance of the Templers for the history of Palestine and their role in the building and development of the country, beginning with their settlement in 1868 in Haifa, was explained to the interested Israeli reader.<sup>8</sup> Many of Carmel’s publications appeared in the 1970s and 1980s, all of them of fundamental importance for the study of European penetration of Palestine in the nineteenth century. A general description of the phenomenon, including a section devoted to each “Power,” first appeared in Hebrew in 1983,

---

<sup>6</sup> Jacob BARNAI, *Historiography and Nationalism. Trends in the Research of Palestine and its Jewish Yishuv (634–1881)* (The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, The Ben-Zion Dinur Institute for Research in Jewish History, Texts and Studies, Jerusalem 1995) 59 [Hebrew].

<sup>7</sup> Alex CARMEL, *The History of Haifa under Turkish Rule* (Haifa 2002, 1st ed. 1969) 7–9 [Hebrew]. In German: Alex CARMEL, *Geschichte Haifas in der türkischen Zeit 1516–1918* (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins, Wiesbaden 1975). An Arabic version had been published in 1979.

<sup>8</sup> Alex CARMEL, *Hityashvut Ha’germanim Be’eretz-Israel Beshalhey Hatkufa Ha’otmanit. Ba’ayoteiha Hamdiniot Vehabein-le’umiot* (Jerusalem 1973, no English title). The German version, published in the same year: Alex CARMEL, *Die Siedlungen der württembergischen Templer in Palästina 1868–1918. Ihre lokalpolitischen und internationalen Probleme*, translated by Pinchas Leshem (Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für geschichtliche Landeskunde in Baden-Württemberg, Reihe B, Bd. 77, Stuttgart 1973).

and two years later in English.<sup>9</sup> One should note that these summaries still serve as “text-books” in relevant academic courses.

In 1975, he published his important paper dealing with the German *Palästina-politik*, and explained the importance of the periodical of the *Tempelgesellschaft*, *Die Süddeutsche Warte* (first published in 1846, beginning in 1877 entitled *Die Warte des Tempels*), as a source for “Eretz Israel Studies,” a developing field in Israeli universities and high schools. Three years later, he published the first volume of collected reports concerning the Holy Land, most of them from the *Warte*. The second volume appeared in 1983.<sup>10</sup> One could add here a long list of his studies concerning German Protestant and Templar activity in Palestine, including his volume *Christen als Pioniere* on German settlers and activists such as Conrad Schick, Theodor Fliedner and Christian Friedrich Spittler, German communities, and similar topics.<sup>11</sup> Everyone involved in this field of research should be aware of, use, and cite Carmel’s many contributions to the field.<sup>12</sup> Nearly all of his studies dealt with the German presence in Palestine with the exception of one which examined Russian activ-

<sup>9</sup> Alex CARMEL, Competition, Penetration, and Presence. Christian Activity and its Influence in Eretz-Israel, in: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Israel BARTAL (eds.), *The End of the Ottoman Period (1799–1917)* (History of Eretz Israel 8, Jerusalem 1983) 109–151 [Hebrew]; Alex CARMEL, The Activities of the European Powers in Palestine, in: *Asian and African Studies 19/1* (1985) 43–91.

<sup>10</sup> Alex CARMEL, Die deutsche Palästina-politik 1871–1914, in: *Jahrbuch des Instituts für deutsche Geschichte 4* (1975) 205–255; Alex CARMEL, The Weekly *Die Süddeutsche Warte* – An Unexploited Source for XIXth Century Palestine, in: *Proceedings of the Sixth World Congress of Jewish Studies 2* (Jerusalem 1975) 343–351 [Hebrew]; Alex CARMEL, Palästina-Chronik 1853 bis 1882. Deutsche Zeitungsberichte vom Krimkrieg bis zur ersten jüdischen Einwanderungswelle (Ulm 1978); Alex CARMEL, Palästina-Chronik 1883 bis 1914. Deutsche Zeitungsberichte von der ersten jüdischen Einwanderungswelle bis zum Ersten Weltkrieg (Ulm 1983).

<sup>11</sup> Alex CARMEL, *Christen als Pioniere im Heiligen Land. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Pilgermission und des Wiederaufbaus Palästinas im 19. Jahrhundert* (Theologische Zeitschrift Sonderband 10, Basel 1981); Alex CARMEL, Wie es zu Conrad Schicks Sendung nach Jerusalem kam, in: *Zeitschrift des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins* (hereinafter: ZDPV) 99 (1983) 204–218; Alex CARMEL, Der Missionar Theodor Fliedner als Pionier deutscher Palästina-Arbeit, in: *Jahrbuch des Instituts für deutsche Geschichte 14* (1985) 191–220; Alex CARMEL, The German Protestant Community in Palestine, in: *Cathedra 45* (September 1987) 103–112 [Hebrew]; Alex CARMEL, C. F. Spittler and the Activities of the Pilgrims Mission in Jerusalem, in: Gad G. GILBAR (ed.), *Ottoman Palestine 1800–1914. Studies in Economic and Social History* (Leiden 1990) 255–286; Alex CARMEL, “The Peaceful Crusade.” Titus Tobler and “the Christian State,” in: Moshe ZIMMERMANN (ed.), *Germany and the Holy Land of Israel. A Cultural Encounter* (Jerusalem 2004) 11–32 [Hebrew].

<sup>12</sup> See also Yaron PERRY, Erik PETRY (eds.), *Das Erwachen Palästinas im 19. Jahrhundert. Alex Carmel zum 70. Geburtstag* (Judentum und Christentum 9, Stuttgart–Berlin–Köln 2001).

ity.<sup>13</sup> Another point that should be emphasized here is that Carmel published many of his works – though not all of them – in Hebrew as well as in German or English.

In the 1990s, Alex Carmel tutored two Israeli PhD students, this in addition to having earlier mentored the dissertation by Christine Schütz<sup>14</sup> and my work which will be discussed later. These students, Ejal Jakob Eisler and Yaron Perry, who worked with Carmel at the Gottlieb-Schumacher-Institute of the University of Haifa, helped him establish its archives, and they have studied and published within the field. Eisler conducted thorough research into the American-German settlers in Jaffa for his thesis. This was immensely expanded in his dissertation which, published in German, became the most important book concerning the German settlement in that city. He added a bilingual Hebrew-German study concerning Peter Martin Mezler, an important, though neglected, figure in nineteenth-century Jaffa.<sup>15</sup> Since 1998 he has been working and publishing in Germany. Among other projects, he participated, along with his tutor, in the editing and writing of the magnificent volume describing the German emperor's visit in 1898, which includes many rare illustrations. He also contributed a paper to the centenary-volume commemorating the establishment of the "Church of the Redeemer," and edited a collection of letters by a family of early nineteenth-century colonists in Palestine.<sup>16</sup> Eisler continues publishing extensively: the important *Bilddokumentation* that he published with others based on the archives of Schneller's Syrian Orphanage in Jerusalem should also be mentioned. Three further publications appeared in

<sup>13</sup> Alex CARMEL, *Russian Activity in Palestine in the Nineteenth Century*, in: Richard I. COHEN (ed.), *Vision and Conflict in the Holy Land* (Jerusalem–New York 1985) 45–77.

<sup>14</sup> Christine SCHÜTZ, *Preußen in Jerusalem (1800–1861). Karl Friedrich Schinkels Entwurf der Grabeskirche und die Jerusalempläne Friedrich Wilhelms IV. (Die Bauwerke und Kunstdenkmäler von Berlin Beiheft 19, Berlin 1988).*

<sup>15</sup> Jakob EISLER, *Der deutsche Beitrag zum Aufstieg Jaffas 1850–1914. Zur Geschichte Palästinas im 19. Jahrhundert* (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins 22, Wiesbaden 1997); Ejal Jakob EISLER, *Peter Martin Mezler (1824–1907). Ein christlicher Missionar im Heiligen Land* (Abhandlungen des Gottlieb-Schumacher-Lehrstuhls und Instituts 2, Haifa 1999).

<sup>16</sup> Alex CARMEL, Ejal Jakob EISLER, *Der Kaiser reist ins Heilige Land. Die Palästina-reise Wilhelms II. 1898* (Haifa–Stuttgart–Berlin–Köln 1999); E. Jakob EISLER, „Kirchler“ im Heiligen Land. Die evangelischen Gemeinden in den württembergischen Siedlungen Palästinas (1886–1914), in: Karl-Heinz RONECKER, Jens NIEPER, Thorsten NEUBERT-PREINE (eds.), *Dem Erlöser der Welt zur Ehre. Festschrift zum hundertjährigen Jubiläum der Einweihung der evangelischen Erlöserkirche in Jerusalem* (Leipzig 1998) 81–100; Jakob EISLER (ed.), *Deutsche Kolonisten im Heiligen Land. Die Familie John Steinbeck in Briefen aus Palästina und USA* (Stuttgart 2001).

2008: a volume describing the banker Johannes Frutiger, his life and works (written together with H. H. Frutiger), a study dedicated to the *Johanniterhospice*, and an edited volume with fifteen papers concerning the contributions of Germans to the modernization of Palestine.<sup>17</sup>

Yaron Perry, the student to whom Carmel was closest and who worked with him in the Schumacher Institute, studied the history of the Anglican missions in Palestine and published his dissertation as a book in Hebrew, which was then translated into English and German. This followed an earlier study of the “Mount Hope” settlement in Jaffa and a published paper dealing with the missionary hospital in Safed. His cooperation with Efraim Lev brought four papers and a book describing the development of modern medicine in Palestine.<sup>18</sup> Perry was also one of the two editors of the *Festschrift* issued in honor of Carmel’s seventieth birthday.<sup>19</sup>

In addition to Perry, there are some other Israeli scholars interested in the nineteenth-century medical history of the country, most of them physicians. The first and leading work was published in 1983 by Norbert Schwake, a German physician who lives in Israel.<sup>20</sup> In addition to him, one should mention

<sup>17</sup> Jakob EISLER, Norbert HAAG, Sabine HILTZ, Kultureller Wandel in Palästina im frühen 20. Jahrhundert. Eine Bilddokumentation. Zugleich ein Nachschlagewerk der deutschen Missionseinrichtungen und Siedlungen von ihrer Gründung bis zum Zweiten Weltkrieg (Epfendorf 2003); Hans Hermann FRUTIGER, Jakob EISLER, Johannes Frutiger (1836–1899). Ein Schweizer Bankier in Jerusalem (Köln–Weimar–Wien 2008); Jakob EISLER, Das Johanniterhospiz in Jerusalem (Reichertshausen 2008); Jakob EISLER (ed.), Deutsche in Palästina und ihr Anteil an der Modernisierung des Landes (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins 36, Wiesbaden 2008).

<sup>18</sup> Yaron PERRY, *Clouds and Wind without Rain. The London Mission in Nineteenth Century Palestine* (Tel Aviv 2001) [Hebrew]; Yaron PERRY, *British Mission to the Jews in Nineteenth-Century Palestine* (London 2003); Yaron PERRY, „Mount Hope“, deutsch-amerikanische Siedlung in Jaffa, 1850–1858 (Abhandlungen des Gottlieb-Schumacher-Lehrstuhls und Instituts 1, Haifa 1995); Yaron PERRY, *The British Hospital in Safed*, in: *Cathedra* 103 (2002) 69–84 [Hebrew]; Yaron PERRY, Efraim LEV, *Medical Activities of the London Jews Society in 19<sup>th</sup> Century Palestine*, in: *Medical History* 47/1 (2003) 67–88; Yaron PERRY, Efraim LEV, Ernest William Gurney Masterman. *British Physician and Scholar in the Holy Land*, in: *Palestine Exploration Quarterly* (hereinafter: PEQ) 138/2 (2006) 133–146; Yaron PERRY, Efraim LEV, *Modern Medicine in the Holy Land. Pioneering British Medical Services in Late Ottoman Palestine* (International Library of Colonial History 8, London–New York 2007).

<sup>19</sup> PERRY, PERRY (eds.), *Das Erwachen Palästinas*.

<sup>20</sup> Norbert SCHWAKE, *Die Entwicklung des Krankenhauswesens der Stadt Jerusalem vom Ende des 18. bis zum Beginn des 20. Jahrhunderts*, 2 Bde. (Studien zur Geschichte des Krankenhauswesens 8, Herzogenrath 1983); Norbert SCHWAKE [!], *The Austrian Hospital in Nazareth*, in: Marian WRBA (ed.), *Austrian Presence in the Holy Land in the 19th and Early 20th Century. Proceedings of the Symposium in the Austrian Hospice in Jerusalem on March 1–2, 1995* (Tel Aviv 1996) 81–97; Norbert SCHWAKE, *Das österreichische Hospital in Nazareth*,

here Shemuel Nissan, who, usually together with Petra Martin from Germany, dedicated many years of study to the history of the German childrens' hospital in Jerusalem.<sup>21</sup>

A glimpse at the lists of contributors to the above-mentioned *Festschriften*, the centenary volume of the visit of the German emperor and the one issued for Carmel, as well as at the lists of participants in workshops and conferences, mainly in Germany, and their published proceedings, would suggest that these were the only Israeli scholars of the European presence in Ottoman Palestine.<sup>22</sup> It is perhaps no exaggeration to argue that most European scholars working in this field do not know of the existence of a much longer list of Israeli scholars, who were absent from these volumes. The argument here reminds us of many other historical geographers, if not historians, who have contributed a wide range of studies to the broad theme of European activity in nineteenth-century Palestine. All of them studied under Yehoshua Ben-Arieh or under Ben-Ariehs' pupils.

Ben-Arieh turned from geography to historical geography quite early, dealing with "historical relics existing in the present landscape," that is, with the geography that lies behind the history.<sup>23</sup> This major change in his scholarly career came about during his first sabbatical leave, which he spent in England in 1964/65 and where he encountered Clifford Darby's *Historical Geography of England* and other works by this scholar.<sup>24</sup> Ben-Arieh chose to concentrate on nineteenth-century Palestine, which resulted in the publication of *The Rediscovery of the Holy Land in the Nineteenth Century* in 1970,<sup>25</sup> the same year in

---

in: Bernhard A. BÖHLER (ed.), *Mit Szepter und Pilgerstab. Österreichische Präsenz im Heiligen Land seit den Tagen Kaiser Franz Josephs* (Katalogbuch, Wien 2000) 281–291; Norbert SCHWAKE, *Deutsche Soldatengräber in Israel. Der Einsatz deutscher Soldaten an der Palästinafront im Ersten Weltkrieg und das Schicksal ihrer Grabstätten* (Münster 2008).

<sup>21</sup> Shemuel NISSAN, Petra MARTIN, *Das Marienstift-Kinderhospital in Jerusalem (1871–1899)*, in: *Historia Hospitalium* 20 (1995–1997) 162–194; Shemuel NISSAN, Petra MARTIN, *A Proposal to Establish a Childrens' Hospital in Nineteenth-Century Jerusalem. Dr. Max Sandreczky to the Grand Duke Frederick Francis II*, in: *Cathedra* 107 (2003) 167–182 [Hebrew].

<sup>22</sup> RONECKER, NIEPER, NEUBERT-PREINE (eds.), *Dem Erlöser der Welt*; PERRY, PETRY (eds.), *Das Erwachen Palästinas*; Almut NOTHNAGLE, Hans-Jürgen ABROMEIT, Frank FOERSTER (eds.), *Seht, wir gehen hinauf nach Jerusalem. Festschrift zum 150jährigen Jubiläum von Talitha Kumi und des Jerusalemvereins* (Leipzig 2001).

<sup>23</sup> Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Kavim le'derech mada'it* [Outlines for a scientific path], in: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *A Land Reflected in Its Past. Studies in Historical Geography of Israel*, edited by Ran AARONSOHN and Hagit LAVSKY (Jerusalem 2001) 1–31 [Hebrew].

<sup>24</sup> H. Clifford DARBY, *An Historical Geography of England before AD 1800* (Cambridge 1936).

<sup>25</sup> Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *The Rediscovery of the Holy Land in the Nineteenth Century* (Jerusalem 1970) [Hebrew]. The English version: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *The Rediscovery of the Holy Land in the Nineteenth Century* (Jerusalem–Detroit 1979, Jerusalem<sup>2</sup>1983).



which Carmel's dissertation appeared in print. Though probably coincidental, this fact led me to choose that year to begin this paper. Both publications were breakthroughs in the study of the Christian-European presence in Palestine during the nineteenth century, as well as in the use of traveler's accounts for its history. Thus, they may be termed "period-making studies."

In that same year, Ben-Arieh published a fundamental paper in which he developed his methodology concerning active "geographical" (versus "archaeological") historical geography, a distinction which he still applies in his publications and which he has imparted to his students.<sup>26</sup> He used this method in the two-volume monumental study of nineteenth-century Jerusalem entitled *A City Reflected in Its Times*, published in 1977 (Old City) and 1979 (New City). Both appeared in English translation as *Jerusalem in the Nineteenth Century* in the mid-1980s.<sup>27</sup> It can be assumed that everyone who has studied the history or geography of Jerusalem in the nineteenth century is aware of how much material both books hold for our theme.

On the other hand, it is difficult to find in Ben-Arieh's long list of publications studies which deal directly with the European penetration of Palestine.<sup>28</sup> Following his intensive study of travel literature, he devoted numerous publications to this genre, mainly establishing the different perceptions of the Holy Land by its European visitors.<sup>29</sup> He also presented some important basic

---

<sup>26</sup> Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, A Geographical Approach to Historical Geography, in: *Studies in the Geography of Israel* 7 (1970) 138–160 [Hebrew]. See Rehav RUBIN, Historical Geography in Israel – Ideas, Themes, and Perspectives, in: *Cathedra* 100 (2001) 340–360, here 340–342 [Hebrew].

<sup>27</sup> Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *A City Reflected in Its Times. Jerusalem in the Nineteenth Century: The Old City* (Jerusalem 1977) [Hebrew]; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *A City Reflected in Its Times: New Jerusalem – The Beginnings* (Jerusalem 1979) [Hebrew]. The English versions: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Jerusalem in the 19th Century*, vol. 1: *The Old City*, translated by G. Brand (Jerusalem–New York 1984); Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Jerusalem in the 19th Century*, vol. 2: *Emergence of the New City*, translated by M. Aumann and L. Harris (Jerusalem–New York 1986).

<sup>28</sup> Yehoshua Ben-Arieh, in: Yossi BEN-ARTZI, Israel BARTAL, Elchanan REINER (eds.), *Studies in Geography and History in Honour of Yehoshua Ben-Arieh* (Jerusalem 1999) [17]–[26] [Hebrew]. Probably the only exception is his paper: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Patterns of Christians' Activity and Depression in Nineteenth Century Jerusalem, in: *Journal of Historical Geography* 2 (1976) 49–69.

<sup>29</sup> As examples: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Perceptions and Images of The Land of Israel in the Writings of Nineteenth-Century Western Travelers, in: Shmuel ALMOG et al. (eds.), *Transition and Change in Modern Jewish History. Essays Presented in Honor of Shmuel Ettinger* (Jerusalem 1987) 89–114 [Hebrew]; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Ha'nof hayishuvi shel Eretz-Israel erev hahityashvut hatsionit [The Cultural Landscape of Eretz-Israel on the Eve of Zionist Settlement], in: Israel KOLATT (ed.), *The Ottoman Period, Part One* (Moshe LISSAK, Gabriel

research concerning the history of the geographical exploration of the Holy Land, a subject to which he has returned in recent years and in which his interest has shifted to the British Mandate period (1918–1948).<sup>30</sup> In addition, he co-edited with Moshe Davis the papers presented in the scholarly colloquiums entitled *Western Societies and the Holy Land*, which has yielded five collected volumes.<sup>31</sup>

Ben-Arieh was not only a pioneer scholar in this field; he also founded a school of Israeli historical-geographers whose members now teach in all Israeli universities and some academic colleges. Renowned throughout the country for his unique dedication to his students, he has encouraged many of them to study different aspects of Christian activity. Prominent in the “first generation” are Ruth Kark, Yossi Ben-Artzi, Rehav Rubin, Dov Gavish, Yossi Katz, and Zvi Shiloni, all of whom have dealt with the different aspects of the European penetration. Naftali Thalmann, Shaul Sapir, and Haim Goren belong to the “second generation.” Thalmann and Goren are the only ones of this list who have devoted their studies solely to Christian-European activity.

It would be almost impossible to give an adequate overview of Ruth Kark’s studies. She has looked at American activity and at the work of different European groups either by themselves or in connection with wider topics. One of her books treated Jaffa, another Jerusalem and its surroundings (the latter together with her student, Michal Oren-Nordheim).<sup>32</sup> As examples of her studies

---

COHEN [eds.], *The History of the Jewish Community in Eretz-Israel since 1882*, Jerusalem 1989) 75–141 [Hebrew]; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Characteristics of the Nineteenth-Century Historical-Geographical Literature on Eretz-Israel*, in: Yossi KATZ, Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Yehoshua KANIEL (eds.), *Historical-Geographical Studies in the Settlement of Eretz-Israel 2* (Jerusalem 1991) 13–27 [Hebrew].

<sup>30</sup> Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *The Geographical Exploration of the Holy Land*, in: PEQ 104 (1972) 81–92; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Pioneer Scientific Exploration in the Holy Land at the Beginning of the Nineteenth Century*, in: *Terrae Incognitae* 4 (1972) 95–110; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *The First Surveyed Maps of Jerusalem*, in: *Eretz-Israel. Archaeological, Historical and Geographical Studies* 11 (1973) (I. Dunayevsky Memorial Volume) 64–74 [Hebrew]; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Non-Jewish Institutions and the Research of Palestine during the British Mandate Period*, in: *Cathedra* 92 (1999) 135–172, 93 (1999) 111–142 [Hebrew].

<sup>31</sup> Moshe DAVIS, Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH (eds.), *Western Societies and the Holy Land (With Eyes toward Zion III*, New York–Westport–London 1991); Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Moshe DAVIES (eds.), *Jerusalem in the Mind of the Western World, 1800–1948 (With Eyes toward Zion V*, Westport, Connecticut–London 1997).

<sup>32</sup> Ruth KARK, *Jaffa – A City in Evolution 1799–1917* (Jerusalem 1984), and the English version: Ruth KARK, *Jaffa. A City in Evolution, 1799–1917*, translated by Gila Brand (Jerusalem 1990); Ruth KARK, Michal OREN-NORDHEIM, *Jerusalem and its Environs. Quarters, Neighborhoods, Villages 1800–1948* (Jerusalem 1995), and the English version: Ruth KARK, Mich-

that focus directly on American and European involvement, it is important to mention her paper “Millenarism and Agricultural Settlement,” which dealt with early experiments of American settlements in the Holy Land. Other examples include her study of the European influence on traditional patterns of landownership in Palestine, her books about the American consuls and the American-Swedish colony, and her paper concerning Swedish pietistic settlements.<sup>33</sup> Kark’s studies of Protestant missionary activity in Palestine, as well as of the introduction of modern technology,<sup>34</sup> led to a joint project and paper with the German historical geographer Dietrich Denecke, and Haim Goren.<sup>35</sup>

Yossi Ben-Artzi’s significant contribution to the study of the physical and cultural aspects of the Templer settlements is well known.<sup>36</sup> In recent years, he has also published papers on Johannes Zeller and Gottlieb Schumacher, two of the leading Europeans who resided in Galilee and their unique contributions to the area, as well as studies on other “European” topics.<sup>37</sup>

---

al OREN-NORDHEIM, *Jerusalem and its Environs. Quarters, Neighborhoods, Villages 1800–1948* (Jerusalem–Detroit 2001).

<sup>33</sup> Ruth KARK, *Millenarism and Agricultural Settlement in the Holy Land in the Nineteenth Century*, in: *Journal of Historical Geography* (hereinafter: JHG) 9/1 (1983) 47–62; Ruth KARK, *Changing Patterns of Landownership in Nineteenth-Century Palestine. The European Influence*, *ibid.* 10 (1984) 357–384; Ruth KARK, *American Consuls in the Holy Land 1832–1914* (Jerusalem–Detroit 1994); Helga DUDMAN, Ruth KARK, *The American Colony. Scenes from a Jerusalem Saga* (Jerusalem 1998); Ruth KARK, *Sweden and the Holy Land. Pietistic Communal Settlement*, in: JHG 22/1 (1996) 46–67.

<sup>34</sup> KARK, *Millenarism*; Ruth KARK, *The Contribution of Nineteenth Century Protestant Missionary Societies to Historical Cartography*, in: *Imago Mundi* 45 (1993) 112–119; Ruth KARK, *Transportation in Nineteenth-Century Palestine. Reintroduction of the Wheel*, in: Ruth KARK (ed.), *The Land That Became Israel. Studies in Historical Geography* (New Haven 1991) 57–76; Ruth KARK, *The Introduction of Modern Technology into the Holy Land (1800–1914 CE)*, in: Thomas E. LEVI (ed.), *The Archeology of Society in the Holy Land* (London 1995) 524–603; Ruth KARK, *Missionary Societies in the Holy Land in an International Context*, in: Jakob EISLER (ed.), *Deutsche in Palästina und ihr Anteil an der Modernisierung des Landes* (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins 36, Wiesbaden 2008) 14–29.

<sup>35</sup> Ruth KARK, Dietrich DENECKE, Haim GOREN, *The Impact of the German Missionary Enterprise in Palestine on Colonization and Technological Development, 1820–1914*, in: Martin TAMCKE, Michael MARTEN (eds.), *Christian Witness between Continuity and New Beginnings. Modern Historical Missions in the Middle East* (Studien zur Orientalischen Kirchengeschichte 39, Münster 2006) 145–176.

<sup>36</sup> Yossi BEN ARTZI, *From Germany to the Holy Land. Templer Settlement in Palestine* (Jerusalem 1996) [Hebrew]; Yossi BEN ARTZI, *The Physical Patterns of the German Templer Settlements and Its Role in the Landscape of Eretz-Israel (1869–1914)*, in: Yossi KATZ, Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Yehoshua KANIEL (eds.), *Historical-Geographical Studies in the Settlement of Eretz-Israel* 2 (Jerusalem 1991) 73–94 [Hebrew].

<sup>37</sup> Yossi BEN ARTZI, *Johannes Zeller – A Missionary to Nazareth and the Holy Land*, in: *Cathedra* 50 (December 1988) 73–97 [Hebrew]; Yossi BEN ARTZI, *Unbekannte Pläne und Land-*

Well-known for his studies of the historical maps of Jerusalem,<sup>38</sup> Rehav Rubin has published studies concerning the Greek-Orthodox community in Jerusalem, the missionary settlement in the village of Artas close to Solomon's Pools, and – together with Haim Goren – the introduction of modern agricultural technology into Palestine.<sup>39</sup> As an essential part of his map study, he has begun studying three-dimensional models and relief maps of Palestine, all of them produced by Europeans. Some of these, such as Conrad Schick, resided in Jerusalem.<sup>40</sup>

Dov Gavish's main interest lies in the history of cartography and photography of Palestine and the Middle East. In addition to his study of the surveying of Palestine in the years of the British Mandate, he has published numerous papers concerning nineteenth-century mapping, as well as European involvement in the area during World War I.<sup>41</sup>

---

karten von Gottlieb Schumacher, in: ZDPV 107 (1991) 176–192; Yossi BEN-ARTZI, The Map of the Carmelite-Templar Conflict over Mt. Carmel Lands, 1885, in: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Elchanan REINER (eds.), Studies in the History of Eretz Israel. Presented to Yehuda Ben Porat (Jerusalem 2003) 494–506 [Hebrew].

<sup>38</sup> Only some examples from an extremely long list: Rehav RUBIN, Jerusalem Through Maps & Views from the Byzantine Period to the 19<sup>th</sup> Century (Tel-Aviv 1987) [Hebrew]; Rehav RUBIN, Image and Reality. Jerusalem in Maps and Views (Jerusalem 1999); Rehav RUBIN, The Map of Jerusalem (1538) by Hermannus Borculus and its Copies. A Carto-Geneological Study, in: The Cartographic Journal 27 (June 1990) 31–39; Rehav RUBIN, Jerusalem in Braun and Hogenberg, Civitates, in: The Cartographic Journal 33/2 (December 1996) 119–129; Rehav RUBIN, From Pictorial to Scientific Maps of Jerusalem, in: Cathedra 75 (April 1995) 55–68 [Hebrew]; Rehav RUBIN, Stephan Illes and His 3d Model-Map of Jerusalem, in: The Cartographic Journal 44/1 (2007) 71–79.

<sup>39</sup> Rehav RUBIN, History of the Colonisation of Artas, in: Ely SCHILLER (ed.), Zev Vilnay's Jubilee Volume. Essays on the History, Archaeology and Lore of the Holy Land, Presented to Zev Vilnay (Jerusalem 1984) 325–330 [Hebrew]; Rehav RUBIN, Greek Orthodox Monasteries in the Old City of Jerusalem, in: Eretz Israel 17 (1984) (A. J. Brawer Memorial Volume) 109–116 [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, Rehav RUBIN, The Beginning of Modern Agriculture in Eretz Israel, in: Science 29/5–6 (September 1985) 181–187 [Hebrew].

<sup>40</sup> Haim GOREN, Rehav RUBIN, Conrad Schick's Models of Jerusalem and its Monuments, in: PEQ 128 (1996) 102–124; Rehav RUBIN, When Jerusalem was built in St. Louis. A Large Scale Model of Jerusalem in the Louisiana Purchase Exposition 1904, in: PEQ 132 (2000) 59–70; Rehav RUBIN, Relief Maps and Models in the Archives of the Palestine Exploration Fund in London, in: PEQ 138/1 (2006) 43–63.

<sup>41</sup> Dov GAVISH, Land and Map. The Survey of Palestine, 1920–1948 (Jerusalem 1991) [Hebrew]; Dov GAVISH, Air-Photographs by First World War Pilots in Eretz-Israel, in: Cathedra 7 (April 1978) 119–150; Dov GAVISH, An Account of an Unrealized Aerial Cadastral Survey in Palestine under the British Mandate, in: The Geographical Journal 153 (March 1987) 93–98; Dov GAVISH, Aerial Perspective of Past Landscapes, in: Ruth KARK (ed.), The Land That Became Israel. Studies in Historical Geography (New Haven–London–Jerusalem 1989) 308–319; Dov GAVISH, French Cartography of the Holy Land in the Nineteenth Century, in: PEQ

Zvi Shiloni, whose general interest concerns Jewish issues, studied French activity in Palestine even before Dominique Trimbur arrived on the scene and “conquered” the field. However, he published only one scientific paper on this theme, in which he discussed the history, activities, and personality of the mysterious but forgotten French Count Paul Amédée de Piellat, who probably contributed more than any other of his compatriots to the monumental French presence in Jerusalem.<sup>42</sup>

In 1980, Naftali Thalmann submitted his MA thesis in which he presented a general picture of German activity in Palestine.<sup>43</sup> His work was preceded by that of the late Shlomo Elan, a real pioneer in the study of German activity in the Holy Land. His thesis, dating from the 1970s and also mentored by Ben-Arieh, was published in German in 1984.<sup>44</sup> In 1991, Thalmann submitted his dissertation, which was the first thorough study of agriculture and farming in the Templer colonies. He demonstrated their crucial importance for the development of Palestine.<sup>45</sup> During these years, he finished other work, all of it concerning subjects of interest for us here.<sup>46</sup> Shaul Sapir’s thesis, dealing with the

---

126 (1994) 24–31; DOV GAVISH, Foreign Intelligence Maps. Offshoots of the 1:100,000 Topographic Map of Israel, in: *Imago Mundi* 48 (1996) 174–184.

<sup>42</sup> Zvi SHILONY, The Activities of Comte de Piellat in Palestine, in: *Cathedra* 72 (1994) 63–90 [Hebrew]; Zvi SHILONY, Un mécène catholique: le comte de Piellat et les communautés françaises de Terre sainte, in: Dominique TRIMBUR, Ran AARONSOHN (eds.), *De Bonaparte à Balfour. La France, l’Europe occidentale et la Palestine 1799–1917* (Paris 2001, 2008) 241–264, 256–279.

<sup>43</sup> Naftali THALMANN, Hashpa’at hagemem hagermani (lema’et hatemplerim) al hahitpachut hayishuvit shel Eretz-Israel bame’ah hayod-tet ve’ad lemilchemet ha’olam harishona [The Influence of the German Element (excluding the Templers) on the Rural Development of Eretz Israel in the Nineteenth Century and until World War I] (MA thesis, Jerusalem 1980) [Hebrew].

<sup>44</sup> Shlomo ELAN, *Deutsche in Jerusalem von der Mitte des 19. Jahrhunderts bis zum Ersten Weltkrieg* (Wertheim 1984).

<sup>45</sup> Naftali THALMANN, *The Character and Development of the Farm Economy in the Templer Colonies in Palestine 1869–1939* (Diss., Jerusalem 1991) [Hebrew].

<sup>46</sup> Naftali THALMANN, German Exploration Associations and Institutes in Nineteenth Century Palestine, in: *Cathedra* 19 (April 1981) 171–180 [Hebrew]; Naftali THALMANN, Introducing Modern Agriculture into Nineteenth-Century Palestine. The German Templers, in: Ruth KARK (ed.), *The Land that Became Israel. Studies in Historical Geography* (New Haven–London–Jerusalem 1989) 90–104; Naftali THALMANN, Fritz Keller – A Pioneer of Modern Agriculture in Eretz-Israel. The Man and his Work, in: Yossi BEN-ARTZI, Israel BARTAL, Elchanan REINER (eds.), *Studies in Geography and History in Honour of Yehoshua Ben-Arieh* (Jerusalem 1999) 333–351 [Hebrew]; Naftali THALMANN, Die deutschen württembergischen Siedler und der Wandel der Agrartechnologie in Palästina, in: Jakob EISLER (ed.), *Deutsche in Palästina und ihr Anteil an der Modernisierung des Landes* (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins 36, Wiesbaden 2008) 156–167.

contribution of the English missions to the development of Jerusalem, was presented in 1979. He has drawn on it in numerous published papers.<sup>47</sup>

As for my own work, until recently I concentrated all my attention on two, parallel themes drawn from my MA thesis, which dealt with the German Catholics in Palestine, and my PhD dissertation about German scientific study of the Holy Land.<sup>48</sup> The latter was followed by a book published in 1999 in Hebrew. Its German edition followed four years later.<sup>49</sup> Numerous studies have dealt with the many historical enterprises of various nations regarding the re-discovery and scientific exploration of the Holy Land. These papers deal with individual researchers as well as with organizations, and with private as well as state-sponsored innovations and projects.<sup>50</sup> Special attention has been paid

<sup>47</sup> Shaul SAPIR, *The Contribution of the Anglican Missionary Societies to the Development of Jerusalem toward the End of Ottoman Rule* (PhD Diss., Jerusalem 1979) [Hebrew]; Shaul SAPIR, *Historical Sources Relating to the Anglican Missionary Societies Active in Jerusalem and Palestine toward the End of Ottoman Rule (1800–1914)*, in: *Cathedra* 19 (1981) 155–170 [Hebrew]; Shaul SAPIR, *Bishop Blyth and His Jerusalem Legacy: St. John's College*, in: *Cathedra* 46 (1987) 45–64 [Hebrew]; Shaul SAPIR, *The Anglican Missionary Societies in Jerusalem. Activities and Impact*, in: Ruth KARK (ed.), *The Land that Became Israel. Studies in Historical Geography* (New Haven–London–Jerusalem 1989) 105–119.

<sup>48</sup> Haim GOREN, *German Catholic Activity in Palestine, 1838–1910* (MA Thesis, Jerusalem 1986) [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, *The German Contribution to the Study of 19th Century Palestine (1766–1877)* (PhD Diss., Jerusalem 1992) [Hebrew].

<sup>49</sup> Haim GOREN, "Go View the Land:" *German Study of Palestine in the Nineteenth Century* (Jerusalem 1999) [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, „Zieht hin und erforscht das Land“. *Die deutsche Palästinaforschung im 19. Jahrhundert* (Schriftenreihe des Instituts für deutsche Geschichte der Universität Tel Aviv 23, Göttingen 2003).

<sup>50</sup> Examples for papers: Haim GOREN, *Johannes Rudolf Roth: Ein Leben für die Palästinaforschung*, in: *Jahrbuch des Deutschen Evangelischen Instituts für Altertumswissenschaft des Heiligen Landes* 5 (1997) 22–44; Haim GOREN, *Scientific Organisations as Agents of Change. The Palestine Exploration Fund, the Deutsche Verein zur Erforschung Palästinas and Nineteenth-Century Palestine*, in: *JHG* 27/2 (2001) 153–165; Haim GOREN, *The Scholar Precedes the Diplomat. German Science in the Service of Political Involvement in Egypt and Palestine until 1870*, in: Haim GOREN (ed.), *Germany and the Middle East. Past, Present, and Future* (World Powers and the Middle East, Jerusalem 2002) 41–60; Haim GOREN, *How Low is the Lowest Point on Earth? The Story of Determining the Level of the Dead Sea*, in: Jacob D. MAOS, Moshe INBAR, Deborah F. SHMUELI (eds.), *Contemporary Israeli Geography* (Horizon in Geography 60–61, Haifa: Department of Geography and Environmental Studies, University of Haifa, 2004) 147–162; Haim GOREN, *Charles Gaillardot, Renan's Man-in-the-Field. Physician and Scholar*, in: M. ABITBOL (ed.), *France and the Middle East. Past, Present and Future* (World Powers and the Middle East, The Harry S. Truman Institute, Jerusalem: The Hebrew University Magnes Press, 2004) 99–124; Haim GOREN, "Undoubtedly, the best connoisseur of Jerusalem in our times." *Conrad Schick as Palästinawissenschaftler*, in: Ulrich HÜBNER (ed.), *Palaestina exploranda. Studien zur Erforschung Palästinas im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert anlässlich des 125jährigen Bestehens des Deutschen Vereins zur Erforschung Palästinas* (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins 34, Wiesbaden 2006) 105–128.

to the field of cartography and to the development of the modern mapping of Palestine as well as its neighboring countries.<sup>51</sup> A second book, concerning German Catholic activity within the general Catholic presence in nineteenth-century Palestine, has been published in Hebrew; the German-language version appeared in 2009.<sup>52</sup> Preceding it were a number of papers concerning this ethno-religious group and its unique involvement in the Holy Land during the nineteenth century.<sup>53</sup> In addition, there are numerous papers dealing with Templar, Austrian, and French activity.<sup>54</sup> Most of these papers were not pub-

<sup>51</sup> Haim GOREN, Heinrich Kiepert in the Holy Land, Spring 1870 – Sketches From an Exploration-Tour of an Historical Cartographer, in: Lothar ZÖGNER (ed.), *Antike Welten Neue Regionen*. Heinrich Kiepert 1818–1899 (Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz, Ausstellungskataloge, Neue Folge 33, Berlin 1999) 45–61; Haim GOREN, Carl Ritter's Contribution to Holy Land Research, in: Anne BUTTIMER, Stanley D. BRUNN, Ute WARDENGA (eds.), *Text and Image. Social Construction of Regional Knowledges (Beiträge zur Regionalen Geographie 49, Leipzig 1999)* 28–37; Haim GOREN, Pioneer Surveying and Mapping of the Galilee and the Hauran. The Map of the Sources of the Jordan River (1841) and the Map of the Ledja, in: *Cathedra* 96 (July 2000) 111–130 [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, Sacred, But Not Surveyed. Nineteenth-Century Surveys of Palestine, in: *Imago Mundi* 54 (2002) 87–110; Haim GOREN, "British Military Surveyors in Palestine and Syria, 1840–1841," International Cartographic Conference La Coruña 2005: Mapping Approaches into a Changing World [E\htm\pdf\oral\TEMA16\Session 5\HAIM GOREN.pdf]; Haim GOREN, Wissenschaftliche Landeskunde. Palästina-Deutsche als Forscher im Heiligen Land, in: Jakob EISLER (ed.), *Deutsche in Palästina und ihr Anteil an der Modernisierung des Landes (Abhandlungen des Deutschen Palästina-Vereins 36, Wiesbaden 2008)* 102–120; Haim GOREN, August Petermann and Palestine Cartography, in: Sebastian LENZ, Ferjan ORMELING (eds.), *Die Verräumlichung des Welt-Bildes. Petermanns Geographische Mitteilungen zwischen „explorativer Geographie“ und der „Vermessenheit“ europäischer Raumphantasien (Beiträge der Internationalen Konferenz auf Schloss Friedenstein Gotha, 9.–11. Oktober 2005, Friedenstein-Forschungen 2, Stuttgart 2008)* 75–87.

<sup>52</sup> Haim GOREN, "Real Catholics and Good Germans." The German Catholics and Palestine, 1838–1910 (The Richard Koebner Minerva Center for German History, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem 2005) [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, „Echt katholisch und gut deutsch“. Die deutschen Katholiken und Palästina 1838–1910 (Göttingen 2009).

<sup>53</sup> Haim GOREN, The German-Catholics: Pioneers of European Settlement on the Shores of the See of Galilee, in: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Yossi BEN-ARTZI, Haim GOREN (eds.), *Historical-Geographical Studies in the Settlement of Eretz Israel (Jerusalem 1987)* 45–58 [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, The German Catholic "Holy Sepulchre Society." Activities in Palestine, in: Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Moshe DAVIES (eds.), *Jerusalem in the Mind of the Western World, 1800–1948 (With Eyes toward Zion V, Westport, Connecticut–London 1997)* 155–172; Haim GOREN, Du "conflit des drapeaux" à la "contestation des hospices": l'Allemagne et la France catholiques en Palestine à la fin du XIXe siècle, in: Dominique TRIMBUR, Ran AARONSOHN (eds.), *De Bonaparte à Balfour. La France, l'Europe occidentale et la Palestine 1799–1917 (Paris 2001, 2008)* 325–344, 343–363.

<sup>54</sup> Haim GOREN, Erste Siedlungsversuche der deutschen Templer in der Jesreel-Ebene im 19. Jahrhundert, in: *Jahrbuch des Deutschen Evangelischen Instituts für Altertumswissenschaft des Heiligen Landes* 1 (1989) 100–130; Haim GOREN, Sources for Germany-Holy

lished in Hebrew, or, if so, only in translation of the English or German versions.

In recent years, I have shifted my interest to the scientific involvement of other countries as well, mainly Britain, and my next book tries to connect the scientific study of the Jordan Rift Valley, including the Dead Sea, with British interests and involvement in the Near East during the 1830s and 1840s.<sup>55</sup>

The Israeli study of the European involvement in Palestine, by historians as well as by historical geographers, has greatly declined in recent years. The younger generation of historical geographers, those doctoral and masters' students of Ben-Arieh and also, some of his first- and second-generation students, have moved into other fields and are only rarely involved in this topic. The best proof can be found in the volumes of the periodical *Cathedra*, as well as in two published collections, presented to Yehoshua Ben-Arieh (1999) and to Yehuda Ben-Porat (2003), and in Eisler's recently published collection *Deutsche in Palästina*.<sup>56</sup> Ben-Porat was the real founder of Yad Ben-Zvi as a leading institution for Eretz-Israel studies at the popular as well as the academic level. Only four out of 36 papers in Hebrew and six in English included in the first collection are dedicated to European activity. They were written by Robin Butlin (an English historical geographer), Naftali Thalmann, Nachum Gross (an economic historian), and myself.<sup>57</sup> The second collection contains 34 papers,

---

Land Studies in the Late Ottoman Period. German Libraries and Archives, in: Moshe DAVIS, Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH (eds.), *Western Societies and the Holy Land (With Eyes toward Zion III, New York–Westport–London 1991)* 170–178; Haim GOREN, *Early 20th Century Christian Institutions in Abu Ghosh*, in: *Cathedra* 62 (December 1991) 107–122 [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, *Catholic Austria and Jerusalem in the Nineteenth Century: The Beginnings*, in: Marian WRBA (ed.), *Austrian Presence in the Holy Land in the 19th and Early 20th Century. Proceedings of the Symposium in the Austrian Hospice in Jerusalem on March 1–2, 1995 (Tel Aviv 1996)* 7–24; KARK, DENECKE, GOREN, *The Impact of the German Missionary Enterprise*; Haim GOREN, *Debating the Jews of Palestine – German Discourses of Colonization, 1840–1883*, in: *Leipziger Beiträge zur jüdischen Geschichte und Kultur* 1 (2003) 217–238.

<sup>55</sup> Haim GOREN, *How Low is the Lower Point on Earth? The Story of Determining the Level of the Dead Sea*, in: Jacob D. MAOS, Moshe INBAR, Deborah F. SHMUELI (eds.), *Contemporary Israeli Geography (Horizon in Geography 60–61, Haifa 2004)* 147–162; Haim GOREN, *The Dead Sea: Science and British Interests in the Near East* (forthcoming, London).

<sup>56</sup> BEN-ARTZI, BARTAL, REINER, *Studies in Geography*; Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Elchanan REINER (eds.), *Studies in the History of Eretz Israel*. Presented to Yehuda Ben Porat (Jerusalem 2003) [Hebrew]; EISLER, *Deutsche in Palästina*.

<sup>57</sup> Robin A. BUTLIN, *English Perspective on the Historical Geography of the Holy Land*, 20\*–32\*; THALMANN, Fritz Keller; Nachum T. GROSS, *The Deutsche Palästina Bank, 1897–*



only three of which (by Yehoshua Ben-Arieh, Yossi Ben-Artzi, and Mordechai Eliav) can be included in our field.<sup>58</sup> Among the fifteen contributors to the third volume, one can find – again – the names of Ruth Kark, Haim Goren, Ejal Eisler, and Naftali Thalmann.<sup>59</sup>

This phenomenon may be explained in several ways. The broad basis for the study of Christian penetration was laid by the “founding fathers” in the 1970s and 1980s. Since that time, several factors have changed: first, today’s Israeli students of geography prefer environmental and planning topics and are less attracted to historical geography. Second, studies of “European” themes have been devoted more to specific issues that go deeper on the micro-level, such as certain groups, persons, movements, organizations, or institutions. Historical geography demands, *inter alia*, a good command of individual languages such as French, German, Italian, Russian, and Spanish, and access to various archives. Unfortunately, not many of today’s Israeli students possess such skills. There are some exceptions, such as a young PhD student in Jerusalem, whose thesis concerns “The Rebuilding of the Catholic Holy Places in the Holy Land during the 20<sup>th</sup> Century: Cultural, Geographical, and Political Aspects,” and who is fluent, *inter alia*, in Italian, French, and Russian. Another student, who immigrated to Israel from Russia and is studying Russian naval activity in the eastern Mediterranean in the late eighteenth century, has already published various papers together with his tutors, Rubín and Gavish.<sup>60</sup>

Another possible explanation for the declining interest in historical geography concerns the interdisciplinary approach. Those students who currently show an interest in European activity usually come from other disciplines and want to use their expertise on specific aspects within the field. For

---

1914. A Fragmentary Study, 385–407 [Hebrew]; Haim GOREN, Carl Ritter and the Historical-Geography of the Holy Land, 92–113 [Hebrew].

<sup>58</sup> Yehoshua BEN-ARIEH, Manners and Customs in Palestine as Perceived and Studied during the Nineteenth Century and until 1948, 452–493 [Hebrew]; BEN-ARTZI, The Map; Mordechai ELIAV, Zionism as Viewed by the German Consuls in Palestine towards the End of Ottoman Rule, 507–519.

<sup>59</sup> Ruth KARK, Missionary Societies; Haim GOREN, Wissenschaftliche Landeskunde; Jakob EISLER, Bilder aus dem Heiligen Land des württembergischen Photographen PAUL HOMMEL (1880–1957), 121–126; Naftali THALMANN, Die deutschen württembergischen Siedler.

<sup>60</sup> Masha HALEVI, The Rebuilding of the Catholic Holy Places in the Holy Land during the 20<sup>th</sup> Century. Cultural, Geographical, and Political Aspects (PhD Diss. in preparation); Masha HALEVI, Religion, Symbolism, and Politics. The Planning and Building of the Modern Church of the Annunciation in Nazareth, in: *Cathedra* 126 (December 2007) 83–102 [Hebrew]; Mitia FRUMIN, Rehav RUBIN, Dov GAVISH, A Russian Naval Officer’s Map of Haifa Bay (1772), in: *Imago Mundi* 54 (2000) 125–128; Mitia FRUMIN, Rehav RUBIN, Dov GAVISH, A Russian Map of Haifa Bay (1772), in: *Cathedra* 107 (2003) 155–166.

example, one student's interest in urban planning led to a thesis dealing with urban planning in the German colonies in and around Jaffa. Two architects similarly put their professional background to use in their dissertations. One studied Templar architecture, while the other is thoroughly investigating Schneller's institutions.<sup>61</sup> During the last decade, research students of the Department of Maritime Studies at the University of Haifa started to focus on relatively modern sunken ships, combining in their works the fields of underwater archaeology and historical geography. The best example is a student working on sunken ships from Napoleon's expedition and the 1832 and 1840 maritime battles of Acre.<sup>62</sup>

This survey makes no claim to completeness regarding such scholars and publications in Israel. It does, however, present a comprehensive list of mostly historical geographers who have contributed to the field. On the basis of this list, we may detect, beginning in the mid-1990s, a change in research interests dealing with European activity in nineteenth-century Palestine. Until then, Israeli scholars had devoted much of their attention to this topic and had formed a relatively large sector of the academic community involved in it. That does not mean that there were no non-Israeli scholars dealing with the subject. On the contrary, intensive studies were conducted abroad, mainly in Germany and the USA, but also by British, French, and Dutch scholars. Some of these were tutored by Arab scholars studying at European universities. Despite this, Israel-

---

<sup>61</sup> Sigal GAFNI, *The German Localities in Jaffa's Region, 1866–2002. A Geographic-Urban-Historical Perspective* (M.A. Thesis, Jerusalem 2002) [Hebrew]; Dan GOLDMAN, *The Residential Domestic Architecture of the Templers in Eretz-Israel* (PhD Diss., The Union Institute and University, Cincinnati, Ohio 2003); Danny GOLDMAN, *German Settlement in the Beit-Shean Valley between the World Wars*, in: *Cathedra* 129 (September 2008) 85–106 [Hebrew]; Gil GORDON, *The Development of an Historic Site in a City: the Syrian Orphanage (Schneller Compound) in Ottoman Jerusalem (1856–1918)* (M.A. Thesis, Haifa 1986) [Hebrew]; Gil GORDON, *The Influence of the "Syrian Orphanage in Jerusalem (Schneller) Association Mission" in the Holy Land during the Late Ottoman Period. A Study on the Mutual Relations between a Cultural Agent and its Clients* (PhD Diss., Haifa, in preparation) [Hebrew]; Gil GORDON, *From a Mission Station to a Neighborhood. The Development of the "Syrian Orphanage" (Schneller) Compound in Jerusalem in the Late Ottoman Period*, in: *Cathedra* 128 (2008) 73–100 [Hebrew].

<sup>62</sup> Deborah ZWICKEL, *The Akko Tower Wreck. Archaeological Findings and their Historical Context* (PhD Diss., Department of Maritime Studies, University of Haifa, forthcoming); Deborah CVIKEL, Yaakov KAHANOV, Haim GOREN, Elisabetha BOARETTO, Kurt RAVEH, *Napoleon Bonaparte's Adventure in Tantura Lagoon. Historical and Archaeological Evidence*, in: *Israel Exploration Journal* 58/2 (2008) 199–219; Deborah CVIKEL, Haim GOREN, *Where are Bonaparte's siege cannon? An episode in the Egyptian campaign*, in: *Mediterranean Historical Review* 23/2 (2008) 129–142.

lis produced not only a relative, but probably an absolute majority of the scholarly production here.

This has changed drastically, with today's Israeli scholars forming only a small part of this "scientific community." The field has been taken over by people coming from the European and American academic worlds. Their relative advantages, as pointed out above, are clear. There has also been a growing interest shown mainly – though not solely – by theologians or historically-minded and historically-trained clergy.

In conclusion, I should like to point out what I believe is the greatest deficiency of this contemporary and well-conducted research. It is common to most (though not all) of the concerned scholars and has led me to present this paper. Most of them are unaware of the Israeli work done in the field, especially that conducted by historical geographers. Alex Carmel is well-known, at least in Germany, and extensively cited, but many of the Israeli scholars mentioned above remain unknown. What are the reasons for this? The most obvious possibility, the language barrier, is only part of the answer. Many of the above-mentioned Israeli studies have been published solely or also in languages other than Hebrew. There must be other reasons which should be discussed, especially with those who have spent a longer period on the eastern shores of the Mediterranean. In new scholarship, I repeatedly come across facts and arguments with which I am acquainted from previous Israeli studies. Again generally speaking, most of the non-Israeli scholars are not generous in citing Israeli studies dealing with the European "competition, penetration, and presence"<sup>63</sup> in nineteenth-century Palestine.

Some European scholars have become acquainted with Israelis and their work while undertaking their field-studies in Israel. People such as Dominique Trimbur, Jürgen Krüger, Roland Löffler, and Markus Kirchhoff are very good proof of the fact that disconnection is not unavoidable, even with the existing language barrier. It should be added that Israeli scholars on their side often do not know much about the "overseas" studies in their field and that their lack of knowledge in languages other than English is also a big deficiency. The only way to overcome these problems and disjunctions is to form a scholarly body to collect the data, report periodically about pertinent new studies, and arrange meetings with involved and interested scholars.

---

<sup>63</sup> In the title of Alex Carmel's article, above, n. 9.

